

On the Record:

An Introduction to Aotearoa New Zealand's Chinese-language Media.



September 2023

Caleb Hoyle

Cover Image: © *NZ Chinese Growers Journal*, *NZ Chinese Weekly News*.

ISBN 978-1-99-115303-3

Published by the New Zealand Contemporary China Research Centre | Kōmaru Kura
Te Herenga Waka—Victoria University of Wellington,
Wellington, New Zealand

2023 © New Zealand Contemporary China Research Centre

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	1
Introduction	4
History of Chinese-language Media in New Zealand	6
Present-Day Media Characteristics.....	13
Roles of the Chinese-language Media	21
Issues of Quality and Independence	25
Recommendations	35
References	37
Appendix: Notable Active Outlets.....	48
<i>Chinese Herald</i> (新西兰中文先驱)	48
<i>Skykiwi</i> (天维网).....	50
<i>Mandarin Pages</i> (华页)	53
<i>Asia-Pacific Times</i> (中新时报)	54
<i>Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper</i> (怀卡托周报).....	55
<i>Home Voice</i> (乡音)	56
<i>New Zealand Messenger</i> (新西兰信报).....	57
<i>Channel 33</i>	58
<i>TV 28</i>	59
<i>Chinese Voice</i> (华人之声广播电台).....	60
<i>Love FM</i> (新西兰交通音乐广播)	60
<i>Radio Chinese</i> (新西兰中文广播电台)	61
<i>Go Kiwi</i> (发现新西兰).....	61
About the Author	63
About the Centre	63

Executive Summary

Aotearoa New Zealand's Chinese-language media are important sources of information for many people. In recent years, some outlets have faced public scrutiny for censoring topics that may reflect negatively on the People's Republic of China (PRC) and for their ties to the PRC party-state. Despite this widespread but intermittent attention, local Chinese-language media are still poorly understood outside of the communities that they serve. This report is intended to contribute to a general understanding of New Zealand's Chinese-language media.

The early development of New Zealand's Chinese-language media was heavily constrained by a series of racist and exclusionary policies enacted by New Zealand governments to limit Chinese migration. In 1921, more than half a century after the 1866 arrival of the first organised group of Chinese migrants in New Zealand, the country's first formal Chinese-language newspaper, the *Man Sing Times* (民声报), was established by the Wellington branch of the Kuomintang (国民党). The *Man Sing Times* was followed by several important Chinese-language publications that played influential roles in the lives of New Zealand's Chinese communities. However, by the mid-1960s, New Zealand's Chinese population was largely local-born and increasingly without the language skills to sustain domestic Chinese-language publications. In 1972, New Zealand's Chinese-language media entered an extended period of dormancy.

Following the reform of New Zealand's immigration policy in the late 1980s, and a series of events in the mainland PRC, Hong Kong and Taiwan that stimulated demand for migration to New Zealand, New Zealand's Chinese population grew sharply. This provided the country once again with a population that was capable of sustaining local Chinese-language media. These demographic changes, and a series of technological advancements, helped to facilitate a mushrooming of local Chinese-language media outlets. Migrants from the mainland PRC, Hong Kong and Taiwan each brought unique qualities to local Chinese-language media, providing New Zealand, albeit only temporarily, with Chinese-language content that was linguistically diverse and varied in how it presented the politics of the mainland PRC, Hong Kong and Taiwan.

At present, New Zealand's Chinese-language media consists of a vibrant range of print, radio, television, online and social media outlets. Auckland, home to the majority of New Zealand's Chinese population, is the epicentre of both Chinese-language media production and consumption. High levels of migration, from the mainland PRC in particular, have

continued to profoundly shape local Chinese-language media and provided outlets with growing audiences and enhanced relevance. Recent mainland migrants' prominence as media producers and consumers can be seen in the now widespread use of simplified Chinese characters by outlets, the emergence of PRC social media platform WeChat as a key content distribution channel, and a decrease in the amount of content available in languages other than Mandarin. Chinese-language media outlets, which are primarily small to medium-sized businesses, operate in a laissez-faire environment, and only very occasionally receive direct funding from the New Zealand government. Funding for public broadcaster *Radio New Zealand*, announced in late 2022, to begin producing Chinese-language content is likely to bring useful diversity to a Chinese-language media landscape that despite its vibrancy, only provides narrow coverage of certain issues.

Local Chinese-language media are a valuable part of New Zealand's information environment. As media primarily used by recent migrants, they are important sources of information about understanding and navigating life in New Zealand. Because migrants can vote after one year of living in New Zealand on a permanent visa, Chinese-language news outlets' coverage of New Zealand politics is especially vital. They also connect Chinese people in New Zealand with one another and celebrate Chinese communities and cultures. They provide connections to the PRC and Chinese diaspora around the world and supply New Zealand-related content to PRC media outlets.

Despite their importance, the content produced by local Chinese-language media is often of low journalistic quality. Outlets operate with severe resource constraints and have very limited newsgathering capabilities. Their domestic news is heavily reliant on translations of content from New Zealand's mainstream English-language media. This can result in a lack of contextual information being provided to recent migrants, many of whom may benefit from such information.

Outlets deviate most significantly from the norms that media are expected to adhere to in liberal democracies, such as balance and fairness, when they cover topics related to the PRC party-state. When stories that touch on these issues are translated from English-language sources, outlets are often careful to exclude information that may reflect negatively on the PRC party-state, even if it constitutes a significant portion of the original article. More commonly, however, PRC-related content is sourced from party-state and party-state-controlled media. This is facilitated by widespread content-sharing agreements with party-state news organisations and attendance at forums and training seminars for 'overseas Chinese-language media' (海外华文媒体) in the PRC. The use of WeChat, a platform that is

subject to PRC censorship outside of the PRC's borders, and the registration of most outlets' WeChat official accounts (公众号) to PRC companies, also contribute to this. Further, the owners of several outlets are members of organisations aligned with the PRC party-state, and representatives of some major outlets have publicly expressed support for Chinese-language media from outside of the PRC playing a role in the promotion of pro-party-state discourses. Concerns have also been raised about other methods through which New Zealand media outlets may be influenced to publish and broadcast content that aligns with the official positions of the PRC party-state. Given these issues, it is concerning that New Zealand's media regulatory system is ill-equipped to engage with local Chinese-language media and that these media have only limited engagement with the media regulatory system.

New Zealand's Chinese-language media are simultaneously highly valuable components of New Zealand's media environment and providers of strikingly problematic coverage of certain issues. Because of this, efforts should be made to better understand local Chinese-language media and to improve the journalistic quality of the content that they provide. Measures should be undertaken to make outlets more accountable, transparent and diverse.

Introduction

Chinese-language media in many countries play important roles in the lives of those who, often for reasons of linguistic preference or necessity, consume their content. In Aotearoa New Zealand, which has a large Chinese population and extends voting rights to migrants who have lived there on a permanent visa for more than one year,¹ these media are particularly vital sources of information. Despite this, New Zealand's Chinese-language media are generally poorly understood and, as has been the case for much of their long history,² have received little attention outside of the communities that they serve.

In recent years, however, this has started to change. As the People's Republic of China's (PRC) engagement with the world and the media that serve the Chinese diaspora has become more assertive, local Chinese-language media have begun to attract more widespread attention. Most notably, concerns have been raised, in academia, New Zealand's mainstream media, and even its parliament, about the independence, or otherwise, of the country's Chinese-language media from the PRC party-state.³

This report aims to contribute to the understanding of New Zealand's Chinese-language media. It begins with a brief outline of the history of Chinese-language media in New Zealand, from the Kuomintang (国民党) newspapers of the 1920s to the multiplatform outlets of the early 21st century. It then describes the most salient characteristics of present-

¹ "Are You Eligible to Enrol and Vote?," Electoral Commission, n.d., <https://vote.nz/enrolling/get-ready-to-enrol/are-you-eligible-to-enrol-and-vote/?lang=en-NZ>; "2018 Census Ethnic Group Summaries - Ethnicity, Culture and Identity," ed. Stats NZ (2020). <https://www.stats.govt.nz/tools/2018-census-ethnic-group-summaries>.

² Aotearoa New Zealand's first formal Chinese-language newspaper was the *Man Sing Times* (民声报), founded by the Wellington branch of the Kuomintang (国民党) in 1921.

³ Anne-Marie Brady, *Magic Weapons: China's Political Influence Activities under Xi Jinping* (The Wilson Center, 2017), <https://www.wilsoncenter.org/article/magic-weapons-chinas-political-influence-activities-under-xi-jinping>; Anne-Marie Brady, "Magic Weapons and Foreign Interference in New Zealand: How It Started, How It's Going," (2021); Matt Nippert, "Police Looked at Letter Claiming Widespread Censorship of Chinese Media in NZ: Anne-Marie Brady," *The New Zealand Herald* 2019, https://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/police-looked-at-letter-claiming-widespread-censorship-of-chinese-media-in-nz-anne-marie-brady/2PU45BJLUCDDSCMWLSRLVF5EQI/?c_id=1&objectid=12192360; Laura Walters, "Chinese NZ Herald under Chinese State 'Control' - Experts," *Newsroom* 2019, <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/chinese-nz-herald-under-supervision-and-control-of-chinese-state>; Henry Cooke and Laura Walters, "Chinese Version of NZ Herald Edited Translated Stories to Be More China-Friendly," *Stuff* 2019, <https://www.stuff.co.nz/national/politics/109908932/chinese-version-of-nz-herald-edited-translated-stories-to-be-more-chinafriendly>; Thomas Coughlan and Laura Walters, "Chinese NZ Herald Retracts Misleading Article," *Newsroom* 2019, <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/2019/06/17/636037/chinese-nz-herald-retracts-misleading-article>; Emanuel Stoakes and Sam Sachdeva, "Concern over 'Censorship' Rules of NZ-Chinese News Site," *Newsroom*, 22/9/2021, <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/concern-over-censorship-rules-of-nz-chinese-news-site>; Steve Kilgallon, "The Message Board Ban Going All the Way to the Human Rights Tribunal," *Stuff*, 2/12/2022, <https://www.stuff.co.nz/national/130481301/the-message-board-ban-going-all-the-way-to-the-human-rights-tribunal>; "Question No. 5—Broadcasting and Media," New Zealand Parliament, 2021.

day media outlets, including their concentration in Auckland, the New Zealand city with the largest Chinese population; their widespread use of WeChat and simplified Chinese characters; and their operation as small and medium-sized businesses driven by commercial imperatives that seldom receive funding from the New Zealand government. Next, it explores the roles that local Chinese-language media play, such as aiding settlement and engagement with New Zealand politics, providing connections to Chinese communities around the world, and linking audiences to the PRC. Penultimately, it examines problems of journalistic quality, the narrow range of views on the PRC party-state that outlets publish and broadcast, outlets' widespread participation in initiatives and use of technology that encourage this, and the disconnect between New Zealand's Chinese-language media and New Zealand's media regulatory system. Lastly, it provides recommendations for areas of future research and suggestions for how outlets can be made more transparent, accountable and supported to produce higher-quality journalism.

History of Chinese-language Media in New Zealand

From the 1866 arrival of the first organised group of Chinese migrants,⁴ twelve miners invited by the Dunedin Chamber of Commerce to work the Otago goldfields,⁵ it took more than half a century for New Zealand's first formal Chinese-language newspaper to be established. For much of this time, New Zealand's small Chinese population was scattered, largely illiterate and made up of sojourners, features that were barriers to the development of local Chinese-language publications.⁶ These characteristics were heavily influenced by a series of racist and exclusionary immigration policies, beginning with the 1881 Chinese Immigrants Act, aimed at limiting the size of New Zealand's Chinese population.⁷

By the beginning of the 20th century, with the goldfields depleted, many Chinese moved to urban centres in search of new occupations.⁸ This urbanisation, coupled with a new generation of better-educated Chinese New Zealanders, saw the development of a more viable audience for Chinese-language print media, despite restrictions on Chinese immigration causing the Chinese population to contract.⁹ In July 1921, New Zealand's first Chinese-language newspaper, the *Man Sing Times* (民声报), was established by the Wellington branch of the Kuomintang (国民党). This newspaper, which operated until October 1922 before it succumbed to a lack of funds,¹⁰ largely focused on China and promoting the Kuomintang's cause among Chinese in New Zealand.¹¹ The *Man Sing Times* was followed by a second Kuomintang newspaper, the *Min Hok Times* (民铎月刊), published by the party's Auckland branch in 1930. Only a single issue of the *Min Hok Times* is recorded as having been published.¹²

⁴ The first recorded Chinese settler in New Zealand was Appo Hocton (黄鹤庭), who arrived in Nelson in 1842. Manying Ip, "Chinese New Zealanders: Old Settlers and New Immigrants," in *Immigration and National Identity in New Zealand: One People, Two Peoples, Many Peoples?*, ed. Stuart William Greif (Palmerston North, New Zealand: Dunmore Press, 1995).

⁵ Charles Sedgwick, "Persistence, Change and Innovation: The Social Organization of the New Zealand Chinese 1866-1976," *Journal of Comparative Family Studies* 16, no. 2 (1985); Ip, "Chinese New Zealanders: Old Settlers and New Immigrants."

⁶ James Ng, "Chinese," in *Book and Print in New Zealand: A Guide to Print Culture in Aotearoa*, ed. Penny Griffith, Ross Harvey, and Keith Maslen (Wellington, New Zealand: Victoria University Press, 1997).

⁷ Manying Ip, "Chinese Immigration to Australia and New Zealand: Government Policies and Race Relations," in *Routledge Handbook of the Chinese Diaspora*, ed. Chee-Beng Tan (London, United Kingdom: Taylor & Francis Group, 2012).

⁸ Ip, "Chinese New Zealanders: Old Settlers and New Immigrants."

⁹ Phoebe H. Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand* (Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill, 2013); Ip, "Chinese Immigration to Australia and New Zealand: Government Policies and Race Relations."

¹⁰ Nigel Murphy, "Chinese," in *Book and Print in New Zealand: A Guide to Print Culture in Aotearoa*, ed. Penny Griffith, Ross Harvey, and Keith Maslen (Wellington, New Zealand: Victoria University Press, 1997).

¹¹ Murphy, "Chinese."; Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

¹² Murphy, "Chinese."

The outbreak of the Second Sino-Japanese War (1937-1945) brought fresh energy and common cause to the Chinese-language press. In 1937, the New Zealand Chinese Association (纽西兰华联总会) started the Wellington-based *New Zealand Chinese Weekly News* (中国大事周刊); and the following year its Auckland branch established the *Q-Sing Times* (屋仑侨声).¹³ Both newspapers focused on covering the war and played a vital role in raising funds to support the war effort.¹⁴ Their focus on China was such that pages for 'Domestic News' (本国新闻) carried news of China rather than New Zealand.¹⁵ However, despite being firmly oriented towards China, this flurry of newspaper activity, and the nationally available *Chinese Weekly News* in particular, enabled Chinese communities around New Zealand to gain greater awareness of one another.¹⁶ Both papers ceased publication in 1946.¹⁷

The next major Chinese-language publication, the *New Zealand Chinese Growers' Monthly Journal* (侨农月刊), was established in 1949. It was published, with the encouragement of Labour Prime Minister Peter Fraser, by the Dominion Federation of New Zealand Chinese Commercial Growers (新西兰华侨农业会).¹⁸ The *Journal* was intended to bolster the unity of Chinese market gardeners (a major occupation among New Zealand's Chinese population at the time),¹⁹ disseminate information on market gardening and growing, and improve the living standards of Chinese market gardeners, while also spreading Chinese culture.²⁰

The *Journal* was published at a time when the Chinese community in New Zealand was becoming more settled — a process aided by a government decision to allow wives and children of Chinese men to come to New Zealand as war refugees and later to stay as permanent residents.²¹ Reflecting this, and in contrast to previous Chinese-language publications and their overwhelming focus on China, the *Journal* provided significant coverage of New Zealand and the local Chinese population, becoming the de facto 'voice of

¹³ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*; Murphy, "Chinese."

¹⁴ Manying Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?," in *Media and the Chinese Diaspora*, ed. Wanning Sun (Abingdon, United Kingdom: Routledge, 2006); Charles Sedgwick, "The Politics of Survival: A Social History of the Chinese in New Zealand" (PhD University of Canterbury, 1982).

¹⁵ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."

¹⁶ Sedgwick, "The Politics of Survival: A Social History of the Chinese in New Zealand."

¹⁷ Murphy, "Chinese."

¹⁸ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."

¹⁹ Joanna Boileau, *Chinese Market Gardening in Australia and New Zealand Gardens of Prosperity*, 1st ed. 2017. ed., Palgrave Studies in the History of Science and Technology, (Cham, Switzerland: Springer International Publishing, 2017). Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."

²⁰ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."

²¹ Ip, "Chinese New Zealanders: Old Settlers and New Immigrants."; Murphy, "Chinese."

the community'.²² The divergence with previous Chinese-language publications deepened further when, in 1961, the *Journal* complied with a forceful suggestion from the New Zealand government that, in the name of assimilation, it cease publishing overseas news. Faced with financial difficulties, the *Journal* closed in August 1972.²³

Over time, government efforts to promote assimilation and the continuation of restrictive immigration policies meant that the Chinese population in New Zealand became increasingly local-born — by 1966, more than three-quarters of ethnic Chinese were born in New Zealand²⁴ — and lacked the language skills to support Chinese-language publications.²⁵ As a consequence, New Zealand's Chinese-language media entered a period of dormancy that lasted from 1972 until 1989.²⁶

In 1987, New Zealand reformed its immigration policy and began selecting migrants based on qualities such as age, education and assets rather than their nation of origin or ethnicity.²⁷ This policy change, coupled with a series of events in Hong Kong, Taiwan and the mainland PRC — the 1984 Sino-British Joint Declaration on Hong Kong, the 1987 lifting of martial law in Taiwan, the suppression of the Tiananmen Square protests in 1989, and policy changes that made it easier for mainland Chinese to go overseas — began to stimulate Chinese migration to New Zealand. This provided New Zealand with a population capable of reviving and once again sustaining local Chinese-language media.²⁸

From the late 1980s until the early 1990s, people from Hong Kong formed the largest group of new Chinese migrants to New Zealand.²⁹ This period saw the return of Chinese-language media in New Zealand with the establishment of the *Sing-Tao Weekly* (星島周报),³⁰ a local

²² Sedgwick, "The Politics of Survival: A Social History of the Chinese in New Zealand," 618; Murphy, "Chinese."

²³ Sedgwick, "The Politics of Survival: A Social History of the Chinese in New Zealand."; Murphy, "Chinese."; Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

²⁴ Ip, "Chinese New Zealanders: Old Settlers and New Immigrants."

²⁵ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."

²⁶ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."; Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

²⁷ Ip, "Chinese Immigration to Australia and New Zealand: Government Policies and Race Relations."

