Report of
the Victoria University of Wellington
Chair in e-Government
2010

Miriam Lips
Professor in e-Government

Sponsors:

Victoria University of Wellington Chair in E-Government Objectives

In accordance with the Memorandum of Understanding between Victoria University of Wellington and the Chair's sponsors, the objectives of the Chair are to:-

(i)   Provide thought leadership.

(ii)   Lead and undertake research based on an annually-updated research programme.

(iii)   Provide leadership and coordination for other academics working at Victoria University and other universities in New Zealand, as well as internationally, in the field of e-Government and related disciplines.

(iv)   Act as a first point of contact between external parties and academics working in e-Government and related disciplines at Victoria University and other universities in New Zealand and overseas.

(v)   Teach/contribute to teaching programmes in the Schools of Government and of Information Management at Victoria University that generate understanding of e-Government.

(vi)   Work with the Victoria University of Wellington Foundation to attract further external funding as appropriate for specific projects or research areas, in consultation with the leading sponsors.

(vii)   In regard to the proportion of time to be committed to the activities above, it is anticipated that activities outlined under (i) and (ii) will, on average, occupy at least 50% of the Chair's time.

Research projects

The following research projects were finalised in 2010:

Public Attitudes to the Sharing of Personal Information in the Course of Online Public Service Provision

Background

This research project was led by Professor Miriam Lips (Victoria University of Wellington) and conducted in an arranged partnership with Inland Revenue Department (IRD) and Colmar Brunton. The research was financially sponsored by IRD. A Project Advisory Group was established for this project, with representatives from IRD, Ministry of Social Development (MSD), State Services Commission (SSC), and the Office of the Privacy Commissioner (OPC). The timeline for this research was March 2010–end of August 2010.

Short overview of the research

Governments are exploring ways to develop new online forms of integrated public service provision to citizens. This new public service model would require an increased sharing of citizens' personal information between agencies in the back-office of online public service provision.

Expected benefits of this new e-service model are many and varied and include increased effectiveness of public service provision; increased efficiency and reduced costs; improved ease of contact between citizens and government; and improved monitoring to ensure compliance and equitable enforcement.

However, the collection, processing and sharing of personal information required to achieve this new e-service model touch upon a fundamental right of citizens: the right to privacy. Privacy is a multifaceted, ambiguous notion which means many things to many people. For instance, people from different cultures attach a different meaning to this concept and what is considered 'sensitive' personal information varies with context and within relationships. Furthermore, the meaning of privacy is changing under the possibilities opened up by new Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs), with younger generations, as digital 'natives', developing different perceptions of privacy compared to older generations.

So far however, there is not much empirical, in-depth knowledge available about what people's attitudes are towards information sharing in these new electronic public service relationships, and the implications for their privacy. What we know is based on surveys and through anecdotes presented in the media. In this

research project, a qualitative research approach was used to more deeply explore attitudes of New Zealanders towards information sharing and privacy in the course of electronic public service provision. The research focused on the following question:

What are attitudes of different members of the New Zealand general public towards the collection, management, and sharing of personal information in the course of online public service provision?

The research methods used were a literature review, semi-structured interviews, and focus groups with members of the New Zealand general public.

The empirical phase of the project was developed and conducted in partnership with Colmar Brunton. Ten focus group meetings were organised and conducted across New Zealand in May and June 2010, with each focus group involving six to eight participants in an in-depth collective discussion of about 2.5 hours. Participants were identified on the basis of the following selection criteria: age, gender, ethnicity, income, education level, geographic location, internet use, and e-government service use. Other selection criteria were individuals with an experience of online integrated public service provision (eg. tertiary students who have experience with online student loan service provision) and individuals who are dependent on public services (eg. benefit recipient, super-annuitant). In total, 63 individuals participated in the focus groups.

The research findings demonstrate that the majority of participants had a benign view of information sharing intentions and practice across the New Zealand public sector: participants generally had a high trust in the New Zealand government and its agencies, and thought that they are working in the best interests of citizens. However, exceptions were found among participants with a high dependency on social services, Mðori, Pasifika and self-employed participants. In general, research participants turned out to be privacy pragmatists: individuals who are prepared to provide personal information to organisations in return for enhancements of public service provision or other personal or collective benefits. However, participants were not unconcerned about their privacy and clearly pointed at the need for public service agencies to play privacy by the rules.

Furthermore, transparency about the use of personal information by government agencies was generally absent amongst the research participants. Participants provided their information to public sector agencies in order to get the service, but they usually did not know or understand how their information is processed

or used; why they need to fill in multiple forms with the same information; how and to what length their information is stored or kept; and who has access to their information, for instance. Similarly, research participants showed limited knowledge about the sharing- or non-sharing of information between agencies. A particular area of concern was the accuracy of personal information stored and processed by government agencies, and especially information used for categorising clients and determining their eligibility for services. This lack of transparency and perceived administrative incompetence led participants to feel uncomfortable about information sharing, coupled with the desire to have more control over personal information provided to public sector agencies. This particular response was stronger among those participants who were more distrustful of government agencies.

The full research report and an executive summary can be downloaded from http://e-government.vuw.ac.nz/summary_IRD.aspx

Strategic discussion programme: "Improving Information Sharing for Effective Social Outcomes"

Background

This high-level discussion programme involved a follow-up activity on the Emerging Issues Programme (EIP) project 'Improving Information Sharing for Effective Social Outcomes', and was financially sponsored by the Ministry of Social Development (MSD). Led by Professor Miriam Lips, the programme facilitated strategic discussions among senior public officials and representatives of NGOs about the changing nature of the wider social services environment that is leading to the need for change in existing information sharing arrangements. The aims of this programme were to disseminate and discuss the New Zealand-based empirical research findings from the EIP-research project and the research project 'Public Attitudes to the Sharing of Personal Information in the Course of Electronic Public Service Provision'; and to explore and discuss legal and policy solutions emerging from these research findings. Furthermore, participants were informed about the Law Commission's work on information sharing to date.

Short overview of the initiative

Increased cross-government information sharing is critical to the delivery of more effective and efficient social services to vulnerable individuals with complex needs. At the same time, this key requirement for achieving joined-up, integrated services to individuals with multiple service needs touches upon a citizen's

right to privacy and, with that, existing legal requirements to protect a citizen's personal information. This emerging tension between new citizen-centric forms of social service provision and a citizen's right to privacy is further complicated by the fact that the introduction and use of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) in public service environments are changing the informational foundations of public service relationships between government agencies and individual clients, raising new issues around the blurring of lines between public and private information. Another important aspect of the changing social services environment is the review of the Privacy Act 1993, including a review of current cross-agency information sharing provisions and public sector needs, currently being undertaken by the Law Commission.

Recent New Zealand-based empirical research into cross-agency information sharing practices focused on vulnerable individuals with multiple needs in the wider social sector, points at the lack of information-sharing between agencies with a public service mandate, and between agencies with a public service mandate and those agencies that are allowed to share information under Principle 11f of the Privacy Act 1993 (Lips, O'Neill & Eppel 2009). Furthermore, the research found strong boundaries, with strict protection by authorised personnel, around critical information to other agencies in overlapping areas of health and welfare, such as mental health-related information and child protection records. Other recently completed empirical research into the attitudes of New Zealanders to information sharing shows that people generally are permissive of cross-agency information sharing, provided that they see some personal benefit from it (eg. convenient service provision) and the use of information by public sector agencies is transparent to them (Lips, Eppel, Cunningham & Hopkins-Burns, 2010). Moreover, the research findings point out that individuals generally support information sharing between agencies with close or related mandates and overlapping responsibilities, referring to the social sector agencies Work & Income and Housing as an example.

The strategic discussions took place in two seminars, with 20 to 25 participants each, on 30 November 2010 and 1 December 2010. The seminars were held under Chatham House rule and were prepared on the basis of working papers. Paper presenters were Professor Miriam Lips (Victoria University), Dr Elizabeth Eppel (Victoria University), John Edwards (Barrister and Solicitor), and Professor John Burrows (Law Commission).

Visiting scholars

From February until April 2010, the Chair invited Professor Jens Hoff as a Visiting Professor at Victoria University of Wellington. Jens Hoff is Professor of Comparative Politics at the Department of Political Science at the University of Copenhagen, Denmark. His research focuses on the importance of IT for political institutions and processes as well as for political culture and identity, and on citizen and user participation in different policy areas. During the last 20 years, Jens has chaired numerous international and Danish research projects, among these the European research network Government and Democracy in the Information Age (COST Action A14). Professor Hoff is an Editorial Board Member of the journals Information Polity, Northern Lights, and the International Journal of E-Politics, and regularly does reviews for the Norwegian, British and US Research Councils. He has published numerous books and articles, including

❖ *Democratic Governance and New Technology. Routledge, 2000* (edited with Ivan Horrocks and Pieter Tops)

❖ *Digital Governance://Networked Societies—Creating Authority, Community and Identity in a Globalized World.* Samfundslitteratur/Nordicom, 2006 (edited with Hans Krause Hansen)

❖ "Virtual capital? Internet Competence and Political Participation in Denmark", *Politik*, Vol. 9, no.2, 2006

❖ "Election Campaigns on the Internet: How are Voters Affected?", *International Journal of E-Politics*, no.1, vol.1, 2010.