²⁸ Elsie Ho, Manying Ip, and Richard Bedford, "Transnational Hong Kong Chinese Families in the 1990s," *New Zealand Journal of Geography* 111, no. 1 (2001); Manying Ip, "Seeking the Last Utopia: The Taiwanese in New Zealand," in *Unfolding History, Evolving Identity: The Chinese in New Zealand*, ed. Manying Ip (Auckland, New Zealand: Auckland University Press, 2003); Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."; Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

²⁹ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

³⁰ The *Sing-Tao Weekly* moved to a daily publishing schedule in 1991, becoming New Zealand's first Chinese-language daily. Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?.";

edition of the Hong Kong-based *Sing-Tao Daily* (星岛日报), in 1989.³¹ Initially a bilingual publication so as to cater to Chinese New Zealanders who could not read Chinese,³² the *Sing-Tao Weekly* carried a small amount of New Zealand news and sourced its international news and other content from its Hong Kong headquarters.³³ The newspaper left the market in the late 1990s.³⁴ Hong Kong migrants were also involved in setting up New Zealand's first Chinese-language radio programme, which broadcast in Cantonese and English on community radio station, *Access Radio*.³⁵

Migrants from Taiwan became the main group of ethnic Chinese arrivals into New Zealand during the 1993/4 financial year and, for a time, played a dominant role in New Zealand's Chinese-language media.³⁶ Taiwanese migrants founded *Independence Daily* (自立快报), which, along with the *Sing-Tao Weekly*, became one of only two Chinese-language newspapers in New Zealand to have a cover price.³⁷ While pro-Taiwan in its editorial stance, the *Independence Daily* was regarded as one of the few Chinese-language newspapers of a high journalistic standard to have been published in New Zealand.³⁸ The *Independence Daily's* New Zealand news was sourced locally, however, much of its other content was sourced from the newspaper's Sydney headquarters.³⁹ The newspaper ceased publication in 2005 after struggling to attract advertisers and readers amidst increasingly high levels of migration from the mainland PRC.⁴⁰ In 1998, Taiwanese migrants also founded BBC AM 990 (BBC 中文电台). The station was New Zealand's first full-time commercial Chinese-language radio station and broadcast in Mandarin and Cantonese.⁴¹

Jianqiang Huo, "A Study of Chinese Print Media in New Zealand: History, Culture and Professionalism" (Master of Arts Auckland University, 1999).

³¹ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."

³² Yaohua Hu, "Overview of the Development of Chinese-Language Media in New Zealand 新西兰华文传媒发展综述," 17/8/2005, <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/news/2005/2005-08-17/26/613065.shtml>.

³³ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

³⁴ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."

³⁵ Ibid.

³⁶ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*; Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."; Ip, "Seeking the Last Utopia: The Taiwanese in New Zealand."

³⁷ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

³⁸ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."; Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

³⁹ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

⁴⁰ James Jiann Hua To, *Qiaowu: Extra-Territorial Policies for the Overseas Chinese Overseas*, 2014 ed. (Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill, 2014); Julie Middleton, "Pro-Taiwan Newspaper Takes a Lengthy Breather," *New Zealand Herald*, 11/03/2005, <https://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/pro-taiwan-newspaper-takes-a-lengthy-breather/2YJ5HE75OK3Z7HLZMI2CYT4JRY/>; Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

⁴¹ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."

In 1997, migrants from Taiwan and Hong Kong founded *World TV* (中华电视网), which became one of New Zealand's most significant ethnic media companies, operating twelve television channels,⁴² three radio stations,⁴³ a website, a WeChat account,⁴⁴ and a monthly magazine.⁴⁵ Its television channels provided unique diversity, with content broadcast in Mandarin and Cantonese and 'homeland' political news coverage sourced from PRC state broadcaster, *China Central Television* (中国中央电视台); the Taiwan Overseas Chinese Affairs Commission-run (侨务委员会) *Macroview Satellite Television* (宏观卫视); and the Hong Kong-based *Asia Television* (亚洲电视).⁴⁶ In 2015, *World TV* discontinued its Taiwanese content.⁴⁷ The company entered liquidation in 2021.⁴⁸

By 1997, mainland PRC had become New Zealand's largest source of Chinese migrants,⁴⁹ a position that has continued to hold,⁵⁰ further, and profoundly, transforming New Zealand's Chinese-language media landscape. By the late 2000s, mainland PRC migrants came to dominate ownership of the Chinese-language media, including the relatively new space of online media with websites such as *New Zealand Chinese Net* (新西兰中文网) and *Skykiwi* (天维网), both founded in 2001.⁵¹ Throughout the next decade, increasingly close ties between New Zealand's Chinese-language media and PRC party-state media were developed and cemented; and the publication and broadcast of content and narratives from party-state media became widespread at the expense of alternative sources and viewpoints.⁵²

⁴² In addition to Cantonese and Mandarin channels, *World TV* also had Korean and Japanese-language channels. Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*; "About World TV Ltd 關於中華電視網," World TV, 2009, https://web.archive.org/web/20160610110809/http://www.wtv.co.nz/eng_about.html.

⁴³ A Cantonese station, a Mandarin news talk station, and a Mandarin music station. "About WTV," World TV Group, n.d., <https://web.archive.org/web/20191218034941/http://en.wtv.co.nz/about-wtv/>.

⁴⁴ "About WTV."

⁴⁵ "Introduction to World TV Ltd 新西兰中华电视网(World TV Ltd.)简介," China Radio International Online, 2012, <https://web.archive.org/web/20201114231625/https://news.cri.cn/gb/1321/2012/01/20/1427s3530044.htm>; "About WTV."

⁴⁶ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."

⁴⁷ "World TV Co-Founder Gary Chang Unfairly Sacked, Awarded \$469k," *The New Zealand Herald*, 11/7/2017, https://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/world-tv-co-founder-gary-chang-unfairly-sacked-awarded-469k/LJGYTHJAOGV2XR3KOCTBG7446A/?c_id=3&objectid=11889565.

⁴⁸ Damien Venuto, "Historical Fraud and Covid Tip NZ's Largest Chinese Language Media Company into Liquidation," *New Zealand Herald*, 25/3/2021, <https://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/historical-fraud-and-covid-tip-nzs-largest-chinese-language-media-company-into-liquidation/7TWR5B6MIO6THKUDP3C2ABACAU/>.

⁴⁹ Liangni Sally Liu, "New Chinese Immigration to New Zealand: Policies, Immigration Patterns, Mobility and Perception," in *Contemporary Chinese Diasporas*, ed. Min Zhou (Singapore: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017).

⁵⁰ Ibid.

⁵¹ "Chinese.net.nz 新西兰中文网," HH Link, n.d., <https://www.hhlink.com/link/www.chinese.net.nz/新西兰中文网>; Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*; "About Us 关于我们 (Skykiwi)," Skykiwi, n.d., <https://em.skykiwi.com/aboutus.html>.

⁵² Brady, *Magic Weapons: China's Political Influence Activities under Xi Jinping*; Anne-Marie Brady, "China in Xi's 'New Era': New Zealand and the CCP's 'Magic Weapons'," *Journal of Democracy* 29, no. 2 (2018).

Also during the 1990s and early 2000s, large numbers of free newspapers, often short-lived, ad-laden and of poor quality, entered the market.⁵³ Free newspapers, such as the Wellington-based *Home Voice* and Christchurch's *New Zealand Messenger*,⁵⁴ were predominantly set up by migrants from the mainland PRC;⁵⁵ however, the first free Chinese-language newspaper since the revival of New Zealand's Chinese-language media was the *Mandarin Times* (华页), now called the *Mandarin Pages*, founded in 1991 by Malaysian-born businessman David Soh (苏文德).

Of the free newspapers, the highest quality was the *New Zealand Chinese Herald Weekly* (新西兰先驱报中文周刊), a publication founded by Wilson & Horton, publishers of the English-language newspaper, the *New Zealand Herald*.⁵⁶ The *New Zealand Chinese Herald Weekly* benefitted from access to stories from its parent newspaper. In 1997, after a change of ownership, it became the *Chinese Herald* (新西兰中文先驱报).⁵⁷

The period around the turn of the millennium saw an increasing availability of new technologies that enabled media outlets to reach larger audiences and lower production costs. Greater access to satellite television and the internet allowed media outlets like *World TV* and *Chinese.net.nz* to deliver content to people around New Zealand and overseas.⁵⁸ Production was made easier and cheaper by,⁵⁹ for example, software that enabled instant switching between traditional and Chinese simplified characters and the internet providing ready access to overseas news which could be downloaded and inserted into local publications,⁶⁰ shrinking the distance between 'homeland' and local media. WeChat,⁶¹ launched by PRC company

⁵³ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."; Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

⁵⁴ *Home Voice* and the *New Zealand Messenger* were established in 1998 and 2003, respectively. "About Us 关于我们 (Home Voice)," Home Voice, 2021, <http://www.homevoice.co.nz/web/template/common/about.html>; "About Us 关于我们 (New Zealand Messenger)," New Zealand Messenger, 2022, <https://nzmessengers.co.nz/广告服务/>.

⁵⁵ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."

⁵⁶ Murphy, "Chinese."; Huo, "A Study of Chinese Print Media in New Zealand: History, Culture and Professionalism."

⁵⁷ Ru Kuo, "Everyone at the 'Chinese Herald' Wishes Our Readers a Happy New Year: Happy New Year, May All Your Wishes Be Fulfilled! '新西兰中文先驱传媒'全体同仁向广大读者拜年: 恭贺新禧 万事如意!," *Chinese Herald*, 5/2/2019, <https://www.chineseherald.co.nz/news/new-zealand/happy-spring-festival-to-all-readers/>.

⁵⁸ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

⁵⁹ This was a major contributing factor to the flourishing of free newspapers in 1990s and early 2000s. Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."

⁶⁰ Ibid.

⁶¹ For the purposes of this article, WeChat will be used as an umbrella term for both WeChat and Weixin (微信). For a discussion of the differences between WeChat and Weixin, see Haiqing Yu and Wanning Sun,

Tencent (腾讯) in 2011, also began to develop into an important channel for media outlets to distribute content.⁶²

The ebbs and flows in the growth and development of New Zealand's Chinese-language media have reflected political, demographic, and technological trends and changes, both in New Zealand and overseas.⁶³ From the late 1980s, these factors together gave New Zealand a dynamic Chinese-language mediasphere. This allowed for the existence of many media outlets, operating through a variety of channels, and providing growing audiences with content that was, at least for a time, linguistically diverse and varied in its representation of the politics of the mainland PRC, Hong Kong and Taiwan.

"WeChat Subscription Accounts (WSAs) in Australia: A Political Economy Account of Chinese-Language Digital/Social Media," *Media International Australia* 179, no. 1 (2021) and Alex Joske et al., *The Influence Environment: A Survey of Chinese-Language Media in Australia*, Australian Strategic Policy Institute (2020).

⁶² Skykiwi was an early adopter, launching a WeChat official account in 2012. "About Us 关于我们 (Skykiwi)."

⁶³ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?"; Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

Present-Day Media Characteristics

High levels of migration, particularly from the PRC, have continued to shape New Zealand's Chinese-language media, helping to maintain their relevance and commercial viability.⁶⁴ At present, New Zealand is home to a vibrant array of Chinese-language media outlets, although as will be discussed in the [*Issues of Quality and Independence*](#) section, the variety of outlets is not matched by a diversity of opinions on certain topics. Outlets distribute content through the mediums of print; radio; television; online; and social media, primarily WeChat. The majority reach audiences through more than one medium. Active outlets include:

Newspapers: *Asia-Pacific Times* (中新时报), *Chinese Herald*, the *Epoch Times* (大纪元时报), *Home Voice* (乡音), the *Mandarin Pages* (华页), the *New Zealand Messenger* (新西兰信报), *South Island Chinese Newspaper* (华新时报),⁶⁵ the *Vision Times* (看中国), the *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper* (怀卡托周报).

Magazines: *Chinese Eye Magazine* (视野), *Palmery* (精彩),⁶⁶ *Yiju NZ* (逸居新西兰).

Radio stations: *Chinese Voice* (华人之声广播电台), *Love FM* (新西兰交通音乐广播), *Radio Chinese* (新西兰中文广播电台).⁶⁷

Radio shows: *The Dunedin Chinese Culture Show* (达尼丁中国文化秀), *Waikato Chinese Voices* (怀卡托华人之声), *Voice of the Four Seas* (四海之音).

Television channels: *Channel 33*, *TV 28*.

Online: *936 News Net* (936 新闻网),⁶⁸ *Aus NZ Net* (澳纽网), *Chinese Herald* (新西兰中文先驱网), *Chinese Town* (中国城),⁶⁹ *HouGarden* (后花园), *Kan NZ* (看新西兰), *Morning New Zealand* (新西兰早知道), *New Times Net* (新西兰时新网), *New Zealand Chinese Daily News* (新西兰华人每日资讯网),⁷⁰ *New Zealand Newspaper* (新西兰报), *New Zealand Review* (新西兰全搜索), *NZ Life* (新西兰生活网), *NZ*

⁶⁴ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

⁶⁵ At present, *South Island Chinese Newspaper* is possibly more active through digital channels than in print.

⁶⁶ *Palmery* is a bilingual magazine (English and Chinese).

⁶⁷ Sometimes also written as ‘纽西兰中文广播电台’.

⁶⁸ This is not an official translation of the website's name; it does not appear to have one.

⁶⁹ The website is updated infrequently.

⁷⁰ *New Zealand Chinese Daily News* has not published any articles since March, however, it still maintains some functions, such as a livestream of *Parliament TV*, a channel that livestreams the proceedings the New Zealand Parliament.

Mao (毛传媒), *Oceania TV* (大洋洲中文电视台),⁷¹ *Skykiwi* (新西兰天维网), *Solace Media* (格局传媒), the *United Chinese Press* (新西兰联合报), *Yiju NZ* (逸居新西兰).

WeChat:⁷² *GD Christchurch* (格调基督城), *Go Kiwi* (发现新西兰), *Kankan New Zealand* (看看新西兰), *Kiwi Daily* (新西兰生活快讯), *SkyInvest* (天维投资), *Skykiwi Go Shopping* (新西兰天维导购), *Skykiwi Go South Island* (发现南岛), *Skykiwi Go To New Zealand* (走进新西兰), *Skykiwi Go Welly* (发现惠灵顿), *Skykiwi Lifestyle* (新西兰天维生活), *Skykiwi Webizlink* (新西兰微财经), *This is New Zealand* (这才是新西兰).

Some companies own multiple media brands. Best News Entertainment (新西兰佳讯全媒体集团),⁷³ for example, owns news website *936 News Net*, television channel *TV28* and two radio stations, *Chinese Voice* and *Love FM*.⁷⁴ EducAsia Media Limited (中新华媒传播集团)⁷⁵ runs the *Asia-Pacific Times* newspaper and the *Waikato Chinese Voices* radio show.⁷⁶ Sky Media, trading as *Skykiwi.com*,⁷⁷ is focused on digital content and has several different

⁷¹ While still uploading some new content to their website, *Oceania TV*'s media activities appear to be very limited at present.

⁷² A majority of the newspapers, radio stations, television stations and online outlets also have WeChat accounts.

⁷³ Best News Entertainment has acquired the business assets of World TV; the latter is currently in liquidation. Fu-Nu Tsai (蔡富女), the largest shareholder in World TV, is the majority shareholder in Best News Entertainment. "World TV Limited (936104) in Liquidation - Shareholdings," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/936104/shareholdings>; "Best News Entertainment Limited (6295588) Registered - Shareholdings," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Best-News-Entertainment>; Venuto, "Historical Fraud and Covid Tip NZ's Largest Chinese Language Media Company into Liquidation."

⁷⁴ *Best News Entertainment Ltd Media Kit*, (2021); "Home Page," Best News Entertainment, <https://www.bne.co.nz>.

⁷⁵ "Educasia Media Limited - Company Summary," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Educasia-Media-Limited-Summary>

⁷⁶ *Waikato Chinese Voices* claims that it is broadcast 24 hours per day, 7 days per week on FM 89.0. However, FM89.0 is *Free FM*, a Waikato community radio station that broadcasts shows from a variety of individuals and community groups and lists *Waikato Chinese Voices* as having only two weekly slots on the station — 7-9pm on Monday and Tuesday evenings. Links to listen to *Waikato Chinese Voices* outside of those times do not work and content available online appears to have been recorded during the two two-hour time slots that *Waikato Chinese Voices* has been allocated on *Free FM*. Further, EducAsia Media's newspaper, the *Asia-Pacific Times*, carries a schedule for *Waikato Chinese Voices* that is supposedly for the winter of 2023, however, the schedule also indicates that the station is broadcast through *Free FM*'s FM89.0 frequency. The schedule in the newspaper also carries a WeChat QR code from which one should be able to listen to the station, however, no live content can be played through the link. "Hootaka - Free FM Programme Schedule," Free FM, 2023, <https://www.freefm.org.nz/Schedule.aspx>; "Waikato Chinese Voices 怀卡托华人之声," *Asia-Pacific Times*, 3/5/2023, B04, <http://www.aptimes.nz/?m=home&c=Lists&a=index&tid=13>. EducAsia Media also has business interests in the PRC. "About Us 关于我们 (Educasia Media Limited)," *Asia-Pacific Times*, n.d., <http://www.aptimes.nz/?m=home&c=Lists&a=index&tid=6>.

⁷⁷ "Sky Media Limited (4274018) Registered - Company Summary," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Sky-Media-Limited-Summary>.

channels and products. In addition to its main *Skykiwi* website, forum (*Skykiwi Forum*; 天维论坛) and flagship *Skykiwi* WeChat official account (公众号), also named *Skykiwi*, it has seven other WeChat official accounts,⁷⁸ including *Skykiwi Go To New Zealand*, *SkyInvest* and *Go Welly*, and six Xiaohongshu (小红书)⁷⁹ accounts, such as *New Zealand Investment Journal* (纽国投资日记)⁸⁰ and *Skykiwi Lifestyle* (天维生活).⁸¹ Wang Lili (王立立), an Auckland businesswoman, owns Chinese Herald Limited, the owner of the *Chinese Herald* newspaper and at least 50% of Chinese Herald Investments Limited, which in turn owns Chinese Herald Digital Limited, the owner of the *Chinese Herald* website.⁸² New Zealand Messengers Limited,⁸³ a company best known for its print publications, owns the *New Zealand Messenger* newspaper and *Palmary*, a bilingual magazine. Others, like Home Voice Limited,⁸⁴ the owner of *Home Voice* newspaper, primarily focus on a single brand and medium.⁸⁵

New Zealand's Chinese-language media mainly serve recent migrants.⁸⁶ High levels of Chinese migration to New Zealand in recent decades, particularly from the mainland PRC,⁸⁷ have created a large audience for Chinese-language media outlets. Auckland, home to 69.1%

⁷⁸ All of *Skykiwi*'s WeChat accounts are registered to PRC-based companies.

⁷⁹ Xiaohongshu is a PRC social media and ecommerce platform.

⁸⁰ *New Zealand Investment Journal* is not an official translation. The account does not appear to have an official English name.

⁸¹ "Skykiwi Social Media 天维社交媒体," Skykiwi, 2022, <https://events.skykiwichina.com/socialmedia/>.

⁸² 50% of *Chinese Herald* Investments shares were and are owned by Wang Lili, the remaining 50% were and are held by a nominee shareholder. "Chinese Herald Digital Limited (6088963) Registered - Shareholdings," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Chinese-Herald-Shareholding>; "Chinese Herald Investments Limited - Documents," New Zealand Companies Office, 2022, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/6034347/documents>; "Chinese Herald Investments Limited (6034347) Registered - Shareholdings," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/6034347/shareholdings>. "CH Nominees Limited - Documents," New Zealand Companies Office, 2022, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/5956170/documents>; "ACL Nominees (No.11) Limited - Company Summary," New Zealand Companies Office, 2022, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/5951812>. "ACL Nominees (No.11) Limited - Documents," New Zealand Companies Office, 2022, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/5951812/documents>; "Anderson Creagh Lai Limited - Company Summary," New Zealand Companies Office, 2022, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/3765256>.

⁸³ "New Zealand Messengers Limited (1394998) Registered - Company Summary," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/NZ-Messengers-Company-Summary>

⁸⁴ "Home Voice Limited (1346238) Registered - Company Summary," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Home-VoiceCompany-Summary>

⁸⁵ Although some outlets — like *Home Voice* which also has WeChat, Twitter and Facebook accounts and a website — also publish some content through other mediums.

⁸⁶ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

⁸⁷ Liangni Sally Liu et al., "The Making of an Ethnoburb: Studying Sub-Ethnicities of the China-Born New Immigrants in Albany, New Zealand," *Integrative Physiological and Behavioral Science* 56, no. 2 (2022).

of Chinese people in New Zealand,⁸⁸ has become the epicentre of Chinese-language media consumption and production.

The audience distribution of two of New Zealand's most nationally important Chinese-language media outlets, *Skykiwi* and the *Chinese Herald* website, both of which are headquartered in Auckland, reflect the concentration of consumers of Chinese-language media in Auckland. *Skykiwi*, which reports 444,360 registered users on its forum and more than 128,000 daily page views on its news website,⁸⁹ claims that 85.57% of its users are based in Auckland, 4.98% in Christchurch, 3.25% in Wellington, 2.1% in Hamilton, 0.7% in Tauranga and 0.62% in Dunedin.⁹⁰ The *Chinese Herald* states that it has an audience of 200,000 unique visitors, 70% of whom are located in New Zealand. Of this New Zealand-based audience,⁹¹ 85% are said to be based in Auckland, 4% in Christchurch, and 3% in both Wellington and Hamilton.⁹²

In addition to *Skykiwi* and the *Chinese Herald*, other Auckland-based media include the *Mandarin Pages*, *New Zealand Newspaper*, *HouGarden*, *Yiju NZ*, *Chinese Town*, *NZ Mao*, *AusNZ Net*, *NZ Life*, *Go Kiwi*, *Channel 33*, *TV 28*, *Chinese Voice*, *Love FM* and *Radio Chinese*. Outlets in other cities, many of which are local in reach rather than national, including *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper* and *Asia-Pacific Times* in Hamilton; *Home Voice* and *Oceania TV* in Wellington; the *New Zealand Messenger*, *Palmary*, *Solace Media* and *New Zealand Review* in Christchurch; and the *South Island Chinese Newspaper* in Dunedin.

Local consumers of Chinese-language media, of course, also have access to overseas Chinese-language media, from the PRC and elsewhere. This is primarily available online and through social media platforms.⁹³ Some media organisations, like *Xinhua News Agency* (新华

⁸⁸ "Te Taupori Hainamana O Tāmaki Makaurau - Auckland's Asian Population," Auckland Council, n.d., <https://www.aucklandcouncil.govt.nz/plans-projects-policies-reports-bylaws/our-plans-strategies/auckland-plan/about-the-auckland-plan/Pages/aucklands-asian-population.aspx>.

⁸⁹ "About Us 关于我们 (Skykiwi)."; *Skykiwi Media Kit 2022*, (2022).

⁹⁰ "About Us 关于我们 (Skykiwi)."

⁹¹ The *Chinese Herald* claims that 70% of its audience are based in New Zealand, 25% in China and 5% in other countries. *Chinese Herald Media Kit*, (2022).

⁹² Ibid.

⁹³ Heather Irvine and Wing Morgan, *Asian Media Use in Aotearoa NZ in 2021: A Qualitative Research Study Focusing on Chinese and Indian New Zealanders*, Irirangi te Motu New Zealand on Air (2021).

通讯社) and the *People's Daily Overseas Edition's Haiwai Net* (海外网), which both have a presence in New Zealand,⁹⁴ provide limited coverage of New Zealand news.⁹⁵

Reflecting mainland PRC migrants' importance as an audience for Chinese-language media outlets, since the early 2010s, WeChat, which is hugely popular in the mainland PRC and among recent mainland migrants,⁹⁶ has become a key channel through which New Zealand Chinese-language media companies distribute news and other content.⁹⁷ The most common form of WeChat official account used by New Zealand media outlets is the subscription account (订阅号), which allows content to be posted once per day.⁹⁸

WeChat official accounts are used by most media outlets, including those that are primarily focused on digital publishing such as *Skykiwi* and *Kiwi Daily*, television and radio stations like *Channel 33* and *Radio Chinese*, and newspapers, such as *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper* and *Home Voice*. Some outlets also maintain a presence on other social media platforms like Weibo (微博),⁹⁹ Xiaohongshu, Facebook, Twitter and YouTube. Many have

⁹⁴ "Overseas Bureaus 派驻国(境)外分支机构," *Xinhua News Agency* N.d., http://www.xinhuanet.com/xhsld/2021-02/09/c_1211019859.htm; "About Us (Beyond Media)," Beyond Media, <http://bym.co.nz>; "HWW NZ Limited (5867528) Registered - Shareholdings," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/5867528/shareholdings>.

⁹⁵ Xinhua News Agency is the only Chinese-language media organisation that has a staff member that is an accredited member of the New Zealand's Parliament's press gallery. "Press Gallery Membership," New Zealand Parliament, 2022, <https://www.parliament.nz/en/get-involved/information-for-the-press/press-gallery/#X>.

⁹⁶ Yijia Zhang, "WeChat as an Everyday Tactic: Ride-Hailing and Place-Making in Vancouver," in *WeChat and the Chinese Diaspora: Digital Transnationalism in the Era of China's Rise*, ed. Wanning Sun and Haiqing Yu (Milton, United Kingdom: Taylor & Francis Group, 2022); Wanning Sun and Haiqing Yu, *Digital Transnationalism: Chinese-Language Media in Australia* (Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill, 2023).

⁹⁷ WeChat is also used by non-media businesses and other organisations in New Zealand. For example, New World supermarket, AMI Insurance and Air New Zealand all have official WeChat accounts. Several New Zealand political parties and politicians have also had a presence on the platform. The Labour and National parties both have WeChat accounts. Labour Member of Parliament, Chen Naisi (陈耐锶), currently has an official WeChat account; and in the past, former Prime Ministers Bill English and John Key have had accounts, as has the TEA Party (新西兰茶党). According to several articles in New Zealand's Chinese-language press, including a column written by former National Party MP, Yang Jian (杨健), National was the first political party outside of the PRC to set up an official WeChat account. Jian Yang, "See You after the Election! 大选之后见!", *Chinese Herald*, 13/9/2014, http://www.chnet.co.nz/Html/2014-9-13/Paper_23884.html; Jian Yang, "See You after the Election! 大选之后见!", *Home Voice*, 19/9/2014; "National Party Sets up World-First WeChat Official Account 国家党开通官方微信全球第一," *Home Voice*, 19/9/2014; "New Zealand Prime Minister John Key Launches Personal WeChat Account to Improve Communication with Chinese Community 新西兰总理约翰·基开通私人微信 加强与华社联络," *China Qiaowang*, 2/9/2016, <http://www.chinaqw.com/hqhr/2016/09-02/101704.shtml>; "To Welcome Li Keqiang, the New Zealand Prime Minister Has Set up a WeChat Official Account 为了欢迎李克强, 新西兰总理开了个微信公众号," *Global Times*, <https://world.huanqiu.com/article/9CaKrnK1Aol>.

⁹⁸ WeChat's other type of public-facing official account, the service account (服务号), allows the publication of only four posts per month. "Introduction to WeChat Official Service Accounts, Subscription Accounts, Enterprise Accounts and Mini-Programmes 公众平台服务号、订阅号、企业微信以及小程序的相关说明," Tencent, n.d., <https://kf.qq.com/faq/120911VrYVrA130805byM32u.html>.

⁹⁹ Weibo is a microblogging website owned by PRC company, Sina (新浪).

limited reach through non-PRC social media channels. Some, however, such as *TV 28* and *Channel 33*, which have more than 180,000 and 80,000 subscribers on YouTube, respectively, have found large audiences on non-PRC social media.¹⁰⁰

Generally, including in recent decades, Chinese-language media in New Zealand have used traditional Chinese characters,¹⁰¹ the form used in Taiwan, Hong Kong and Macau. Now, in a market in which migrants from the mainland PRC predominate in both media production and consumption,¹⁰² the simplified script of the mainland PRC is commonly used. Several outlets, particularly recently established ones, such as *Solace Media*, have used simplified characters since their inception. Others, like the *New Zealand Messenger*, and more recently, the *Chinese Herald* newspaper,¹⁰³ have switched from the traditional to simplified script. Several newspapers, however, including the *Mandarin Pages*,¹⁰⁴ *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper*, and *Epoch Times* are still published using traditional characters.¹⁰⁵ Some websites, like the *Chinese Herald*, *Skykiwi*, and *NZ Life*, allow users to toggle between simplified and traditional characters but have simplified characters as the default option. Other websites, like *Morning New Zealand* and *New Zealand Newspaper*, use only simplified characters. The *Vision Times*, which also allows users to toggle between traditional and simplified characters, appears to be the only website that has traditional characters as the default option. On WeChat, almost all outlets use simplified characters; *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper*, which publishes full versions of its newspaper through WeChat, is a notable exception.¹⁰⁶ Cantonese television and radio channels, such as those previously run by *World TV*, are either no longer in operation or, as is the case for FM 99.4 — formerly called *Real Good Life* (真快活) and now under the ownership of Best News Entertainment and called *Love FM* — are no longer Cantonese platforms. At present, nearly all radio and television content, much of which is sourced from the PRC, is in Mandarin.

¹⁰⁰ *TV 28* has more than 180,000 subscribers on YouTube; *Channel 33* has more than 80,000.

"TV 28 (Best News Entertainment) 新西兰华人电视台 TV 28 (BNE 佳訊)," YouTube, 2023, <https://www.youtube.com/@BNETV28/featured>; "Channel 33 (New Zealand) (Channel33 电视台(新西兰))," 2023, <https://www.youtube.com/@CHANNEL33NewZealand/featured>.

¹⁰¹ Handong Wang and Xisong Guo, "An Investigation into the Current State of Chinese-Language Media in New Zealand 新西兰华文媒体现状考察," *Press Outpost* 2011, <https://www.zz-news.com/com/xinwenqianshao/news/itemid-636772.html>.

¹⁰² Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

¹⁰³ The *Chinese Herald* newspaper began using simplified characters in May 2019.

¹⁰⁴ The website and WeChat account of the *Mandarin Pages*, which also carries news and other content, use simplified characters.

¹⁰⁵ *Epoch Times*' website allows users to switch between simplified and traditional characters. It does not have a WeChat account.

¹⁰⁶ A minority of posts on the *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper*'s WeChat account do use simplified characters.

New Zealand's Chinese-language media are generally small to medium-sized businesses that are often poorly resourced and driven by commercial imperatives.¹⁰⁷ Operating in what is a competitive, lightly regulated and laissez-faire media environment,¹⁰⁸ they seldom receive funding from the New Zealand government. There are, however, several Chinese-language radio shows that broadcast on community access radio stations that are partly funded by independent government media funding agency New Zealand on Air. These include *Waikato Chinese Voices* on Hamilton's *Free FM*, *Voice of the Four Seas* on *Manawatū People's Radio*,¹⁰⁹ and the Dunedin Chinese Senior Association's (但尼丁老年华人协会) bilingual (Mandarin and English) *Dunedin Chinese Culture Show* (达尼丁中国文化秀)¹¹⁰ on *Otago Access Radio*.¹¹¹

Direct funding is less common.¹¹² A recent and rare case is \$137,280 provided by the New Zealand on Air-administered Public Interest Journalism Fund in 2022 to Go Global for the training of two cadet journalists to 'increase the quality and quantity of trusted news content for Chinese audiences'.¹¹³ Go Global is a digital marketing and e-commerce company with several digital publishing brands, including the New Zealand-focused *Go Kiwi* which publishes content digitally, including through WeChat and on PRC company NetEase's (网易) 163.com portal.¹¹⁴

¹⁰⁷ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

¹⁰⁸ Chris Rudd, "Political Economy of the Media," in *Politics and the Media*, ed. Geoff Kemp et al. (Auckland, New Zealand: Auckland University Press, 2016); Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

¹⁰⁹ Unlike many other programmes, *Voice of the Four Seas* includes a segment in Cantonese. "Voice of the Four Seas," Manawatū People's Radio, 2023, <https://mpr.nz/Shows/Details.aspx?PID=dc780b71-db49-40cf-83ba-ffd505620cf0>.

¹¹⁰ The official Chinese names of the Dunedin Chinese Senior Association and the Dunedin Chinese Culture Show use different characters to write the first part of 'Dunedin'.

¹¹¹ "Dunedin Chinese Culture Show," 2023, <https://oar.org.nz/dunedin-chinese-culture-show/>.

¹¹² Chinese-language outlets have also received government support in the form of wage subsidies provided to businesses that had their revenue severely impacted by Covid-19 restrictions. For example, Sky Media Limited, the owner of *Skykiwi* received a total of \$580,324.40; Chinese Herald Limited, the owner of the *Chinese Herald* newspaper received \$190,416.80; Chinese Herald Digital Limited, the company that owns the *Chinese Herald* website received \$149,484.80; and Best News Entertainment Limited, owner of *Chinese Voice*, *Love FM* and *TV 28*, received \$150,944. "Covid-19 Wage Subsidies - Employer Search," Work and Income, 2023, <https://services.workandincome.govt.nz/eps/search>.

¹¹³ "Search Funding Decisions," New Zealand on Air, 2023, https://www.nzonair.govt.nz/search/?search_type=decisions&q=go+global; "Journalism Funding," New Zealand on Air, 2023, <https://www.nzonair.govt.nz/funding/journalism-funding/#funding-decisions>.

¹¹⁴ Go Global also runs the *Go Aussie* (发现澳大利亚) and *Go Foodies* (发现食堂) WeChat accounts. All three of Go Global's WeChat accounts are registered to Shanghai-based company Sufu Culture and Media (Shanghai) Limited (苏弗文化传媒(上海)有限公司). The company has the same shareholders, Phillip Teng Huan (腾欢) and Lilian Cai Ying (蔡颖), as Go Global. While not listed on the Go Global website, the WeChat account, *Kiwi Daily* (新西兰生活快讯), is also registered to Sufu Culture and Media (Shanghai) Limited. "Welcome to Go Global," 2017, <http://www.goglobal.ltd>; "Sufu Culture Media (Shanghai) Limited 苏弗文化传媒(上海)有限公司," Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_13901382267514; "Go Global Limited

The most remarkable, and potentially most consequential, investment that the New Zealand government has made in Chinese-language media was announced in late 2022. Public broadcaster *Radio New Zealand* (RNZ) is in the process of establishing a unit to provide content for Asian New Zealanders, initially focusing on Chinese and Indian communities and funded by \$1,114,672 from the Public Interest Journalism Fund.¹¹⁵ The initiative, scheduled to be operational before the 2023 general election in October, will produce both original content and translations of RNZ's English-language articles.¹¹⁶ With its commitment to public service journalism and insulation from the commercial pressures that producers of Chinese-language content in New Zealand have to contend with,¹¹⁷ RNZ will be a unique presence in a Chinese-language media landscape that is vibrant but lacking in journalistic quality and diversity in important areas.

(4644619) Registered - Shareholdings,"

<https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/4644619/shareholdings?backurl=H4sIAAAAAAAC2LMQrDMBAEf6PGhV9whFRpXATsD2x0h2KQdYruFPDvI0y6nWF2rkhic9SjouxjmaDF9%2B1QFjJHYTQOfIYhKb77SMKHkk4p6wt5CuAvShR%2Bokgmb13CFZ7b%2BBjd1%2BXPq8O7PZr2eukfYjzeS3oAAAA%3D>.

¹¹⁵ "Latest Journalism Funding Round Provides Substantial Commitment to Asian Audiences," New Zealand on Air, 2022, <https://www.nzonair.govt.nz/news/latest-journalism-funding-round-provides-substantial-commitment-to-asian-audiences/>.

¹¹⁶ Sam Sachdeva, "RNZ Enters Chinese-Language News Amid Censorship Concerns," *Newsroom*, 28/3/2023, <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/rnz-enters-chinese-language-news-amid-censorship-concerns>; "RNZ Targets NZ-Asian Audiences," *Asia Media Centre*, 22/3/2023, <https://www.asiamediacentre.org.nz/news/rnz-targets-nz-asian-audiences/>.

¹¹⁷ "The Radio New Zealand Charter," RNZ, 2023, <https://www.rnz.co.nz/about/charter>; Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

Roles of the Chinese-language Media

As media primarily consumed by recent migrants,¹¹⁸ Chinese-language media, which range from providers and hosts of general news, entertainment and other content, such as *Skykiwi* and the *Chinese Herald*, to those with a greater focus on niche interests, like real estate (*HouGarden* and *Yiju NZ*), play an important role in aiding settlement in New Zealand and connecting their audiences to the wider community.¹¹⁹ Through the publication and broadcast of New Zealand news and opinion content, outlets provide audiences with insight into New Zealand's cultures, history and institutions; they offer information on key actors, important events, the economy, and social issues and trends. Their news, opinion, advertising and other content can inform and facilitate engagement with public and commercial services, often providing points of contact that are equipped to serve migrants with limited English-language skills. Efforts are sometimes also made to help audiences understand the rights that they have when engaging with public services. Additionally, forums, like those hosted by *Skykiwi* and *Kannz*,¹²⁰ offer a space where users can seek and provide information on an array of topics, from gaining residency to when to put recycling out for collection.

Because people on permanent visas can vote after just one year of living in New Zealand,¹²¹ Chinese-language media play an important role in helping recent (and also more longstanding) Chinese migrants to understand New Zealand political parties, candidates, policies, issues and the process of voting itself — a function that is naturally of greatest importance during general election campaigns.¹²² Almost all Chinese-language media outlets cover New Zealand politics and elections. Some, such as *Skykiwi*,¹²³ have hosted sections dedicated to election coverage.

Content related to New Zealand politics (and New Zealand in general) is largely comprised of stories translated from New Zealand's mainstream English-language media. Chinese-language outlets do, however, sometimes offer framing and coverage of issues and candidates, particularly those of Chinese heritage, that are seldom visible in the mainstream English-language media. An effort is also made at times to provide information specific to

¹¹⁸ Migrants who have been in New Zealand for longer also make use of local Chinese-language media, but due to a greater familiarity with New Zealand and language skills that allow easier access to alternative sources of information, they often have less reliance on it. Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

¹¹⁹ Ibid.

¹²⁰ See <http://bbs.Skykiwi.com/forum.php> and <https://forum.kannz.com>.

¹²¹ "Are You Eligible to Enrol and Vote?."

¹²² Fiona Barker and Kate McMillan, "Factors Influencing the Electoral Participation of Asian Immigrants in New Zealand," *Political Science* 69, no. 2 (2017).

¹²³ "2020 New Zealand General Election 新西兰大选," *Skykiwi*, 2020, <http://www.skykiwi.com/election2020/>.

migrants who may not be familiar with voting in New Zealand, or indeed anywhere else, such as introductions to New Zealand's Mixed Member Proportional voting system and step-by-step guides to voting.

Chinese-language media also connect Chinese people in New Zealand with one another and constitute a space for the development of shared identities.¹²⁴ They report on topics that mainstream media may neglect, such as the activities and successes of Chinese people and Chinese community organisations, promote community events and, at times, articulate and advocate for what they present to be the interests of ethnic Chinese in New Zealand. Some outlets present this as a core part of what they do. For example, the *Chinese Herald*, which describes itself as the media outlet 'most able to represent the voice of Chinese New Zealanders' (最能代表新西兰华人的声音),¹²⁵ has noted that it 'highlights the achievements of Chinese New Zealanders.' (彰显新西兰华人成就)¹²⁶ and has supported 'large-scale events popular with Chinese people' (华人喜爱的大型活动), such as the Auckland Lantern Festival.¹²⁷

In addition to local audiences, some outlets also attempt to reach audiences outside of New Zealand. The website of the *New Zealand Messenger*, for instance, states that its newspaper, website, WeChat account and magazine, *Palmery*, 'together bring high-quality content to the Chinese community in New Zealand, China and Chinese around the world' (共同为新西兰华人社区、中国及世界各地华人受众带来优质内容).¹²⁸ The *Chinese Herald* claims that its news website 'provides authoritative, timely and high-quality news and a variety of other information to Chinese people in New Zealand and around the world (为新西兰及海内外华人提供权威、及时、优质的新闻与各类资讯)'.¹²⁹ It further notes that *Chinese Herald* content has been 'republished by global media, including *China News Service*, *People's Daily Overseas Edition*, *China Central Television*, the *Xinmin Evening News* and media from countries such as Australia, the United States and Canada, making it an important channel for

¹²⁴ Paola Voci, "From Middle Kingdom to Middle Earth and Back: Chinese Media/Mediated Identities in New Zealand," in *Asia in the Making of New Zealand*, ed. Henry Mabley Johnson and Brian Moloughney (Auckland: Auckland University Press, 2006); Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

¹²⁵ "About Us 关于我们 (Chinese Herald)," Chinese Herald, 2020, <https://www.chineseherald.co.nz/contact/about-us/>.