Professor Hoff delivered a public seminar at Victoria University on 17 March 2010, titled 'Why involve citizens in actions on climate change? The Danish CIDEA project and how it relates to climate change action programmes in New Zealand and Australia'. Professor Hoff's presentation can be accessed from: http://e-government.vuw.ac.nz/events/Jens_Hoff_Seminar.pdf

Research supervision and teaching

The Chair was the primary supervisor of the following PhD projects in 2010:

❖ PhD research project 'The Application of Complexity Theory to Public Policy Analysis' — Dr Elizabeth Eppel (Victoria University School of Government). Elizabeth successfully completed her PhD thesis titled 'The Contribution of Complexity Theory to Understanding and Explaining Policy Processes: A Study of Tertiary Education Policy Processes in New Zealand' in April 2010. The full thesis can be accessed from: http://researcharchive.vuw.ac.nz//handle/10063/1202

❖ PhD Research Project: 'E-Campaigning: An Empirical Study of the Utilisation of ICT for Election Campaigning in New Zealand'—Hugo Gong (Victoria University School of Information Management)

❖ PhD Research Project: 'E-Record Keeping Behaviours of New Zealand Government Employees'—Anita Rapson (Victoria University School of Government)

❖ PhD Research Project: 'The transition to tertiary education by visually impaired students: The role of online Communities of Practice'—Edgar Pacheco (Victoria University School of Information Management).

The Chair was the secondary supervisor of the following PhD project in 2010:

❖ PhD Research Project: 'Online and Multi-channel Service Quality in the New Zealand Public Sector'—Allan Sylvester (Victoria University School of Information Management).

Teaching

In Trimester 1,2010, the Chair coordinated and delivered an e-Government course jointly offered by the Victoria University School of Information Management (MMIM 580) and the School of Government (MMPM 507).

The Chair also provided several guest lectures in other Victoria University courses.

Conferences, seminars, workshops

❖ The Chair participated in the ANZSOG Interactive Teaching Workshop, Sydney, Australia, 11–12 February 2010.

❖ The Chair organised and hosted a public seminar 'Why involve citizens in actions on climate change? The Danish CIDEA project and how it relates to climate change action programmes in New Zealand and Australia' delivered by Visiting Professor Jens Hoff, University of Copenhagen, 17 March 2010.

❖ The Chair hosted a visiting Study Group of senior public officials from The Netherlands, and delivered a public seminar on the findings from the research project 'Improving information sharing for effective social outcomes', 22 March 2010.

❖ The Chair organised and hosted a public lecture 'Reducing the burden on business through e-Government solutions: a Netherlands and international perspective' delivered by Harm Jan van Burg, Ministry of Finance, The Netherlands, 20 April 2010. This public lecture was co-hosted by Jim Scully, ThinkPlace.

❖ The Chair organised and presented at a public seminar 'Improving information sharing for effective social outcomes', co-hosted with IPANZ, 20 May 2010.

❖ The Chair organised and hosted a public lecture 'The contribution of complexity theory to understanding and explaining policy processes', delivered by Dr Elizabeth Eppel, 9 June 2010.

❖ The Chair organised and co-hosted with Microsoft NZ a lecture presented by Zach Tumin, Associate Director of Programs in Technology, Networks and Governance, Ash Institute, Harvard University John F. Kennedy School of Government, 'Collaboration in a cross-boundary world: Keys to success', 28 June 2010.

❖ The Chair provided a lecture on e-Government in New Zealand to a delegation of public officials from Vietnam, the Ministry of Homeland, hosted by the Victoria University School of Government, 29 October 2010.

Keynote lectures, conference presentations

- ❖ The Chair presented a conference paper with Anita Rapson, titled 'Exploring Public Recordkeeping Behaviours in Wiki-Supported Public Consultation Activities in the New Zealand Public Sector', at the 43rd Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences (HICSS-43), Koloa, Hawaii, 5–8 January 2010.