¹²⁶ "It's the Chinese Herald's 25th Anniversary! We're Grateful for Your Company on This Journey; Let's Forge Ahead into the Future Together 中文先驱报创刊 25 周年啦! 感恩有您一路相伴, 携手未来砥砺前行!," *Chinese Herald*, 10/10/2019, <https://www.chineseherald.co.nz/news/new-zealand/chinese-herald-25-anniversary/>.

¹²⁷ Ibid.

¹²⁸ "About Us 关于我们 (New Zealand Messenger)."

¹²⁹ "About Us 关于我们 (Chinese Herald)."

Chinese around the world to understand New Zealand society (全球媒体, 包括中新社、人民日报海外版、中央电视台、新民晚报及澳洲、美国、加拿大等国家的媒体纷纷转载, 成为全球华人了解新西兰社的重要渠道).¹³⁰ Similarly, *Skykiwi* has become a two-way channel for information between New Zealand and the PRC.¹³¹

Several New Zealand media outlets, including *Mandarin Pages*, *Home Voice*, *Solace Media*, the *New Zealand Messenger*, the *New Zealand South Island Newspaper* and *Morning NZ*, have published content on Chinese Headline New Media (华人头条),¹³² a PRC-based news and information sharing platform. The platform, which publishes content aimed at Chinese diaspora around the world, has strategic partnerships with PRC party-state media organisations including *China News Service* (中国新闻社), *China News* (中国新闻网), *China Qiaowang* (中国侨网), *Overseas Chinese News of Fujian*, (福建侨报), the Fujian channel of *Xinhua Net* (新华网福建频道); 'state search engine' (国家搜索引擎)¹³³ ChinaSo (中国搜索);¹³⁴ and agreements with Chinese-language media outlets in more than 50 'countries and regions' (国家和地区).¹³⁵

Media outlets, through the topics that they cover and the sources that they use, also connect their audiences to the PRC. Coverage of the PRC and its engagement with the world, topics for which content is often sourced from PRC party-state media, keep audiences up to date with PRC-related news, primarily through a party-state-approved lens. More locally, articles and announcements by the PRC's embassy and consulates in New Zealand provide updates on public engagements involving the PRC's New Zealand-based diplomatic representatives and the PRC's stance on various issues, including its relationship with New Zealand. The provision of PRC-sourced entertainment content allows audiences to stay informed of fast-moving social trends in the PRC. The celebration of important PRC dates by media, through, for example, the *Chinese Herald* newspaper's 'National Day Special Editions' (国庆特刊), published to mark the PRC's national day,¹³⁶ also link audiences to the PRC.

¹³⁰ "It's the Chinese Herald's 25th Anniversary! We're Grateful for Your Company on This Journey; Let's Forge Ahead into the Future Together 中文先驱报创刊 25 周年啦! 感恩有您一路相伴, 携手未来砥砺前行!."

¹³¹ Brady, *Magic Weapons: China's Political Influence Activities under Xi Jinping*.

¹³² The *Mandarin Pages*, the *New Zealand Messenger* and *Morning NZ* have not posted new content on *Chinese Headline New Media* for some time and may no longer intend to publish content through the platform.

¹³³ Set up by *People's Daily*, *Xinhua News Agency*, *China Central Television*, *Guangming Daily* (光明日报), *Economic Daily* (经济日报), *China Daily* (中国日报) and *China News Service*.

¹³⁴ "Introduction to ChinaSo 国搜介绍," n.d., <https://www.chinaso.com/aboutus/home/aboutus.html>.

¹³⁵ "About Us 关于我们 (Chinese Headline New Media)," Chinese Headline New Media, n.d., <https://www.52hrtt.com/global/n/w/more/about-us>.

¹³⁶ These issues feature a National Day message, or messages, from PRC representatives in New Zealand and sponsored messages of patriotic congratulations for the PRC from businesses and other organisations, including, at least in the 2021 edition, from the *Chinese Herald* itself. "Chinese Herald 先驱报," *Chinese Herald*, 30/9/2021, C12, http://www.chnet.co.nz/Html/2021-9-30/News_198565.Html.

Some outlets highlight their role in facilitating such PRC connections. For example, *Skykiwi*'s 'vision' (愿景) includes the aspiration to 'to a become communication bridge between New Zealand and China' (成为新西兰和中国之间的沟通桥梁).¹³⁷ *Home Voice*,¹³⁸ which, like many other outlets, carries large quantities of news from PRC media organisations, notes that in addition to 'New Zealand's politics, economy and cultural events' (在关注新西兰国内政治、经济、文化活动), it covers China and international news, 'enabling Chinese in New Zealand to stay abreast of the development of the Motherland and keep in sync with it' (让新西兰的华人华侨能够及时了解祖国的发展, 与祖国保持同步).¹³⁹

¹³⁷ "About Us 关于我们 (Skykiwi)."

¹³⁸ *Home Voice* also states that it maintains strong ties 'with major Chinese institutions in New Zealand, such as the Chinese Embassy, the Chinese Cultural Centre and the Confucius Institute' (与中国驻新西兰大使馆、中国文化中心、孔子学院等中国驻新各大机构) and has longstanding relationships with Xinhua News Agency and China News Service'. "About Us 关于我们 (Home Voice)."

¹³⁹ Ibid.

Issues of Quality and Independence

Despite New Zealand's Chinese-language media performing important roles, their content is often of limited journalistic quality.¹⁴⁰ The significant financial constraints that they operate within negatively impact outlets' ability to attract and retain professionally trained journalists who are fluent in Mandarin and English and have a deep understanding of New Zealand.¹⁴¹ This adversely affects the quality of journalism that outlets are able to produce.¹⁴²

Further, a lack of resources means that Chinese-language outlets have very poor newsgathering capabilities.¹⁴³ When reporting on New Zealand, they make extensive use of translations of English-language articles from mainstream media outlets, like *Stuff*, the *New Zealand Herald*, *Newshub* and *RNZ*; the original sources of content, however, are not always acknowledged. Translated articles may be full or partial translations of a single text, sometimes with commentary or other information added. Other times, a single translated article may be a composite of several different English-language source articles, not always from the same media outlet. Some outlets, such as *Home Voice* and the *Asia-Pacific Times*, also get a portion of their New Zealand news from PRC media organisations.

A reliance on translations of mainstream English-language media for New Zealand content can inhibit Chinese-language outlets' ability to cater to the informational needs of recent migrants. Content created for consumers of mainstream media may not include sufficient contextual information, for example, on the Treaty of Waitangi in articles about Māori land ownership,¹⁴⁴ to help recent migrants understand issues that may be unique to New Zealand or different from their home countries.

¹⁴⁰ Irvine and Morgan, *Asian Media Use in Aotearoa NZ in 2021: A Qualitative Research Study Focusing on Chinese and Indian New Zealanders*; Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*; Caleb Hoyle, "Campaign: A Content Analysis of the New Zealand-Based Chinese Language Ethnic Media's Coverage of the 2008, 2011 and 2014 New Zealand General Elections", Victoria University of Wellington, 2020; Kate McMillan and Fiona Barker, "'Ethnic' Media and Election Campaigns: Chinese and Indian Media in New Zealand's 2017 Election," *Australian Journal of Political Science* 56, no. 2 (2021), <https://doi.org/10.1080/10361146.2021.1884644>; Sally Liangni Liu, "The Representation of Māori in Local Chinese Language News Media in New Zealand," *Journal of Intercultural Studies* 30, no. 4 (2009).

¹⁴¹ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

¹⁴² Liu, "The Representation of Māori in Local Chinese Language News Media in New Zealand."; Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

¹⁴³ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?"; Sally Liangni Liu, "Māori Issue Reports in Contemporary Chinese Language Media," in *The Dragon & the Taniwha: Māori & Chinese in New Zealand*, ed. Manying Ip (Auckland, New Zealand: Auckland University Press, 2009); Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*

¹⁴⁴ Liu, "The Representation of Māori in Local Chinese Language News Media in New Zealand."

The Chinese-language media's ability to frame issues and interact with members of parliament and candidates of Chinese heritage in ways that other media cannot is valuable, however, the political coverage that they provide is of an uneven and often limited quality. Their coverage of New Zealand elections, which is also highly reliant on mainstream English-language sources, has often failed, sometimes quite significantly, to provide balanced coverage of political parties, candidates and policies.¹⁴⁵

While the general quality of the journalism produced and hosted by Chinese-language outlets is problematic, the greatest deviation from the norms expected of media in a liberal democracy, like balance and fairness, occurs when outlets cover PRC-related topics. Once the hosts of an array of views on the PRC and its governance, New Zealand's Chinese-language media now almost uniformly refrain from publishing or broadcasting anything critical of the PRC party-state. Rather, coverage of the PRC is overwhelmingly supportive of the party-state and its domestic and international policies and actions.¹⁴⁶ When PRC-related content is translated from English-language sources,¹⁴⁷ frequently New Zealand's mainstream media, outlets are often careful to alter or omit text (sometimes large portions of the original article) that may reflect badly on the party-state.¹⁴⁸ Such methods are also used by party-state media outlets when translating or reporting on articles published by New Zealand's English-language media.¹⁴⁹

¹⁴⁵ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand* ; Hoyle, "Campaign: A Content Analysis of the New Zealand-Based Chinese Language Ethnic Media's Coverage of the 2008, 2011 and 2014 New Zealand General Elections."; McMillan and Barker, "'Ethnic' Media and Election Campaigns: Chinese and Indian Media in New Zealand's 2017 Election."

¹⁴⁶ Li, *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand* ; Brady, *Magic Weapons: China's Political Influence Activities under Xi Jinping*. Among the very few exceptions to this is the New Zealand edition of Falun Gong-linked (法轮功) *Epoch Times*.

¹⁴⁷ Articles that focus on sensitive issues or reflect badly on the PRC party-state are generally not selected for translation.

¹⁴⁸ Even opinion pieces — which do not have to adhere to the same standards of balance as news articles do — that are positive about the PRC can have large amounts of text removed during the translation process. A *Skykiwi* article which provided a translation of a *New Zealand Herald* opinion piece by former New Zealand Prime Minister John Key about New Zealand's relationship with China illustrates this. The sections of the original article that were retained in the translation include comments on the PRC's importance to New Zealand, New Zealand's need to forge its own path when engaging with the PRC and the antagonistic positions that some Western countries have taken towards the PRC. Parts that were excluded, which account for around half of the source article's wordcount, include mention of PRC State Chairman Xi Jinping's (习近平) tightening control over the party-state apparatus, the costs of China's zero Covid policy, Taiwan, and the PRC's response to external criticism. See John Key, "Sir John Key: We Need to Craft Our Own View of China, Using Its Past and Potential to Guide Us," *New Zealand Herald*, 31/12/2022, <https://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/sir-john-key-we-need-to-craft-our-own-view-of-china-using-its-past-and-potential-to-guide-us/PSDICCQP3FBR7O56CRWXKLN2S4/>; Jackie Shan, "John Key Writes About Relations with China: New Zealand Should Make Its Own Decisions 约翰·基撰文谈与中国关系：新西兰应该独立做决定," *Skykiwi*, 1/1/2023, <http://news.skykiwi.com/na/zh/2023-01-01/449237.shtml>.

¹⁴⁹ Caleb Hoyle, *Talking Past Each Other: Coverage of New Zealand-China Relations in New Zealand and Chinese Media* (Wellington, New Zealand: New Zealand Contemporary China Research Centre, 2022).

Blurring the lines between local media outlets and PRC party-state media, much of the PRC-focused content carried by New Zealand's Chinese-language media is sourced from party-state media organisations. These include party-state news agencies *Xinhua News Agency* and *China News Service*; the *China News Service*-run *China Qiaowang*; the official newspaper of the Central Committee of the Chinese Communist Party (中国共产党中央委员会), the *People's Daily* (人民日报), and its *Overseas Edition* (人民日报海外版); semi-official tabloid the *Global Times* (环球时报); party-state-run international radio broadcaster *China Radio International* (中国国际广播电台); and party-state-run television broadcaster *China Central Television* (中国中央电视台). International news that doesn't directly relate to the PRC is also often imported from party-state media, including from the organisations previously mentioned, bringing a PRC lens not just to PRC news but to international news more generally. Outlets that serve the Chinese diaspora in other countries, generally ones that take a pro-PRC stance, such as the New York-based *US China Press* (侨报网),¹⁵⁰ are also sometimes used as sources of international news.

In many cases, the publication and broadcast of content from PRC news organisations through New Zealand's Chinese-language media is formalised through cooperation agreements. New Zealand outlets have cooperation agreements with party-state-owned media organisations including *Xinhua News Service*,¹⁵¹ *China News Service*,¹⁵² the *People's Daily Overseas Edition's Haiwai Net*,¹⁵³ *China Radio International*,¹⁵⁴ *Xinmin Evening News* (新民晚报)¹⁵⁵ and *Wen Wei Po* (文匯報).¹⁵⁶

<https://www.wgtn.ac.nz/chinaresearchcentre/publications/china-papers/Talking-past-each-other-Coverage-of-New-Zealand-China-Relations-in-New-Zealand-and-Chinese-Media.pdf>.

¹⁵⁰ *US China Press* is the website of the *China Press* (侨报). According to a Hoover Institution report, the *China Press* is ultimately under the control of the Overseas Chinese Affairs Office of the State Council of the PRC (中国国务院侨务办公室). *China's Influence & America's Interests: Promoting Constructive Vigilance*, ed. Larry Diamond and Orville Schell (Hoover Institution Press, Stanford, 2019).

¹⁵¹ Brady, *Magic Weapons: China's Political Influence Activities under Xi Jinping*. "About Us 关于我们 (New Zealand Messenger)."

¹⁵² "Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union 世界华文媒体合作联盟," Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, <https://www.gcmcu.com/>.

¹⁵³ "Overseas Chinese-Language Media Meet in Chengdu to Aggregate Technology, Share Content, and Realise Enhanced Integration 海外华媒蓉城相会 聚合技术共享内容实现融合升级," *Chinese Herald*, 11/9/2017, <https://web.archive.org/web/20230315184209/https://www.chineseherald.co.nz/news/international/haiwainet-summit-in-chengdu-2017/>; "People's Daily Overseas Edition Agrees Strategic Cooperation with Five Overseas Chinese-Language Media Outlets, Including the Greek Reporter 人民日报海外版与《希华时讯》等五家海外华媒达成战略合作," *Greek Reporter*, 30/5/2018, <https://china.greekreporter.com/2018/05/30/人民日报海外版与《希华时讯》等五家海外华媒达成战略合作/>.

¹⁵⁴ "FM90.6 Radio Chinese," FM90.6 Radio Chinese, 2021, <https://fm906.co.nz/English.html>.

¹⁵⁵ "About Us 关于我们 (New Zealand Messenger)."

¹⁵⁶ Ibid. *Wen Wei Po* is Hong Kong-based.

New Zealand outlets are particularly well represented as members of the Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union (GCMCU, 世界华文媒体合作联盟), a grouping established by *China News Service*, to facilitate cooperation between mainland PRC and overseas Chinese-language media organisations.¹⁵⁷ As GCMCU members, outlets have access to a 'resource sharing platform' (资源共享平台) where they can upload their own articles and download, without cost, content provided by *China News Service* and other members.¹⁵⁸ Active New Zealand media outlets listed as members of the GCMCU include *Skykiwi*,¹⁵⁹ the *Chinese Herald*,¹⁶⁰ *Home Voice*,¹⁶¹ the *New Zealand Messenger*,¹⁶² *Asia-Pacific Times*,¹⁶³ *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper*,¹⁶⁴ *South Island Chinese Newspaper*,¹⁶⁵ *TV 28*,¹⁶⁶ *Radio Chinese*,¹⁶⁷ *AM936*,¹⁶⁸ *FM 90.6*,¹⁶⁹ the *Mandarin Pages*,¹⁷⁰ and *Palmary*.¹⁷¹

¹⁵⁷ "The Global Chinese-Language Media Cooperation Union Has Been Established; Its Members Come from around the World 世界华文媒体合作联盟成立 成员遍布五大洲," *China News Service*, 20/9/2009, <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/hr/news/2009/09-20/1875705.shtml>.

¹⁵⁸ "About the Union 关于联盟," Chinese Global Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://web.archive.org/web/20201031223831/http://topic.gcmcu.com/gylm/>; Joske et al., *The Influence Environment: A Survey of Chinese-Language Media in Australia*.

¹⁵⁹ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*Skykiwi* 新西兰天维网)," Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717707475134193664.html>.

¹⁶⁰ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*Chinese Herald* 新西兰中文先驱报)," Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706511966806016.html>.

¹⁶¹ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*Home Voice* 乡音)," Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706122945110016.html>.

¹⁶² "Union Members 联盟成员 (*New Zealand Messenger* 新西兰信报)," Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706560683646976.html>.

¹⁶³ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*Asia-Pacific Times* 中新时报)," Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706251919958016.html>.

¹⁶⁴ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper* 怀卡托周报)," Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706427657101312.html>.

¹⁶⁵ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*South Island Chinese Newspaper* 华新时报)," Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706360250441728.html>.

¹⁶⁶ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*Freeview* 28 and 29)," Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717707275791507456.html>.

¹⁶⁷ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*Radio Chinese* 新西兰中文广播电台)," n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717707141716385792.html>.

¹⁶⁸ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*Chinese Voice* 华人之声广播电台)," Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717707193843195904.html>.

¹⁶⁹ "Union Members 联盟成员 (NZC Media Group 新中传媒集团)," Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717707080387272704.html>. In the membership listing, *FM90.6* is broadly referred to as a radio station owned by NZC Media Group, however, its present ownership is unclear and it may no longer be considered a member.

¹⁷⁰ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*Mandarin Pages* 华页)," Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d.

¹⁷¹ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*Palmary* 精彩)," n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706738962538496.html>.

It should be noted that some New Zealand outlets that are listed as members on the GCMCU website are no longer in operation and others have had recent changes in ownership, raising the possibility that some active outlets that are listed as members may no longer be involved with the GCMCU.

Many Chinese-language outlets also participate in events hosted by the PRC party-state and affiliated organisations that may influence the content and narratives that they promote (and exclude). New Zealand outlets regularly send representatives to forums for ‘overseas Chinese-language media’ (海外华文媒体) held in the PRC. The forums, intended to promote cooperation and integration between PRC media and Chinese-language media that serve the Chinese diaspora, include discussions and talks by representatives of the PRC party-state and its media on the party-state’s external propaganda objectives, the launch of cooperation initiatives and tools, sightseeing, and networking opportunities.¹⁷² Hosts of forums that have been attended by New Zealand outlets include *China News Service*,¹⁷³ the Overseas Chinese Affairs Office of the State Council (国务院侨务办公室),¹⁷⁴ the Overseas Chinese Affairs Office of the People’s Government of Guangdong Province (广东省人民政府侨务办公室),¹⁷⁵ the overseas edition of the *People’s Daily*, and the Chinese Communist Party’s Sichuan Provincial Party Committee’s Foreign Propaganda Office (中共四川省委外宣办).¹⁷⁶

Of all forums, the *China News Service*-hosted Global Chinese-Language Media Forum (世界华文传媒论坛) has received possibly the broadest engagement from New Zealand outlets. Held biennially from 2001 until 2019 and the disruption of the Covid-19 pandemic, the forum is hosted jointly by the Overseas Chinese Affairs Office of the State Council, *China News Service* and the local government of the hosting province or, in the cases of the editions

¹⁷² "Overseas Chinese-Language Media Meet in Chengdu to Aggregate Technology, Share Content, and Realise Enhanced Integration 海外华媒蓉城相会 聚合技术共享内容实现融合升级."; "Through Ten Editions, the Global Chinese-Language Media Forum Has Deployed Diligence, Effort and Passion to Provide a Quality Offering 世界华文传媒论坛走过十届 用心用力用情铸造精品," 14/10/2019, <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/hr/2019/10-14/8978174.shtml>; "Overseas and Domestic Media Discuss Telling the Guangdong Story Well and Taking the Path of Media Integration and Development 海内外媒体热议讲好广东故事 走媒体融合发展之路," Overseas Chinese Affairs Office of the People’s Government of Guangdong, 2017, https://web.archive.org/web/20190415133242/http://www.qb.gd.gov.cn/news2010/201706/t20170613_845924.htm.

¹⁷³ "Guest List for the Tenth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第十届世界华文传媒论坛境外嘉宾人员名单," *China News Network*, 10/10/2019, <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/hr/2019/10-10/8975035.shtml>; "Through Ten Editions, the Global Chinese-Language Media Forum Has Deployed Diligence, Effort and Passion to Provide a Quality Offering 世界华文传媒论坛走过十届 用心用力用情铸造精品."

¹⁷⁴ "Through Ten Editions, the Global Chinese-Language Media Forum Has Deployed Diligence, Effort and Passion to Provide a Quality Offering 世界华文传媒论坛走过十届 用心用力用情铸造精品."

¹⁷⁵ "Overseas and Domestic Media Discuss Telling the Guangdong Story Well and Taking the Path of Media Integration and Development 海内外媒体热议讲好广东故事 走媒体融合发展之路."

¹⁷⁶ "Overseas Chinese-Language Media Meet in Chengdu to Aggregate Technology, Share Content, and Realise Enhanced Integration 海外华媒蓉城相会 聚合技术共享内容实现融合升级."; David Soh, "The Second Overseas Chinese-Language New Media Forum Opens in Chengdu; Telling the China Story Well, Realising the China Dream and the World’s Dream 第二届海外华文新媒体高峰论坛在成都开幕 讲好中国故事 实现中国梦 实现世界梦" *Sohu*, 6/9/2017 2017, https://www.sohu.com/a/190094491_99908641.

held in Shanghai and Chongqing, the municipal government.¹⁷⁷ The forums include talks promoting the informational goals of the PRC party-state and cooperation between *China News Service* and Chinese-language media from outside of the PRC. At least 27 New Zealand-based outlets have been listed as forum participants or guests.¹⁷⁸

Similarly, New Zealand media outlets have also taken part in training seminars for Chinese-language media. The most prominent, the Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-language Media (海外华文媒体高级研修班), has been held most years since 2006, sometimes more than once per year. Its hosts have included the Overseas Chinese Affairs Office of the State Council, *China News Service* and various educational institutions. The seminars, which also involve field trips, feature discussions and lectures from party-state representatives aimed at equipping Chinese-language media outlets to ‘tell China’s story well’ (讲好中国故事).¹⁷⁹ The Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-language Media

¹⁷⁷ "Through Ten Editions, the Global Chinese-Language Media Forum Has Deployed Diligence, Effort and Passion to Provide a Quality Offering 世界华文传媒论坛走过十届 用心用力用情铸造精品."

¹⁷⁸ These include *Skykiwi*, the *Chinese Herald*, *Home Voice*, the *New Zealand Messenger*, the *United Chinese Press*, *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper*, *New Zealand South Island Chinese Newspaper*, the *Chinese Express* (中文一族), the *Chinese Press* (侨闻时报), the *New Zealand Chinese Times* (新民侨报), *New Zealand Mirror* (新西兰镜报), *Oriental Times* (东方时报), the *New Life* (新生活报) the *Sun Paper* (太阳报), *Mandarin Pages*, *New Zealand China News Agency* (新西兰中华新闻通讯社), *Chinesetown*, *World TV*, *Chinese New Zealand Television* (新西兰 TV33 华人电视台), *Oceania TV*, and *Radio Chinese*. "Directory of Overseas Representatives and Scholars for the Second Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第二届世界华文传媒论坛 境外代表及学者名录," *Sina*, 2003/09/05, <https://web.archive.org/web/20200629051342/https://tech.sina.com.cn/me/2003-09-05/1334229799.shtml>; "List of Overseas Media Representatives for the "Third Global Chinese Language Media Forum" "第三届世界华文传媒论坛" 境外媒体代表名单," *China News* n.d., https://web.archive.org/web/20200629051135/http://www.chinanews.com/focus_site/hwlt-3/md.htm; "List of Overseas Media Representatives for the "Fourth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum" "第四届世界华文传媒论坛" 境外媒体代表名单," *Xinhua Net*, 27/8/2007, https://web.archive.org/web/20200629043952/http://www.xinhuanet.com/zg/jx/2007-08/29/content_6625789.htm; "Overseas Delegate List for the Fifth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第五届世界华文传媒论坛海外代表名单," *China News*, 28/8/2009, <https://web.archive.org/web/20110522080833/http://www.chinanews.com/hr/news/2009/08-28/1838400.shtml>; "Oceania Attendee List for the Sixth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第六届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单," *China News Network*, 26/8/2011, <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/kong/2011/08-26/3287285.shtml>; "Oceania Attendee List for the Seventh Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第七届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单," *China News Network*, 2/9/2013, <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/zgqj/2013/09-02/5232172.shtml>; "Oceania Attendee List for the Eighth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第八届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单," *China News Network*, 12/08/2015, <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/kong/2015/08-12/7462856.shtml>; "Oceania Attendee List for the Ninth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第九届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单," *China News Network*, 6/9/2017, <http://www.chinanews.com.cn/m/kong/2017/09-06/8324064.shtml>; "Guest List for the Tenth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第十届世界华文传媒论坛境外嘉宾人员名单."

¹⁷⁹ "Chinese-Language Media Gather in Beijing to Promote the Development of the Belt and Road Initiative; the Chinese Herald Was Invited to Attend the Fifteenth Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-Language Media 华媒聚首北京 助力一带一路建设本报应邀参加第十五期海外华文媒体高级研修班," *Chinese*

generally has a smaller number of participants than the forums; active New Zealand outlets that have sent representatives to the seminar include the *Chinese Herald*,¹⁸⁰ *Skykiwi*,¹⁸¹ the *New Zealand Messenger*,¹⁸² and the *Mandarin Pages*.¹⁸³

The affiliations and views of owners and managers of some of New Zealand's Chinese-language outlets may also contribute to the consistency with which their outlets promote pro-PRC discourses and avoid those that contradict them. For example, the owners of at least three media companies are or have been members of the Peaceful Reunification of China Association of New Zealand (新西兰中国和平统一促进会), an organisation subordinate to the United Front Work Department of the Chinese Communist Party Central Committee (中共中央统一战线工作部).¹⁸⁴ Zhu Xi (朱玺), the owner of the *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper*, is a former president of the association and current president of its Waikato branch;¹⁸⁵ Luis Peng (路易斯·彭), co-owner of *Oceania TV* (大洋洲中文电视台), is a

Herald, 6/10/2016, A10, https://web.archive.org/web/20170410093705/http://chnet.co.nz/Html/2016-10-6/News_140364.Html; "Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-Language Media Begins at the Chinese Academy of Governance 海外华文媒体高级研修班在国家行政学院开课," *Sohu*, 16/10/2018, https://www.sohu.com/a/259789043_100008258.

¹⁸⁰ "Chinese-Language Media Gather in Beijing to Promote the Development of the Belt and Road Initiative; the Chinese Herald Was Invited to Attend the Fifteenth Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-Language Media 华媒聚首北京 助力一带一路建设本报应邀参加第十五期海外华文媒体高级研修班."

¹⁸¹ "Telling the China Story Well — "the Sixteenth Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-Language Media" Begins 讲好中国故事 "第十六期海外华文媒体高级研修班" 开班," *Skykiwi*, 16/5/2017, <http://radio.skykiwi.com/report/2017-05-15/241011.shtml>; Xu Yan, "21 Overseas Chinese-Language Media Outlets Embark on Three-Day Visit to Fujian 21 家海外华文媒体展开福建之行 3 天 "走透" 福建," *China Qiaowang*, 18/5/2015.

¹⁸² Xiuxiu Ma, "Chinese-Language Media: Reform and Opening-up Has Changed China, Benefitting Overseas Chinese 华文媒体: 改革开放改变中国 造福海外侨胞," *China Qiaowang*, 18/10/2018, <http://www.chinaqw.com/hwmt/2018/10-18/205403.shtml>; Xin Li, "Focus on Guangdong: Feel the New Charm of Chinese Science and Technology, "Tencent's WeChat" Creates a Cashless Society in China 聚焦广东: 感受中国科技新魅力 "腾讯微信" 造就中国无现金社会," *New Zealand Messenger*, 31/5/2018, <https://www.pressreader.com/new-zealand/nz-messenger-test/20180531/281895888920709>.

¹⁸³ "Chinese-Language Media from 25 Countries Travel to Jilin, Meet Provincial Party Secretary, Sun Zhengcai 二十五国华文媒体吉林行 省委书记孙政才会见," *USA China News*, 6/12/2012, <https://www.usachinanews.com/archives/10068>.

¹⁸⁴ Brady, *Magic Weapons: China's Political Influence Activities under Xi Jinping*; John Dotson, "The United Front Work Department in Action Abroad: A Profile of the Council for the Promotion of the Peaceful Reunification of China," *China Brief* 18, no. 2 (2018), <https://jamestown.org/program/united-front-work-department-action-abroad-profile-council-promotion-peaceful-reunification-china/>.

¹⁸⁵ "Overseas Chinese Communities in New Zealand Passionately Discuss "the Two Sessions" 新西兰侨界热议全国 "两会" ", All-China Federation of Returned Overseas Chinese, 2022, <http://www.chinaql.org/n1/2022/0313/c419650-32373612.html>; "Expatriate Communities in New Zealand Passionately Discuss Two Sessions 新西兰侨社热议全国两会," All-China Federation of Returned Overseas Chinese, updated 6/3/2023, 2023, <http://www.chinaql.org/n1/2023/0306/c419650-32638069.html>; "Expatriate Communities in New Zealand Passionately Discuss "the Two Sessions" and Share Their Thoughts 新西兰侨社热议全国 "两会" 谈感想," *New Times Net*, 6/3/2023, <http://www.newtimesnet.com/static/content/QS/2023-03-06/1082499462444105728.html>.

current member of the association's national council;¹⁸⁶ and Kevin Zeng (曾凯文), the owner of Wellington's *Home Voice*, is a current vice president and former president of the association's Wellington branch.¹⁸⁷ *Home Voice* has published statements from the association.¹⁸⁸ In addition to ties to pro-PRC groups, representatives of other outlets, such as the *Chinese Herald* and *Skykiwi* have also publicly advocated for Chinese-language media to be used to promote pro-PRC discourses.¹⁸⁹

Moreover, the use of WeChat, a platform that is subject to PRC censorship including beyond the PRC's borders,¹⁹⁰ as a key content distribution channel places limits on what New Zealand's Chinese-language outlets can publish through that medium. In addition to this, the WeChat accounts of an overwhelming majority of New Zealand's Chinese-language media are registered to PRC companies,¹⁹¹ potentially placing further constraints on their independence. A smaller number of accounts are registered to individuals, although it is often unclear who those individuals are.¹⁹²

The practice of registering WeChat accounts that serve Chinese diaspora to companies or individuals in the PRC is not unique to New Zealand's Chinese-language media.¹⁹³ It allows outlets to publish through subscription accounts (订阅号), an account type that can only be registered to mainland PRC citizens and organisations and can reach audiences with up to

¹⁸⁶ "Peaceful Reunification of China Association of New Zealand General Meeting/Ninth End-of-Term Election Meeting a Great Success 新西兰中国和平统一促进会会员大会/第九届换届选举大会圆满成功," *Chinese Headline New Media*, 27/1/2023, <https://www.52hrtt.com/akl/n/w/info/D1673860895878>.

¹⁸⁷ "Peaceful Reunification of China Association of New Zealand Wellington Branch Joins Together for a New Journey 新西兰惠灵顿统促会团结携手新征程," *Home Voice*, 5/5/2023; "Peaceful Reunification of China Association of New Zealand Wellington Branch Successfully Holds End-of-Term Election 新西兰惠灵顿统促会换届选举圆满举行," China Council for the Promotion of Peaceful National Reunification, 2017, http://www.zhongguotongcuhui.org.cn/hnwtchdt/201702/t20170224_11707963.html.

¹⁸⁸ For an example of this, see China Peaceful Reunification Federation of NZ Inc., "We Strongly Object to United States Speaker of the House Pelosi's Visit to Taiwan 严重抗议美国众议院议长佩洛西窜访台湾," *Home Voice*, 5/8/2022, 5.

¹⁸⁹ "Overseas and Domestic Media Discuss Telling the Guangdong Story Well and Taking the Path of Media Integration and Development 海内外媒体热议讲好广东故事 走媒体融合发展之路.," "Integration Forum: The Transformation and Development of Overseas Chinese-Language Media - Livestream 融合论坛: 海外华文媒体的转型与发展 现场直播," Haiwai Net, 2015.

¹⁹⁰ Wanning Sun and Haiqing Yu, "WeChatting the Australian Election: Mandarin-Speaking Migrants and the Teaching of New Citizenship Practices," *Social Media + Society* 6, no. 1 (2020); Fran Martin, "Iphones and 'African Gangs': Everyday Racism and Ethno-Transnational Media in Melbourne's Chinese Student World," *Ethnic and racial studies* 43, no. 5 (2020), <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2018.1560110>.

¹⁹¹ These include the WeChat accounts of *Skykiwi* (all eight), the *Chinese Herald*, the *New Zealand Messenger*, the *Mandarin Pages*, *HouGarden*, *Yiju New Zealand*, *Go Kiwi*, *Morning New Zealand*, *NZ Mao*, *FM90.6*, *Channel 33* and *Best News Entertainment*.

¹⁹² This is the case for several accounts such as *Home Voice* and the *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper*.

¹⁹³ Yu and Sun, "WeChat Subscription Accounts (WSAs) in Australia: A Political Economy Account of Chinese-Language Digital/Social Media."

one post per day (more frequently than other types of official accounts).¹⁹⁴ However, of all WeChat account types, subscription accounts face the tightest restrictions on what they can publish due to their ability to reach large audiences.¹⁹⁵

The widespread promotion of pro-party-state narratives, and the exclusion of those that contradict them, by local Chinese-language media has led to questions being raised about other means through which media companies may be influenced by the PRC party-state.¹⁹⁶ This has included concerns about ties between PRC diplomatic missions and local Chinese-language media and efforts by the former to coordinate and control what the latter publish.¹⁹⁷ It has been reported that the PRC Embassy in New Zealand has pressured businesses to stop advertising with media outlets, such as the now-defunct *New Times* (新报), that provide critical coverage of the party-state.¹⁹⁸ Engagement with PRC-based representatives of the party-state when they visit New Zealand, such as the 2015 visit to *Skykiwi* by Deputy Head of the Central Propaganda Department, Sun Zhijun (孙志军),¹⁹⁹ have also been cited as evidence of the party-state exerting influence over local media outlets.²⁰⁰

Concerningly, given their general problems with providing balanced journalism, most strikingly exhibited by many outlets' strict adherence to pro-PRC narratives at the exclusion of others, New Zealand's Chinese-language media have little engagement with New Zealand's media regulatory system — a system that is not well equipped to deal with issues related to ethnic media, and particularly non-English-language ethnic media.²⁰¹ Of the many Chinese-language media outlets in New Zealand, *Skykiwi* and Go Global, the owner of *Go*

¹⁹⁴ "Introduction to WeChat Official Service Accounts, Subscription Accounts, Enterprise Accounts and Mini-Programmes 公众平台服务号、订阅号、企业微信以及小程序的相关说明."; "Overseas Account Registration Process for WeChat Official Accounts (MP Platform) 公众平台境外主体帐号注册流程 (Mp 平台)," Tencent, n.d., <https://kf.qq.com/faq/180312zQjeYV180312FNNbmA.html>; Joske et al., *The Influence Environment: A Survey of Chinese-Language Media in Australia*.

One of the few official WeChat accounts registered to a New Zealand company is a service account belonging to EducAsia Media, the owner of *Asia-Pacific Times* and *Waikato Chinese Voices*.

¹⁹⁵ Yu and Sun, "WeChat Subscription Accounts (WSAs) in Australia: A Political Economy Account of Chinese-Language Digital/Social Media."

¹⁹⁶ Brady, *Magic Weapons: China's Political Influence Activities under Xi Jinping*.

¹⁹⁷ Brady, *Magic Weapons: China's Political Influence Activities under Xi Jinping*; Laura Walters, "Who Is Watching NZ's Chinese-Language Media?," *Newsroom*, 30/9/2019, <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/who-is-watching-nzs-chinese-language-media>.

¹⁹⁸ Thomas Coughlan, "Parliamentary Inquiry Hears Evidence of Chinese Political Interference in New Zealand Political System " *Stuff*, 11/7/2020, <https://www.stuff.co.nz/national/300054428/parliamentary-inquiry-hears-evidence-of-chinese-political-interference-in-new-zealand-political-system>.

¹⁹⁹ "Sun Zhijun, Vice Minister of the Central Propaganda Department, and Delegation Visit Skykiwi Headquarters and Offer Guidance 中宣部副部长孙志军一行莅临天维网总部参观指导," *Skykiwi*, 9/9/2015, <http://wap.skykiwi.com/detail/204419.shtml>.

²⁰⁰ Brady, *Magic Weapons: China's Political Influence Activities under Xi Jinping*.

²⁰¹ Walters, "Who Is Watching NZ's Chinese-Language Media?."

Kiwi, are the only Chinese-language outlets that are direct members of the New Zealand Media Council; while the *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper* and Best News Entertainment, owner of *Chinese Voice* and *Love FM* radio stations,²⁰² are members by virtue of their respective memberships of the Community Newspaper Association of New Zealand and the Radio Broadcasters Association.²⁰³

The Media Council seldom receives complaints against Chinese-language outlets. The few complaints made about content published by Chinese-language media and investigated by the Media Council have been lodged by members of the Falun Dafa Association of New Zealand (新西兰法轮大法协会), or the organisation itself, and have been concerned with alleged prejudicial coverage of Falun Gong (法轮功) and its practitioners.²⁰⁴ Additionally, the need to translate the original text into English and then the ruling into the language of the original article also complicates matters and is an area of potential further dispute between complainants and publications.²⁰⁵ Complaints to the Broadcasting Standards Authority and Advertising Standards Authority about content in the Chinese-language media are even rarer than those made to the Media Council.²⁰⁶

²⁰² This applies to the online content of these outlets.

²⁰³ "Membership," New Zealand Media Council, 2023, <https://www.mediacouncil.org.nz/principles/>; "Member Publications," New Zealand Community Newspaper Association, 2023, <https://cna.org.nz/membership/>; "About Us (Radio Broadcasters Association)," Radio Broadcasters Association, 2023, <https://www.rba.co.nz/about-us#full-members>.