- ❖ The Chair delivered an invited public lecture on 'Citizen-centric government in New Zealand' at the Oxford Internet Institute, University of Oxford, 29 March 2010.

- ❖ The Chair organised and convened a panel track 'Managing e-Government in Times of Crisis' at the 14th International Research Society for Public Management Conference, Berne, Switzerland, 6–9 April 2010. At this conference she also presented a conference paper with Rose O'Neill and Elizabeth Eppel, titled 'Cross-Agency Information Sharing for More Effective Social Outcomes in New Zealand'.

- ❖ The Chair delivered a keynote speech 'Designing 21st century government: The value of e-Government research' at the New Zealand Computer Science Research Student Conference, Victoria University of Wellington, 15 April 2010.

- ❖ The Chair delivered a keynote speech 'Achieving citizen-centric government in New Zealand: Experiences from the frontline', at the Welfare to Work Conference, Rotterdam, The Netherlands, 26–28 May 2010.

- ❖ The Chair delivered a keynote speech 'Public sector partnerships with academia: How to create win-win situations' at the IPANZ New Professionals Conference, 24 June 2010.

- ❖ The Chair contributed as an expert panellist at the 'NZ Open Government Event 2010' sponsored by Microsoft NZ, 28 June 2010.

- ❖ The Chair contributed as a Panel Chair at the 'The Policy Makers' Conference 2010', organised by Liquid Learning, Wellington, 17 August 2010.

Stakeholder engagement

In 2010, the Chair engaged with stakeholders in the following ways:

❖ Member of the Privacy Law Review Reference Committee

❖ Scientific Advisory Board Member of a study undertaken by the European Commission, titled 'Pan European Survey of Practices, Attitudes and Policy Preferences as Regards Personal Identity Data Management' ("eID Survey"). The eID Survey is the first systematic attempt to examine personal practices of identity data disclosure in EU27, by means of a large-scale survey. The survey will look at issues of privacy, trust, consent, redress and control in relation to identity data disclosure. The main aim of the study is to provide the European Commission with a comprehensive view of the digital identity landscape in Europe, from the point of view of its citizens. The study is conducted by the European Commission Joint Research Centre IPTS, in collaboration with and for the European Commission DG INFSO.

❖ Research Applications Reviewer for the European Science Foundation, the UK Economic and Social Research Council, and the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada.

❖ Reviewer for the Journals: Public Administration, Policy & Politics, Public Management Review and Information Polity.

In 2010, the Chair was an Editorial Board Member of the following Academic Journals:

❖ Information Polity, IOS Press (Associate Editor International)

❖ Information, Communication and Society, Routledge

❖ Policy & Internet, The Berkeley Electronic Press

Publications

Research reports

❖ Lips, A.M.B, E.A. Eppel, A. Cunningham & V. Hopkins-Burns (2010). *Public Attitudes to the Sharing of Personal Information in the Course of Online Public Service Provision*, Final Research Report, August 2010, Wellington: Victoria University of Wellington, available at http://e-government.vuw.ac.nz/summary_IRD.aspx

Academic journal articles

❖ Lips, A.M.B., R.R. O'Neill and E.A. Eppel (2011). Cross-Agency Collaboration in New Zealand: An Empirical Study of Information Sharing Practices, Enablers and Barriers in Managing for Shared Social Outcomes, *International Journal of Public Administration*, 34:4, pp.255–266

❖ Lips, A.M.B. (2010). Rethinking Citizen—Government Relationships in the Age of Digital Identity: Insights from Research Findings, *Information Polity,* IOS Press, Vol. 15, No.4, pp.273–289

Book chapters

❖ Lips, A.M.B., J.A. Taylor & J.Organ (2010). Identity Management in E-Government Service Provision: Towards New Modes of Government and Citizenship, in: P. G. Nixon, V.N. Koutrakou & R. Rawal (eds) *Understanding E-Government in Europe: Issues and Challenges*, Routledge, pp.151–168

Refereed conference proceedings

❖ Lips, A.M.B. & A. Rapson (2010), Exploring Public Recordkeeping Behaviours in Wiki-Supported Public Consultation Activities in the New Zealand Public Sector, Proceedings of the 43rd *Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences (HICSS-43)*, 10 pages, CD-Rom, IEEE Computer Society, January 2010

Plans for 2011

In 2010, the Chair started a research project on 'The use of new media in managing natural disasters', which she aims to finalise in the second half of 2011. As there is not much theory available on the role of new media in information sharing and collaborative action in managing natural disasters, this research activity takes an inductive, qualitative research approach and will involve three streams of work.