Epoch Times has previously been a member of the Media Council by virtue of its membership of the Community Newspaper Association of New Zealand. Hoyle, "Campaign: A Content Analysis of the New Zealand-Based Chinese Language Ethnic Media's Coverage of the 2008, 2011 and 2014 New Zealand General Elections.," New Zealand Media Council, personal communication, 21/3/2019.

²⁰⁴ "Falun Dafa Association of New Zealand Inc against Chinese Times," New Zealand Media Council, 2015, <https://www.mediacouncil.org.nz/rulings/falun-dafa-association-of-new-zealand-inc-against-chinese-times/>; "Yi Liu against *Home Voice*," New Zealand Media Council, 2017, <https://www.mediacouncil.org.nz/rulings/yi-liu-against-home-voice/>; "John Chen against *Waikato Weekly*," New Zealand Media Council, 2017, <https://www.mediacouncil.org.nz/rulings/john-chen-against-waikato-weekly/>.

²⁰⁵ Sam Sachdeva, "Media Council 'Limited' in Handling Foreign Language Media," *Newsroom*, 14/10/2021, <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/media-council-limited-in-handling-foreign-language-media>.

²⁰⁶ For complaints to the Broadcasting Standards Authority see "CK and World TV Ltd - 2014-016," Broadcasting Standards Authority, 2014, <https://www.bsa.govt.nz/decisions/all-decisions/ck-and-world-tv-ltd-2014-016/#searched-for-chinese>; "Wong and World TV Ltd - 2012-031," 2012, <https://www.bsa.govt.nz/decisions/all-decisions/wong-and-world-tv-ltd-2012-031/#searched-for-world+tv>.

Recommendations

New Zealand's Chinese-language media are a profoundly important part of New Zealand's information environment. They are vital tools used by many to negotiate and understand life in New Zealand. The ability of these media to celebrate and connect Chinese communities and provide links to the PRC is of great value and evidence of New Zealand's progress as a multicultural society.

However, local Chinese-language media often fail to meet the standards expected of media operating in liberal democracies. This is most clearly exhibited by a general reluctance, or inability, to give voice to a diverse range of opinions on the PRC, including its relationship with New Zealand. Because the relationship between New Zealand and the PRC is complex, and the target audience of local Chinese-language media has perhaps more invested in that relationship than any other segment of the New Zealand population, these deficiencies are particularly problematic.

To promote a greater understanding of New Zealand's Chinese-language media, enhance their value and improve their quality, this report recommends that the New Zealand government takes the following measures:

- Promote government and public understanding of local Chinese-language media. Funding should be provided for further research into New Zealand's Chinese-language media. This could include research into what content is published and broadcast (and what is excluded); how, and from where, it is sourced; how issues are framed; and how the use of WeChat as a content distribution channel impacts content selection.
- Make Chinese-language outlets more accountable for the content that they publish and broadcast. This could be achieved by ensuring that bodies involved in the regulation of media content, such as the Media Council and the Broadcasting Standards Authority, are better equipped to deal with complaints about non-member outlets and content published in languages other than English.
- Undertake multilingual campaigns to increase awareness of New Zealand's media regulatory system. Emphasis could be placed on the media regulatory system's role in upholding media standards and freedom of expression and what members of the public can do if they think that standards have been breached.
- Facilitate the syndication of New Zealand news that is accurate, balanced and fair. *RNZ's* Chinese-language content could play a role in this. Safeguards should be

implemented to ensure that articles on a wide range of topics are published and that their content is not manipulated.

- Encourage outlets to increase the diversity of the international news sources that they use. Additional sources could include outlets such as the Chinese-language version of the *Australian Broadcasting Corporation* (ABC 中文), *SBS Chinese* (SBS 中文), *BBC News Chinese* (BBC News 中文) and the *New York Times Chinese Edition* (纽约时报中文网).
- Develop measures to increase transparency around media outlet ownership, funding and content sourcing.
- Strengthen efforts to help upskill producers of Chinese-language news. This could include funding in the form of grants or scholarships to provide training for staff of Chinese-language media organisations.
- Ensure that organisations that provide funding to Chinese-language media outlets are aware that many outlets, even if well-resourced, may be unable or unwilling to publish or broadcast content on certain PRC-related topics.
- Government departments and other public bodies should be educated about how to effectively communicate with consumers of Chinese-language media.

References

- "2018 Census Ethnic Group Summaries - Ethnicity, Culture and Identity." edited by Stats NZ, 2020.
<https://www.stats.govt.nz/tools/2018-census-ethnic-group-summaries>.
- "2020 New Zealand General Election 新西兰大选." Skykiwi, 2020,
<http://www.skykiwi.com/election2020/>.
- "About the Union 关于联盟." Chinese Global Cooperation Union, n.d.,
<https://web.archive.org/web/20201031223831/http://topic.gcmcu.com/gylm/>.
- "About Us (Beyond Media)." Beyond Media, <http://bym.co.nz>.
- "About Us (Radio Broadcasters Association)." Radio Broadcasters Association, 2023,
<https://www.rba.co.nz/about-us#full-members>.
- "About Us 关于我们 (Chinese Headline New Media)." Chinese Headline New Media, n.d.,
<https://www.52hrtt.com/global/n/w/more/about-us>.
- "About Us 关于我们 (Chinese Herald)." Chinese Herald, 2020,
<https://www.chineseherald.co.nz/contact/about-us/>.
- "About Us 关于我们 (Educasia Media Limited)." Asia-Pacific Times, n.d.,
<http://www.aptimes.nz/?m=home&c=Lists&a=index&tid=6>.
- "About Us 关于我们 (Home Voice)." Home Voice, 2021,
<http://www.homevoice.co.nz/web/template/common/about.html>.
- "About Us 关于我们 (New Zealand Messenger)." New Zealand Messenger, 2022,
<https://nzmessengers.co.nz/广告服务/>.
- "About Us 关于我们 (Skykiwi)." Skykiwi, n.d., <https://em.skykiwi.com/aboutus.html>.
- "About World TV Ltd 關於中華電視網." World TV, 2009,
https://web.archive.org/web/20160610110809/http://www.wtv.co.nz/eng_about.html.
- "About WTV." World TV Group, n.d.,
<https://web.archive.org/web/20191218034941/http://en.wtv.co.nz/about-wtv/>.
- Account, Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper Official WeChat. WeChat, 2023.
- "ACL Nominees (No.11) Limited - Company Summary." New Zealand Companies Office, 2022,
<https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/5951812>.
- "ACL Nominees (No.11) Limited - Documents." New Zealand Companies Office, 2022,
<https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/5951812/documents>.
- "Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-Language Media Begins at the Chinese Academy of Governance 海外华文媒体高级研修班在国家行政学院开课." *Sohu*, 16/10/2018.
https://www.sohu.com/a/259789043_100008258.
- "Anderson Creagh Lai Limited - Company Summary." New Zealand Companies Office, 2022,
<https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/3765256>.
- "Are You Eligible to Enrol and Vote?" Electoral Commission, n.d., <https://vote.nz/enrolling/get-ready-to-enrol/are-you-eligible-to-enrol-and-vote/?lang=en-NZ>.
- Barker, Fiona, and Kate McMillan. "Factors Influencing the Electoral Participation of Asian Immigrants in New Zealand." *Political Science* 69, no. 2 (2017): 139-60.
- "Beijing Kulesi Cultural Communication Limited 北京酷乐斯文化传播有限公司." Aiqicha, 2023,
https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_27389949881168.
- "Beijing Skykiwi Internet Information Technology Limited 北京纽澳天维网络信息科技有限公司." Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_30748447155172.
- "Beijing Xin Gui International Education Technology Co. Limited 北京馨贵国际教育科技有限公司." Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_79001938192208.
- "Best News Entertainment Limited (6295588) Registered - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Best-News-Entertainment>
- Best News Entertainment Ltd Media Kit*. 2021. "Home Page," Best News Entertainment,
<https://www.bne.co.nz>.
- Boileau, Joanna. *Chinese Market Gardening in Australia and New Zealand Gardens of Prosperity*. Palgrave Studies in the History of Science and Technology. 1st ed. 2017. ed. Cham, Switzerland: Springer International Publishing, 2017. doi:10.1007/978-3-319-51871-8.

- Brady, Anne-Marie. "China in Xi's "New Era": New Zealand and the CCP's "Magic Weapons"." *Journal of Democracy* 29, no. 2 (2018): 68-75.
- . "Magic Weapons and Foreign Interference in New Zealand: How It Started, How It's Going." (2021).
- . *Magic Weapons: China's Political Influence Activities under Xi Jinping*. (The Wilson Center, 2017). <https://www.wilsoncenter.org/article/magic-weapons-chinas-political-influence-activities-under-xi-jinping>.
- "CH Nominees Limited - Documents." New Zealand Companies Office, 2022, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/5956170/documents>.
- "CH Nominees Limited (5956170) Registered - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/5956170/shareholdings>.
- "Channel 33." Freeview, n.d., <https://freeviewnz.tv/channel/70>.
- "Channel 33 (New Zealand) (Channel33 电视台(新西兰))." 2023, <https://www.youtube.com/@CHANNEL33NewZealand/featured>.
- "Channel 33 Programme Schedule." Channel 33 WeChat Account (gh_7f6e9307e477), 2023.
- "Channel 33 TV Station (New Zealand) Channel 33 电视台(新西兰)." YouTube, 2023, <https://www.youtube.com/@CHANNEL33NewZealand/videos>.
- China's Influence & America's Interests: Promoting Constructive Vigilance*. Edited by Larry Diamond and Orville Schell. Hoover Institution Press, Stanford, 2019.
- "Chinese Business Club and Channel 33 Sign Strategic Cooperation Agreement 华商俱乐部与 Channel 33 签署战略合作协议." New Zealand Chinese Business Club, <https://nzcbc.org/华商俱乐部与channel-33-签署战略合作协议/>.
- "Chinese Herald Digital Limited (6088963) Registered - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Chinese-Herald-Shareholding>.
- "Chinese Herald Investments Limited - Documents." New Zealand Companies Office, 2022, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/6034347/documents>.
- "Chinese Herald Investments Limited (6034347) Registered - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/6034347/shareholdings>.
- "Chinese Herald Limited." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Chinese-Herald-LTD>.
- Chinese Herald Media Kit*. 2022.
- "Chinese Herald 先驱报." *Chinese Herald*, 30/9/2021, C12. http://www.chnet.co.nz/Html/2021-9-30/News_198565.Html.
- "Chinese New Zealand Herald Limited - Particulars of Shareholding." New Zealand Companies Office, 2019, <https://tinyurl.com/3hhxwutu>.
- "Chinese-Language Media from 25 Countries Travel to Jilin, Meet Provincial Party Secretary, Sun Zhengcai 二十五国华文媒体吉林行 省委书记孙政才会见." *USA China News*, 6/12/2012. <https://www.usachinanews.com/archives/10068>.
- "Chinese-Language Media Gather in Beijing to Promote the Development of the Belt and Road Initiative; the Chinese Herald Was Invited to Attend the Fifteenth Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-Language Media 华媒聚首北京 助力一带一路建设本报应邀参加第十五期海外华文媒体高级研修班." *Chinese Herald*, 6/10/2016. https://web.archive.org/web/20170410093705/http://chnet.co.nz/Html/2016-10-6/News_140364.Html.
- "Chinese.net.nz 新西兰中文网." HH Link, n.d., <https://www.hhlink.com/link/www.chinese.net.nz/新西兰中文网>.
- "To Welcome Li Keqiang, the New Zealand Prime Minister Has Set up a WeChat Official Account 为了欢迎李克强, 新西兰总理开了个微信公众号." *Global Times*, <https://world.huanqiu.com/article/9CaKrNk1Aol>.
- "CK and World TV Ltd - 2014-016." Broadcasting Standards Authority, 2014, <https://www.bsa.govt.nz/decisions/all-decisions/ck-and-world-tv-ltd-2014-016/#searched-for-chinese>.
- "Company Introduction 企业介绍." Mango TV, n.d., <http://corp.mgtv.com>.

"Consultant Holding Limited (8303075) Registered - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/8303075/shareholdings>.

Cooke, Henry, and Laura Walters. "Chinese Version of NZ Herald Edited Translated Stories to Be More China-Friendly." *Stuff*, 2019. <https://www.stuff.co.nz/national/politics/109908932/chinese-version-of-nz-herald-edited-translated-stories-to-be-more-chinafriendly>.

Corlett, Eva. "New Zealand Woman Takes Chinese Media Site to Human Rights Tribunal over Ban." *The Guardian*, 2/12/2022. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2022/dec/03/new-zealand-woman-takes-chinese-media-site-to-human-rights-tribunal-over-ban>.

Coughlan, Thomas. "Parliamentary Inquiry Hears Evidence of Chinese Political Interference in New Zealand Political System" *Stuff*, 11/7/2020. <https://www.stuff.co.nz/national/300054428/parliamentary-inquiry-hears-evidence-of-chinese-political-interference-in-new-zealand-political-system>.

Coughlan, Thomas, and Laura Walters. "Chinese NZ Herald Retracts Misleading Article." *Newsroom*, 2019. <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/2019/06/17/636037/chinese-nz-herald-retracts-misleading-article>.

"Covid-19 Wage Subsidies - Employer Search." Work and Income, 2023, <https://services.workandincome.govt.nz/eps/search>.

"Developing Online Media Control." *China Media Project*, 3/5/2022. <https://chinamediaproject.org/2022/05/03/developing-online-media-control/>.

"Directory of Overseas Representatives and Scholars for the Second Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第二届世界华文传媒论坛 境外代表及学者名录." *Sina*, 2003/09/05. <https://web.archive.org/web/20200629051342/https://tech.sina.com.cn/me/2003-09-05/1334229799.shtml>.

Dotson, John. "The United Front Work Department in Action Abroad: A Profile of the Council for the Promotion of the Peaceful Reunification of China." *China Brief* 18, no. 2 (2018). <https://jamestown.org/program/united-front-work-department-action-abroad-profile-council-promotion-peaceful-reunification-china/>.

"Dunedin Chinese Culture Show." 2023, <https://oar.org.nz/dunedin-chinese-culture-show/>.

"Educasia Media Limited - Company Summary." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Educasia-Media-Limited-Summary>.

"Educasia Media Limited (5610625) Registered - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/mryb38ms>.

"Ei Asia Limited 吾行大象文化艺术有限公司." Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_29329123571964.

"Expatriate Communities in New Zealand Passionately Discuss “the Two Sessions” and Share Their Thoughts 新西兰侨社热议全国“两会”谈感想." *New Times Net*, 6/3/2023. <http://www.newtimesnet.com/static/content/QS/2023-03-06/1082499462444105728.html>.

"Expatriate Communities in New Zealand Passionately Discuss Two Sessions 新西兰侨社热议全国两会." All-China Federation of Returned Overseas Chinese, Updated 6/3/2023, 2023, <http://www.chinaql.org/n1/2023/0306/c419650-32638069.html>.

"Falun Dafa Association of New Zealand Inc against Chinese Times." New Zealand Media Council, 2015, <https://www.mediacouncil.org.nz/rulings/falun-dafa-association-of-new-zealand-inc-against-chinese-times/>.

"FM90.6 Radio Chinese." FM90.6 Radio Chinese, 2021, <https://fm906.co.nz/English.html>.

"FM90.6 Radio Chinese FM90.6 纽西兰中文广播电台." n.d., <https://fm906.co.nz/Chinese.html>.

"Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union 世界华文媒体合作联盟." Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, <https://www.gcmcu.com/>.

"The Global Chinese-Language Media Cooperation Union Has Been Established; Its Members Come from around the World 世界华文媒体合作联盟成立 成员遍布五大洲." *China News Service*, 20/9/2009. <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/hr/news/2009/09-20/1875705.shtml>.

"Go Global Limited (4644619) Registered - Shareholdings." <https://tinyurl.com/52w7zynw>.

"Go Kiwi 发现新西兰." Bilibili, 2023, <https://space.bilibili.com/690786529/>.

- Goldkorn, Jeremy. "A Bald-Faced Lie from New Zealand's Biggest Chinese Newspaper." *The China Project*, 2019. <https://thechinaproject.com/2019/09/24/a-bald-faced-lie-from-new-zealands-biggest-chinese-newspaper/>.
- "Guest List for the Tenth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第十届世界华文传媒论坛境外嘉宾人员名单." *China News Network*, 10/10/2019. <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/hr/2019/10-10/8975035.shtml>.
- Ho, Elsie, Manying Ip, and Richard Bedford. "Transnational Hong Kong Chinese Families in the 1990s." *New Zealand Journal of Geography* 111, no. 1 (2001): 24-30.
- "Home." Mandarin Pages, <https://www.mpages.biz/>.
- "Home Page." Best News Entertainment, <https://www.bne.co.nz>.
- "Home Voice Limited (1346238) Registered - Company Summary." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Home-VoiceCompany-Summary>
- "Home Voice Limited (1346238) Registered - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Home-Voice-Shareholdings>
- "Homepage 网站首页." Asia-Pacific Times, n.d., <http://www.aptimes.nz>.
- "Homepage 首页." Home Voice, n.d., <http://www.homevoice.co.nz/index.html>.
- "Hootaka - Free FM Programme Schedule." Free FM, 2023, <https://www.freefm.org.nz/Schedule.aspx>.
- Hoyle, Caleb. "Campaign: A Content Analysis of the New Zealand-Based Chinese Language Ethnic Media's Coverage of the 2008, 2011 and 2014 New Zealand General Elections." Victoria University of Wellington, 2020.
- . *Talking Past Each Other: Coverage of New Zealand-China Relations in New Zealand and Chinese Media*. Wellington, New Zealand: New Zealand Contemporary China Research Centre, 2022. <https://www.wgtn.ac.nz/chinaresearchcentre/publications/china-papers/Talking-past-each-other-Coverage-of-New-Zealand-China-Relations-in-New-Zealand-and-Chinese-Media.pdf>.
- Hu, Yaohua. "Overview of the Development of Chinese-Language Media in New Zealand 新西兰华文传媒发展综述." 17/8/2005. <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/news/2005/2005-08-17/26/613065.shtml>.
- "Huadu International Management Group Limited (6343629) Registered - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Register, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/6343629/shareholdings>.
- Huo, Jianqiang. "A Study of Chinese Print Media in New Zealand: History, Culture and Professionalism." Master of Arts, Auckland University, 1999.
- "HWW NZ Limited (5867528) Registered - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/5867528/shareholdings>.
- Inc., China Peaceful Reunification Federation of NZ. "We Strongly Object to United States Speaker of the House Pelosi's Visit to Taiwan 严重抗议美国众议院议长佩洛西窜访台湾." *Home Voice*, 5/8/2022.
- "Integration Forum: The Transformation and Development of Overseas Chinese-Language Media - Livestream 融合论坛：海外华文媒体的转型与发展 现场直播." Haiwai Net, 2015.
- "Introduction to ChinaSo 国搜介绍." n.d., <https://www.chinaso.com/aboutus/home/aboutus.html>.
- "Introduction to WeChat Official Service Accounts, Subscription Accounts, Enterprise Accounts and Mini-Programmes 公众平台服务号、订阅号、企业微信以及小程序的相关说明." Tencent, n.d., <https://kf.qq.com/faq/120911VrYVrA130805byM32u.html>.
- "Introduction to World TV Ltd 新西兰中华电视网(World TV Ltd.)简介." China Radio International Online, 2012, <https://web.archive.org/web/20201114231625/https://news.cri.cn/gb/1321/2012/01/20/1427s3530044.htm>.
- Ip, Manying. "Chinese Immigration to Australia and New Zealand: Government Policies and Race Relations." In *Routledge Handbook of the Chinese Diaspora*, edited by Chee-Beng Tan, 156-75. London, United Kingdom: Taylor & Francis Group, 2012.
- . "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?". In *Media and the Chinese Diaspora*, edited by Wanning Sun, 178-99. Abingdon, United Kingdom: Routledge, 2006.

- . "Chinese New Zealanders: Old Settlers and New Immigrants." In *Immigration and National Identity in New Zealand: One People, Two Peoples, Many Peoples?*, edited by Stuart William Greif, 161-91. Palmerston North, New Zealand: Dunmore Press, 1995.
- . "Seeking the Last Utopia: The Taiwanese in New Zealand." In *Unfolding History, Evolving Identity: The Chinese in New Zealand*, edited by Manying Ip, 185-210. Auckland, New Zealand: Auckland University Press, 2003.
- Irvine, Heather, and Wing Morgan. *Asian Media Use in Aotearoa NZ in 2021: A Qualitative Research Study Focusing on Chinese and Indian New Zealanders*. Irirangi te Motu New Zealand on Air (2021).
- "It's the Chinese Herald's 25th Anniversary! We're Grateful for Your Company on This Journey; Let's Forge Ahead into the Future Together 中文先驱报创刊 25 周年啦! 感恩有您一路相伴, 携手未来砥砺前行! ." *Chinese Herald*, 10/10/2019. <https://www.chineseherald.co.nz/news/new-zealand/chinese-herald-25-anniversary/>.
- "Jingzhou Chinese Herald Cultural Communication Limited 荆州中文先驱文化传播有限公司." Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_30604611391126.
- "John Chen against Waikato Weekly." New Zealand Media Council, 2017, <https://www.mediacouncil.org.nz/rulings/john-chen-against-waikato-weekly/>.
- Joske, Alex, Lin Li, Alexandra Pascoe, and Nathan Attrill. *The Influence Environment: A Survey of Chinese-Language Media in Australia*. Australian Strategic Policy Institute (2020).
- "Journalism Funding." New Zealand on Air, 2023, <https://www.nzonair.govt.nz/funding/journalism-funding/#funding-decisions>.
- Key, John. "Sir John Key: We Need to Craft Our Own View of China, Using Its Past and Potential to Guide Us." *New Zealand Herald*, 31/12/2022. <https://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/sir-john-key-we-need-to-craft-our-own-view-of-china-using-its-past-and-potential-to-guide-us/PSDICCQP3FBR7O56CRWXKLN2S4/>.
- Kilgallon, Steve. "The Message Board Ban Going All the Way to the Human Rights Tribunal." *Stuff*, 2/12/2022. <https://www.stuff.co.nz/national/130481301/the-message-board-ban-going-all-the-way-to-the-human-rights-tribunal>.
- Kuo, Ru. "Everyone at the 'Chinese Herald' Wishes Our Readers a Happy New Year: Happy New Year, May All Your Wishes Be Fulfilled! '新西兰中文先驱传媒'全体同仁向广大读者拜年: 恭贺新禧 万事如意! ." *Chinese Herald*, 5/2/2019. <https://www.chineseherald.co.nz/news/new-zealand/happy-spring-festival-to-all-readers/>.
- "Latest Journalism Funding Round Provides Substantial Commitment to Asian Audiences." New Zealand on Air, 2022, <https://www.nzonair.govt.nz/news/latest-journalism-funding-round-provides-substantial-commitment-to-asian-audiences/>.
- "Leaders from 21 Overseas Chinese-Language Media Outlets Embark on Trip to Fujian 21 位海外华文媒体负责人展开福建之行." *China News*, 18/5/2015. <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/m/hr/2015/05-18/7284080.shtml>.
- Li, Phoebe H. *A Virtual Chinatown: The Diasporic Mediasphere of Chinese Migrants in New Zealand*. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill, 2013.
- Li, Xin. "Focus on Guangdong: Feel the New Charm of Chinese Science and Technology, 'Tencent's WeChat' Creates a Cashless Society in China 聚焦广东: 感受中国科技新魅力'腾讯微信'造就中国无现金社会." *New Zealand Messenger*, 31/5/2018, B9. <https://www.pressreader.com/new-zealand/nz-messenger-test/20180531/281895888920709>.
- "List of Overseas Media Representatives for the 'Fourth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum' '第四届世界华文传媒论坛'境外媒体代表名单." *Xinhua Net*, 27/8/2007. https://web.archive.org/web/20200629043952/http://www.xinhuanet.com/zg/jx/2007-08/29/content_6625789.htm.
- "List of Overseas Media Representatives for the 'Third Global Chinese Language Media Forum' '第三届世界华文传媒论坛'境外媒体代表名单." *China News*, n.d. https://web.archive.org/web/20200629051135/http://www.chinanews.com/focus_site/hwlt-3/md.htm.

- Liu, Liangni Sally. "New Chinese Immigration to New Zealand: Policies, Immigration Patterns, Mobility and Perception." In *Contemporary Chinese Diasporas*, edited by Min Zhou, 233-59. Singapore: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017.
- Liu, Liangni Sally, Robert Didham, Xiaolan Wu, and Zhihan Wang. "The Making of an Ethnoburb: Studying Sub-Ethnicities of the China-Born New Immigrants in Albany, New Zealand." *Integrative Physiological and Behavioral Science* 56, no. 2 (2022): 426-58.
- Liu, Sally Liangni. "Māori Issue Reports in Contemporary Chinese Language Media." In *The Dragon & the Taniwha: Māori & Chinese in New Zealand*, edited by Manying Ip. Auckland, New Zealand: Auckland University Press, 2009.
- . "The Representation of Māori in Local Chinese Language News Media in New Zealand." *Journal of Intercultural Studies* 30, no. 4 (2009): 403-29.
- Ma, Xiuxiu. "Chinese-Language Media: Reform and Opening-up Has Changed China, Benefitting Overseas Chinese 华文媒体：改革开放改变中国 造福海外侨胞." *China Qiaowang*, 18/10/2018. <http://www.chinaqw.com/hwmt/2018/10-18/205403.shtml>.
- Martin, Fran. "iPhones and 'African Gangs': Everyday Racism and Ethno-Transnational Media in Melbourne's Chinese Student World." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 43, no. 5 (2020): 892-910. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2018.1560110>.
- McMillan, Kate, and Fiona Barker. "'Ethnic' Media and Election Campaigns: Chinese and Indian Media in New Zealand's 2017 Election." *Australian Journal of Political Science* 56, no. 2 (2021): 113-31. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10361146.2021.1884644>.
- "Media under Shanghai United Media Group 上海报业集团旗下媒体." Shanghai United Media Group, n.d., <https://www.sumg.com.cn/qxmt/>.
- "Member Publications." New Zealand Community Newspaper Association, 2023, <https://cna.org.nz/membership/>.
- "Membership." New Zealand Media Council, 2023, <https://www.mediacouncil.org.nz/principles/>.
- Middleton, Julie. "Pro-Taiwan Newspaper Takes a Lengthy Breather." *New Zealand Herald*, 11/03/2005. <https://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/pro-taiwan-newspaper-takes-a-lengthy-breather/2YJ5HE75OK3Z7HLZMI2CYT4JRY/>.
- Murphy, Nigel. "Chinese." In *Book and Print in New Zealand: A Guide to Print Culture in Aotearoa*, edited by Penny Griffith, Ross Harvey and Keith Maslen, 271-75. Wellington, New Zealand: Victoria University Press, 1997.
- "National Party Sets up World-First WeChat Official Account 国家党开通官方微信全球第一." *Home Voice*, 19/9/2014, 18.
- "New Zealand Culture & Media Group Limited (7792162) Registered - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/7792162/shareholdings>.
- "New Zealand Messenger." 2023, <https://www.nzmessengers.com>.
- "New Zealand Messenger 2019 Media Kit." New Zealand Messenger, 2019, <https://web.archive.org/web/20220218202132/https://www.nzmessengers.co.nz/广告服务/#1552362370932-17ee091a-00ae>.
- "New Zealand Messenger Digital Editions 信报电子版." 2022, <https://www.nzmessengers.co.nz/信报电子版/>.
- "New Zealand Messengers Limited (1394998) Registered - Company Summary." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/NZ-Messengers-Company-Summary>.
- "New Zealand Messengers Limited (1394998) Registered - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Register, <https://tinyurl.com/NZ-Messengers-Shareholders>.
- "New Zealand Prime Minister John Key Launches Personal WeChat Account to Improve Communication with Chinese Community 新西兰总理约翰·基开通私人微信 加强与华社联络." *China Qiaowang*, 2/9/2016. <http://www.chinaqw.com/hqhr/2016/09-02/101704.shtml>.
- Ng, James. "Chinese." In *Book and Print in New Zealand: A Guide to Print Culture in Aotearoa*, edited by Penny Griffith, Ross Harvey and Keith Maslen, 267-71. Wellington, New Zealand: Victoria University Press, 1997.
- Nippert, Matt. "Police Looked at Letter Claiming Widespread Censorship of Chinese Media in NZ: Anne-Marie Brady." *The New Zealand Herald*, 2019. <https://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/police-looked-at->

- [letter-claiming-widespread-censorship-of-chinese-media-in-nz-anne-marie-brady/2PU45BJLUCDDSCMWLSRLVF5EQI/?c_id=1&objectid=12192360](https://www.nzme.co.nz/news/nzme-and-chinese-herald-end-joint-venture/).
- "Niuhoa (Xiamen) Cultural Communication Limited 纽华(厦门)文化传播有限公司." Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_21939644633306.
- "NZME and Chinese Herald End Joint Venture." NZME, 2019, <https://www.nzme.co.nz/news/nzme-and-chinese-herald-end-joint-venture/>.
- "The Ocean Media Limited - Company Summary." New Zealand Companies Office, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/1596780>.
- "Oceania Attendee List for the Eighth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第八届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单." *China News Network*, 12/08/2015. <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/kong/2015/08-12/7462856.shtml>.
- "Oceania Attendee List for the Ninth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第九届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单." *China News Network*, 6/9/2017. <http://www.chinanews.com.cn/m/kong/2017/09-06/8324064.shtml>.
- "Oceania Attendee List for the Seventh Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第七届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单." *China News Network*, 2/9/2013. <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/zgqj/2013/09-02/5232172.shtml>.
- "Oceania Attendee List for the Sixth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第六届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单." *China News Network*, 26/8/2011. <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/kong/2011/08-26/3287285.shtml>.
- "Our Shows." New Zealand Culture and Media Group, 2022, <https://www.nzcmg.co.nz/our-shows>.
- "Our Story." NZC Media Group, n.d., <https://web.archive.org/web/20210122081105/https://nzcmg.co.nz/home/blog/>.
- "Overseas Account Registration Process for WeChat Official Accounts (MP Platform) 公众平台境外主体帐号注册流程 (Mp 平台)." Tencent, n.d., <https://kf.qq.com/faq/180312zQjeYV180312FNNbmA.html>.
- "Overseas and Domestic Media Discuss Telling the Guangdong Story Well and Taking the Path of Media Integration and Development 海内外媒体热议讲好广东故事 走媒体融合发展之路." Overseas Chinese Affairs Office of the People's Government of Guangdong, 2017, https://web.archive.org/web/20190415133242/http://www.qb.gd.gov.cn/news2010/201706/t20170613_845924.htm.
- "Overseas Bureaus 派驻国(境)外分支机构." *Xinhua News Agency*, N.d. http://www.xinhuanet.com/xhsld/2021-02/09/c_1211019859.htm.
- "Overseas Chinese Communities in New Zealand Passionately Discuss 'the Two Sessions' 新西兰侨界热议全国'两会' " All-China Federation of Returned Overseas Chinese, 2022, <http://www.chinaql.org/n1/2022/0313/c419650-32373612.html>.
- "Overseas Chinese-Language Media Meet in Chengdu to Aggregate Technology, Share Content, and Realise Enhanced Integration 海外华媒蓉城相会 聚合技术共享内容实现融合升级." *Chinese Herald*, 11/9/2017. <https://web.archive.org/web/20230315184209/https://www.chineseherald.co.nz/news/international/haiwainet-summit-in-chengdu-2017/>.
- "Overseas Delegate List for the Fifth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第五届世界华文传媒论坛海外代表名单." *China News*, 28/8/2009. <https://web.archive.org/web/20110522080833/http://www.chinanews.com/hr/news/2009/08-28/1838400.shtml>.
- "Peaceful Reunification of China Association of New Zealand General Meeting/Ninth End-of-Term Election Meeting a Great Success 新西兰中国和平统一促进会会员大会/第九届换届选举大会圆满成功." *Chinese Headline New Media*, 27/1/2023. <https://www.52hrtt.com/akl/n/w/info/D1673860895878>.
- "Peaceful Reunification of China Association of New Zealand Wellington Branch Joins Together for a New Journey 新西兰惠灵顿统促会团结携手新征程." *Home Voice*, 5/5/2023, 9.

- "Peaceful Reunification of China Association of New Zealand Wellington Branch Successfully Holds End-of-Term Election 新西兰惠灵顿统促会换届选举圆满举行." China Council for the Promotion of Peaceful National Reunification, 2017, http://www.zhongguotongcuhui.org.cn/hnwtchdt/201702/t20170224_11707963.html.
- "People's Daily Overseas Edition Agrees Strategic Cooperation with Five Overseas Chinese-Language Media Outlets, Including the Greek Reporter 人民日报海外版与《希华时讯》等五家海外华媒达成战略合作." *Greek Reporter*, 30/5/2018, <https://china.greekreporter.com/2018/05/30/人民日报海外版与《希华时讯》等五家海外华媒达成/>.
- "Press Gallery Membership." New Zealand Parliament, 2022, <https://www.parliament.nz/en/get-involved/information-for-the-press/press-gallery/#X>.
- "Qiaoxiang Guangdong 侨乡广东." *Jianhua Daily*, 15/2/2023, 8, <https://jianhuadaily.com/20230215/188112>.
- "Question No. 5—Broadcasting and Media." New Zealand Parliament, 2021.
- Quinlivan, Mark. "Calls for Social Media Platform Skykiwi to Remove Hateful Comments." *Newshub*, 14/4/2021. <https://www.newshub.co.nz/home/technology/2021/04/calls-for-social-media-platform-skykiwi-to-remove-hateful-comments.html>.
- "Radio Chinese Limited (6254994) Registered - Shareholdings." 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/yckyc822>.
- "The Radio New Zealand Charter." RNZ, 2023, <https://www.rnz.co.nz/about/charter>.
- "RNZ Targets NZ-Asian Audiences." *Asia Media Centre*, 22/3/2023. <https://www.asiamediacentre.org.nz/news/rnz-targets-nz-asian-audiences/>.
- Rudd, Chris. "Political Economy of the Media." In *Politics and the Media*, edited by Geoff Kemp, Babak Bahador, Kate McMillan and Chris Rudd, 38-54. Auckland, New Zealand: Auckland University Press, 2016.
- Sachdeva, Sam. "Media Council 'Limited' in Handling Foreign Language Media." *Newsroom*, 14/10/2021. <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/media-council-limited-in-handling-foreign-language-media>.
- . "RNZ Enters Chinese-Language News Amid Censorship Concerns." *Newsroom*, 28/3/2023. <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/rnz-enters-chinese-language-news-amid-censorship-concerns>.
- "Search Funding Decisions." New Zealand on Air, 2023, https://www.nzonair.govt.nz/search/?search_type=decisions&q=go+global.
- Sedgwick, Charles. "Persistence, Change and Innovation: The Social Organization of the New Zealand Chinese 1866-1976." *Journal of Comparative Family Studies* 16, no. 2 (1985): 205-29.
- . "The Politics of Survival: A Social History of the Chinese in New Zealand." PhD, University of Canterbury, 1982.
- Shan, Jackie. "John Key Writes About Relations with China: New Zealand Should Make Its Own Decisions 约翰·基撰文谈与中国关系：新西兰应该独立做决定." *Skykiwi*, 1/1/2023. <http://news.skykiwi.com/na/zh/2023-01-01/449237.shtml>.
- "Shenzhen Hong Sheng Wealth Investment Management Limited 深圳市弘盛财富投资管理有限公司." Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_38362802859121.
- "Shenzhen Longhua New District Longhua Maiqile Internet Trading Company 深圳市龙华新区龙华麦琪乐网络商行." Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_18580205302448.
- "Sky Media Limited (4274018) Registered - Company Summary." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Sky-Media-Limited-Summary>.
- "Sky Media Limited (4274018) Registered - Shareholding." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Sky-Media-Limited-Shareholding>.
- Skykiwi Media Kit* 2022. 2022.
- "Skykiwi Social Media 天维社交媒体." Skykiwi, 2022, <https://events.skykiwichina.com/socialmedia/>.
- Soh, David. "The Second Overseas Chinese-Language New Media Forum Opens in Chengdu; Telling the China Story Well, Realising the China Dream and the World's Dream 第二届海外华文新媒体高峰论坛在成都开幕 讲好中国故事 实现中国梦 实现世界梦 " *Sohu*, 6/9/2017 2017. https://www.sohu.com/a/190094491_99908641.
- Stoakes, Emanuel, and Sam Sachdeva. "Concern over 'Censorship' Rules of NZ-Chinese News Site." *Newsroom*, 22/9/2021. <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/concern-over-censorship-rules-of-nz-chinese-news-site>.

- "Horse's Mouth: Lili Wang, Chinese Herald." 2018, <https://stoppress.co.nz/news/horses-mouth-lili-wang-chinese-herald>.
- "New Content Partnerships Enable Stuff to Provide Better News for Under-Served Kiwi Communities." 2018, <https://web.archive.org/web/20220518003415/https://advertise.stuff.co.nz/news/new-content-partnerships-enable-stuff-to-provide-better-news-for-under-served-kiwi-communities/>.
- "Sufu Culture Media (Shanghai) Limited 苏弗文化传媒(上海)有限公司." Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_13901382267514.
- Sun, Wanning, and Haiqing Yu. *Digital Transnationalism: Chinese-Language Media in Australia*. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill, 2023.
- . "WeChatting the Australian Election: Mandarin-Speaking Migrants and the Teaching of New Citizenship Practices." *Social Media + Society* 6, no. 1 (2020).
- "Sun Zhijun, Vice Minister of the Central Propaganda Department, and Delegation Visit Skykiwi Headquarters and Offer Guidance 中宣部副部长孙志军一行莅临天维网总部参观指导." *Skykiwi*, 9/9/2015. <http://wap.skykiwi.com/detail/204419.shtml>.
- "Target Advertising Limited - Company Summary." New Zealand Companies Register, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Target-Advertising-Limited>.
- "Te Taupori Hainamana O Tamaki Makaurau - Auckland's Asian Population." Auckland Council, n.d., <https://www.aucklandcouncil.govt.nz/plans-projects-policies-reports-bylaws/our-plans-strategies/auckland-plan/about-the-auckland-plan/Pages/aucklands-asian-population.aspx>.
- "Telling the China Story Well — “the Sixteenth Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-Language Media” Begins 讲好中国故事 “第十六期海外华文媒体高级研修班”开班." *Skykiwi*, 16/5/2017. <http://radio.skykiwi.com/report/2017-05-15/241011.shtml>.
- "Through Ten Editions, the Global Chinese-Language Media Forum Has Deployed Diligence, Effort and Passion to Provide a Quality Offering 世界华文传媒论坛走过十届 用心用力用情铸造精品." 14/10/2019. <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/hr/2019/10-14/8978174.shtml>.
- To, James Jiann Hua. *Qiaowu: Extra-Territorial Policies for the Overseas Chinese Chinese Overseas*. 2014 ed. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill, 2014.
- "TV 28 (Best News Entertainment) 新西兰华人电视台 TV 28 (BNE 佳訊)." YouTube, 2023, <https://www.youtube.com/@BNETV28/featured>.
- "Union Members 联盟成员 (Asia-Pacific Times 中新时报)." Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706251919958016.html>.
- "Union Members 联盟成员 (Chinese Herald 新西兰中文先驱报)." Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706511966806016.html>.
- "Union Members 联盟成员 (Chinese Voice 华人之声广播电台)." Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717707193843195904.html>.
- "Union Members 联盟成员 (Freeview 28 and 29)." Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717707275791507456.html>.
- "Union Members 联盟成员 (Home Voice 乡音)." Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706122945110016.html>.
- "Union Members 联盟成员 (Mandarin Pages 华页)." Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d.
- "Union Members 联盟成员 (New Zealand Messenger 新西兰信报)." Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706560683646976.html>.
- "Union Members 联盟成员 (NZC Media Group 新中传媒集团)." Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717707080387272704.html>.
- "Union Members 联盟成员 (Palmary 精彩)." n.d. <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706738962538496.html>.
- "Union Members 联盟成员 (Radio Chinese 新西兰中文广播电台)." n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717707141716385792.html>.