Firstly, experiences around the recent Christchurch earthquakes offer New Zealand-based opportunities for an in-depth, empirical exploration of the role of new media in information sharing and collaborative action between government agencies, NGOs, businesses and/or members of the general public in responding to a major natural disaster. Secondly, an international web-based study will be conducted to explore experiences with ICT-enabled forms of collaboration and information sharing in managing a variety of major natural disasters, such as Hurricane Katrina, the Haiti Earthquake, Chile Earthquake, and more recently the Queensland floods and Cyclone Yasi. And a third stream of work will be focused on what could be learned from the research findings.

The Chair is working on a research monograph titled 'The Digital Citizen. New Directions for Citizen-Centric Government and Democracy', to be published by IB Tauris, London, in the second half of 2011.

The Chair will undertake research, education and dissemination activities in the field of e-democracy/e-engagement, focused at the design and development of the People's Panel, a large-scale online engagement initiative led by Auckland City Council.

The Chair plans to do a study on 'E-campaigning by political parties in the 2011 New Zealand General Election'. This activity will be a follow-up study on the project 'The use of new media by political parties in the 2008 national election', conducted with Hugo Gong from 2008 until 2009. Similar to the first study on e-campaigning in New Zealand, this project will empirically explore why, how, and to what extent, political parties use new media during the 2011 New Zealand general election. Furthermore, conducting a similar study on e-campaigning in the 2011 general election provides an opportunity for exploring longitudinal developments in this field in New Zealand. The study will be conducted on the basis of a literature review, website analysis and semi-structured interviews with representatives of political parties and explore e-campaigning activities from the announcement of the 2011 election date by Prime Minister John Key on 2 February 2011, until the day of the general election on 26 November 2011. The 2009 research report 'The use of new media by political parties in the 2008 national

election' can be downloaded from: http://e-government.vuw.ac.nz/research_projects_2009/eCampaigning_NZ_2008.pdf

The Chair will continue to supervise four to five PhD students and will be coordinating and teaching the MMPM 507 / MMIM 580 e-Government Course in Trimester 1, 2011. She will also offer a two-day Short Executive Course on 'Using social media for effective public engagement' through Victoria University's Centre for Lifelong Learning, with sessions to be held in Wellington (June/July 2011) and Auckland.

The Chair will be hosting a public seminar at Victoria University on 24 May 2011, where she will present the findings of the research project 'Public Attitudes to the Sharing of Personal Information in the Course of Online Public Service Provision'.

The Chair will be convening a panel track on 'E-Government, Public Sector Reform and Innovation' at the 15th International Research Society for Public Management Annual Conference, 11-13 April 2011, Dublin. She also will present a paper at this conference, entitled 'Attitudes of New Zealanders to Information Sharing and Privacy in the Course of Online Public Service Provision' (with Elizabeth Eppel and Amanda Cunningham).

The Chair has been invited to deliver a public lecture at the Oxford Internet Institute, University of Oxford, 15 April 2011.

From 10 May until 12 May 2011, the Chair will deliver two ANZSOG seminars on 'Cross-government information sharing in New Zealand: experiences from the frontline' to senior public officials in Auckland and Wellington. She also will contribute to a panel discussion at an ANZSOG seminar on 'The Future of Joined-up Public Services', 24 March 2011.

Together with the Department of Internal Affairs, the Chair will be organising a second Conference on 'Managing Citizen Identity Information in New Zealand', scheduled for the 23rd and 24th of April 2012 in Wellington. This Conference will have a similar format to the successful 2008 Identity Conference. For further information and presentations delivered at the 2008 Identity Conference please visit the following URL: http://www.identityconference.victoria.ac.nz/

Further activities of the Chair in 2011 include an invitation to speak at the '2011 New Zealand CIO Summit in Auckland', 27–28 June 2011, an invitation as guest speaker at the inaugural 'IT Women in Leadership' event, and the organisation and chairing, with Dr Ramon Gil-Garcia and Dr Maddalena Sorrentino, of the HICSS-45 E-Government Minitrack 'Transformational Government: Strategy, Management, Organization, and Users', January 2012, Hawaii.