- "Union Members 联盟成员 (Skykiwi 新西兰天维网)." Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717707475134193664.html>.
- "Union Members 联盟成员 (South Island Chinese Newspaper 华新时报)." Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706360250441728.html>.
- "Union Members 联盟成员 (Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper 怀卡托周报)." Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, n.d., <https://www.gcmcu.com/static/content/LMCY/DYZ/2020-06-03/717706427657101312.html>.
- Utama, Risa. "University Professor Calls for Social Media Users to 'Speak up' against Hate Speech on Chinese Message Board." *Newshub*, 14/2/2020. <https://www.newshub.co.nz/home/new-zealand/2020/02/university-professor-calls-for-social-media-users-to-speak-up-against-hate-speech-on-chinese-message-board.html>.
- Venuto, Damien. "Historical Fraud and Covid Tip NZ's Largest Chinese Language Media Company into Liquidation." *New Zealand Herald*, 25/3/2021. <https://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/historical-fraud-and-covid-tip-nzs-largest-chinese-language-media-company-into-liquidation/7TWR5B6MIO6THKUDP3C2ABACAU/>.
- Voci, Paola. "From Middle Kingdom to Middle Earth and Back: Chinese Media/Mediated Identities in New Zealand." In *Asia in the Making of New Zealand*, edited by Henry Mabley Johnson and Brian Moloughney, 163-84. Auckland: Auckland University Press, 2006.
- "Voice of the Four Seas." Manawātū People's Radio, 2023, <https://mpr.nz/Shows/Details.aspx?PID=dc780b71-db49-40cf-83ba-ffd505620cf0>.
- "Waikato Chinese Voices 怀卡托华人之声." *Asia-Pacific Times*, 3/5/2023. <http://www.aptimes.nz/?m=home&c=Lists&a=index&tid=13>.
- Walters, Laura. "Chinese NZ Herald under Chinese State 'Control' - Experts." *Newsroom*, 2019. <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/chinese-nz-herald-under-supervision-and-control-of-chinese-state>.
- . "Chinese-Language Media Told to Promote Govt Initiatives." *Newsroom*, 2019. <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/2019/06/10/627113/chinese-language-media-told-to-promote-govt-initiatives>.
- . "Who Is Watching NZ's Chinese-Language Media?" *Newsroom*, 30/9/2019. <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/who-is-watching-nzs-chinese-language-media>.
- Wang, Bess, and Tin Chi Wong. "The Landscape of Newspapers in Hong Kong." In *The Evolving Landscape of Media and Communication in Hong Kong*, edited by Yu Huang and Yunya Song, 13-30: City University of Hong Kong Press, 2018.
- Wang, Handong, and Xisong Guo. "An Investigation into the Current State of Chinese-Language Media in New Zealand 新西兰华文媒体现状考察." *Press Outpost*, 2011. <https://www.zz-news.com/com/xinwenqianshao/news/itemid-636772.html>.
- "Welcome to Go Global." 2017, <http://www.goglobal.ltd>.
- "Wong and World TV Ltd - 2012-031." 2012. <https://www.bsa.govt.nz/decisions/all-decisions/wong-and-world-tv-ltd-2012-031/#searched-for-world+tv>.
- "World TV Co-Founder Gary Chang Unfairly Sacked, Awarded \$469k." *The New Zealand Herald*, 11/7/2017. https://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/world-tv-co-founder-gary-chang-unfairly-sacked-awarded-469k/LJGYTHJAOGV2XR3KOCTBG7446A/?c_id=3&objectid=11889565.
- "World TV Limited (936104) in Liquidation - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/936104/shareholdings>.
- "“Jinmen Dialogue” Overseas Chinese-Language Media Online Forum to Take Place “津门论道”海外华文媒体线上论坛将举行." *Haiwai Net*, 2021, <http://news.haiwainet.cn/n/2021/0322/c3541083-32030621.html>.
- Yan, Xu. "21 Overseas Chinese-Language Media Outlets Embark on Three-Day Visit to Fujian 21 家海外华文媒体展开福建之行 3 天“走透”福建." *China Qiaowang*, 18/5/2015.
- Yang, Jian. "See You after the Election! 大选之后见! ." *Home Voice*, 19/9/2014, 18.
- . "See You after the Election! 大选之后见! ." *Chinese Herald*, 13/9/2014, A10. http://www.chnet.co.nz/Html/2014-9-13/Paper_23884.html.
- "Yi Liu against Home Voice." New Zealand Media Council, 2017, <https://www.mediacouncil.org.nz/rulings/yi-liu-against-home-voice/>.

- Yu, Haiqing, and Wanning Sun. "WeChat Subscription Accounts (WSAs) in Australia: A Political Economy Account of Chinese-Language Digital/Social Media." *Media International Australia* 179, no. 1 (2021): 96-112.
- Zhang, Yijia. "WeChat as an Everyday Tactic: Ride-Hailing and Place-Making in Vancouver." In *WeChat and the Chinese Diaspora: Digital Transnationalism in the Era of China's Rise*, edited by Wanning Sun and Haiqing Yu, 19-37. Milton, United Kingdom: Taylor & Francis Group, 2022.
- Zheng, Xiaohong. "Overseas Chinese-Language Media Representatives Report on Sino-Finnish Design Park 海外华文媒体代表采访深圳中芬设计园." 17/5/2015. <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/hr/2015/05-17/7281681.shtml>.
- . "Shenzhen's First Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-Language Media Is Completed 深圳首期海外华媒高级研修班结业." 18/5/2015. <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/hr/2015/05-18/7284657.shtml>.
- "Zhengzhou Zhongxin Nihua Culture Media Limited 郑州中新纽华文化传媒有限公司." Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_34946824087434.
- Zhou, Hanxue. "Structural Characteristics of 'Wanghailou's' Commentary 《望海楼》的评论框架特色." *News World Magazine* 2015. <http://www.zz-news.com/com/xinwenshijie/news/itemid-644398.html>.

Appendix: Notable Active Outlets

Chinese Herald (新西兰中文先驱)

Originally named the *New Zealand Chinese Herald Weekly* (新西兰先驱报中文周刊), the Auckland-based *Chinese Herald* newspaper (新西兰中文先驱报) was founded in 1994 by the publishers of the English-language *New Zealand Herald*, Wilson & Horton.²⁰⁷ It is currently owned by Auckland businesswoman Wang Lili (王立立).²⁰⁸ The *Chinese Herald* is published each Thursday.²⁰⁹ In May 2019, it switched from using traditional Chinese characters to the simplified form. According to the *Chinese Herald*, it has a readership of more than 90,000 and copies of the newspaper can be obtained from more than 120 locations throughout New Zealand.²¹⁰ Full digital copies of the newspaper are also published online.²¹¹

The *Chinese Herald* website (新西兰中文先驱网) was established in 2016 as the *Chinese New Zealand Herald* (新西兰先驱报中文网). It was initially a joint venture between Chinese Herald Investments Limited and New Zealand Media and Entertainment (NZME), the current owner of the *New Zealand Herald*.²¹² Following a period in which the publication was the subject of various controversies in the English-language media, including claims that its operational structure and PRC internet and security permits meant that it was subject to PRC censorship,²¹³ that editorial decisions were being made to show the PRC party-state in a positive light or to avoid issues that may reflect negatively upon it,²¹⁴ and that co-owner Wang Lili had attended the Media Cooperation Forum on Belt and Road (一带一路媒体合作论坛) in 2018,²¹⁵ NZME's shares were sold to Chinese Herald Investments Limited, which

²⁰⁷ Murphy, "Chinese."; Huo, "A Study of Chinese Print Media in New Zealand: History, Culture and Professionalism."

²⁰⁸ "Chinese Herald Limited," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023. <https://tinyurl.com/Chinese-Herald-LTD>

²⁰⁹ In recent years, publication of the *Chinese Herald* become less frequent. In January 2019, it shifted from four issues per week (on Tuesdays, Thursdays, Fridays and Saturdays) to three (Tuesdays, Thursdays and Saturdays). Its present publishing schedule was adopted in April 2020.

²¹⁰ *Chinese Herald Media Kit*.

²¹¹ They are available at <http://www.chnet.co.nz/Html/2022-12-22/Paper.Html>

²¹² 50% of *Chinese Herald* Investments shares were, and still are, owned by Wang Lili, with the remaining 50% held by a nominee shareholder. Who they are held on behalf of is unclear. See "Chinese Herald Investments Limited - Documents." "CH Nominees Limited - Documents."; "ACL Nominees (No.11) Limited - Company Summary." "ACL Nominees (No.11) Limited - Documents."; "Anderson Creagh Lai Limited - Company Summary."

²¹³ Walters, "Chinese NZ Herald under Chinese State 'Control' - Experts." Jeremy Goldkorn, "A Bald-Faced Lie from New Zealand's Biggest Chinese Newspaper," *The China Project* 2019, <https://thechinaproject.com/2019/09/24/a-bald-faced-lie-from-new-zealands-biggest-chinese-newspaper/>.

²¹⁴ Cooke and Walters, "Chinese Version of NZ Herald Edited Translated Stories to Be More China-Friendly."; Coughlan and Walters, "Chinese NZ Herald Retracts Misleading Article."

²¹⁵ Laura Walters, "Chinese-Language Media Told to Promote Govt Initiatives," *Newsroom* 2019, <https://www.newsroom.co.nz/2019/06/10/627113/chinese-language-media-told-to-promote-govt-initiatives>.

then became website's sole shareholder.²¹⁶ At least 50% of Chinese Herald Investments Limited's shares are held by Wang Lili.²¹⁷ The *Chinese Herald* continues to have a content-sharing agreement with NZME.²¹⁸

The *Chinese Herald* website claims to receive visits from more than 200,000 unique users and more than 1 million page views each week.²¹⁹ According to Wang Lili, the website's 'main target group are the people living in New Zealand who speak Mandarin'.²²⁰ By default, content on its website is published using simplified Chinese characters, however, users can also choose to have content displayed in traditional characters.

The *Chinese Herald* publishes content through its WeChat account, which is registered to Jingzhou Chinese Herald Cultural Communication Limited (荆州中文先驱文化传播有限公司), a company registered in Jingzhou, Hubei.²²¹ The *Chinese Herald* also has Weibo (微博), Xiaohongshu (小红书), Twitter, Facebook and Instagram accounts.

Both the *Chinese Herald* newspaper and website publish some original content and make heavy use of translations from New Zealand's English-language media, like the *New Zealand Herald*, *RNZ* and *I News*, when reporting on domestic stories. International news often comes from PRC party-state and party-state-aligned news sources, such as party-state news agency *China News Service* (中国新闻社), semi-official tabloid *Global Times* (环球时报), and New York-based Chinese-language outlet *US China Press* (侨报网). The newspaper also sometimes carries a segment from *Qiaoxiang Guangdong* (侨乡广东), a Guangdong-focused publication sponsored by the Overseas Chinese Affairs Office of the People's Government of Guangdong Province (广东省人民政府侨务办公室).²²²

²¹⁶ "Chinese New Zealand Herald Limited - Particulars of Shareholding," New Zealand Companies Office, 2019, <https://tinyurl.com/3hhxwutu>; "NZME and *Chinese Herald* End Joint Venture," NZME, 2019, <https://www.nzme.co.nz/news/nzme-and-chinese-herald-end-joint-venture/>.

²¹⁷ "Chinese Herald Investments Limited (6034347) Registered - Shareholdings."; "CH Nominees Limited (5956170) Registered - Shareholdings," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/5956170/shareholdings>.

²¹⁸ *Chinese Herald Media Kit*.

²¹⁹ Ibid.

²²⁰ "Horse's Mouth: Lili Wang, *Chinese Herald*," 2018, <https://stoppress.co.nz/news/horses-mouth-lili-wang-chinese-herald>.

²²¹ "Jingzhou Chinese Herald Cultural Communication Limited 荆州中文先驱文化传播有限公司," Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_30604611391126.

²²² Numerous publications that serve the Chinese diaspora around the world carry *Qiaoxiang Guangdong*. In the *Chinese Herald*, and *Home Voice*, which also carries the segment, the masthead no longer contains a statement attributing it to the Overseas Chinese Affairs Office of the People's Government of Guangdong Province. However, in some overseas papers, such as the *Jian Hua Daily* (柬华日报), a Cambodian Chinese-language newspaper, *Qiaoxiang Guangdong* does still carry the statement of attribution. See "Qiaoxiang Guangdong 侨乡广东," *Jianhua Daily*, 15/2/2023, 8, <https://jianhuadaily.com/20230215/188112>.

The *Chinese Herald* is listed as a member of *China News Service's* Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union (世界华文媒体合作联盟).²²³ It has frequently been represented at forums for Chinese-language media in the PRC, for example, personnel from the *Chinese Herald* have been listed as participants or guests at the 2005, 2007, 2009, 2011, 2015, 2017 and 2019 editions of the *China News Service*-hosted Global Chinese-Language Media Forum.²²⁴ At the 2017 Second Overseas Chinese New Media Forum (第二届海外华文新媒体高峰论坛), hosted by the *People's Daily Overseas Edition* (人民日报海外版) and the Chinese Communist Party's Sichuan Provincial Party Committee's Foreign Propaganda Office (中共四川省委外宣办) and sponsored by the *People's Daily Overseas Edition's* *Haiwai Net* (海外网) and the Foreign Propaganda Office of the Chengdu Municipal Committee (中共成都市委外宣办), the *Chinese Herald* signed up to Haiju (海聚平台), a 'content sharing platform for overseas Chinese-language new media' (海外华文新媒体内容共享平台).²²⁵ It has also been represented at the Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-language Media (海外华文媒体高级研修班).²²⁶

Skykiwi (天维网)

Alongside the *Chinese Herald*, *Skykiwi*, which is owned by Ally Tong Zhang (张彤), Song Yuanhui (宋元晖) and Consultant Holding Limited,²²⁷ is also one of New Zealand's most

²²³ "Union Members 联盟成员 (Chinese Herald 新西兰中文先驱报)."

²²⁴ "List of Overseas Media Representatives for the 'Third Global Chinese Language Media Forum' '第三届世界华文传媒论坛' 境外媒体代表名单."; "List of Overseas Media Representatives for the 'Fourth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum' '第四届世界华文传媒论坛' 境外媒体代表名单."; "Overseas Delegate List for the Fifth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第五届世界华文传媒论坛海外代表名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Sixth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第六届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Eighth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第八届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Ninth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第九届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Guest List for the Tenth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第十届世界华文传媒论坛境外嘉宾人员名单."

²²⁵ "Overseas Chinese-Language Media Meet in Chengdu to Aggregate Technology, Share Content, and Realise Enhanced Integration 海外华媒蓉城相会 聚合技术共享内容实现融合升级."

²²⁶ "Chinese-Language Media Gather in Beijing to Promote the Development of the Belt and Road Initiative; the Chinese Herald Was Invited to Attend the Fifteenth Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-Language Media 华媒聚首北京 助力一带一路建设本报应邀参加第十五期海外华文媒体高级研修班."

²²⁷ "Sky Media Limited (4274018) Registered - Shareholding," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Sky-Media-Limited-Shareholding>; "Consultant Holding Limited (8303075) Registered - Shareholdings," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/8303075/shareholdings>. Consultant Holdings Limited is owned by Consultant Trading Trust, Li Yongke and Li Wei.

important Chinese-language media organisations. Its online forum, *Skykiwi Forum* (天维论坛) was launched in 2001. *Skykiwi* claims that the forum has more than 440,000 registered users and hosts more than 12,000 posts per day.²²⁸ Discussions on the forum cover a wide array of topics, from schooling in New Zealand to finding people to play sports with.

Skykiwi's news section (天维新闻) was established in 2005 and is reported by the company to receive more than 128,000 page views per day.²²⁹ It carries a variety of New Zealand and international news. Its New Zealand news is largely made up of translations of articles published by mainstream New Zealand English-language outlets, such as the *New Zealand Herald* and *Stuff*. International news is generally sourced from overseas outlets, including Singaporean Chinese-language outlet *Lianhe Zaobao* (联合早报) and PRC party-state and party-state-owned media organisations such as *China News* (中国新闻网), *China Qiaowang* (中国侨网) and the *Paper* (澎湃新闻).²³⁰

Skykiwi also features sections on immigration, investment, real estate and a section called *Skykiwi Friends* (天维伙伴), which provides a space for individual users and organisations — such as home town associations (同乡会) — student groups and sporting organisations, to upload and link to their own content, and an infrequently used section for publicising events.

Skykiwi has a large social media presence. On WeChat, the social media platform on which it has the largest footprint, it has 8 accounts. These include its flagship *Skykiwi* account,²³¹ which primarily offers general coverage of New Zealand news; and more narrowly targeted accounts, such as *Skykiwi Webizlink* (新西兰微财经),²³² a publisher of economic and finance-focused content (along with some coverage of more general topics); and a consumption-focused account, *Skykiwi GoShopping* (新西兰天维导).²³³

All of *Skykiwi*'s WeChat accounts are registered to PRC-based companies. *Skykiwi Lifestyle* (天维生活), *Skykiwi Go To New Zealand* (走进新西兰), *Skykiwi Go Welly* (发现惠灵顿) and *Skykiwi Go South Island* (发现南岛) are registered to Beijing Kulesi Cultural

²²⁸ *Skykiwi Media Kit 2022*.

²²⁹ *Ibid*.

²³⁰ The *Paper* is owned by party-state-owned Shanghai United Media Group. See "Media under Shanghai United Media Group 上海报业集团旗下媒体," Shanghai United Media Group, n.d., <https://www.sumg.com.cn/qxmt/>.

²³¹ *Skykiwi* claims that its main *Skykiwi* WeChat account has more than 240,000 followers. *Skykiwi Media Kit 2022*.

²³² *Skykiwi* states that *Skykiwi Webizlink* has more than 69,000 followers. *Ibid*.

²³³ Said by *Skykiwi* to have more than 56,000 followers. *Ibid*.

Communication Limited (北京酷乐斯文化传播有限公司), a Beijing registered company.²³⁴ *Skykiwi Go Shopping*, *Skykiwi Webizlink* and the main *Skykiwi* WeChat account are all registered to Beijing Skykiwi Internet Information Technology Limited (北京纽澳天维网络科技有限公司),²³⁵ a Beijing registered company. *SkyInvest* (天维投资) is registered to Shenzhen Hong Sheng Wealth Investment Management Limited (深圳市弘盛财富投资管理有限公司), a company registered in Shenzhen.²³⁶ *Skykiwi* also has accounts on Xiaohongshu, a YouTube channel,²³⁷ and three apps.²³⁸

Skykiwi is one of the few Chinese-language members of the New Zealand Media Council.²³⁹ It is also listed as a member of the Global Chinese Media Cooperation Forum;²⁴⁰ and representatives from *Skykiwi* have been listed as participants or guests at the Global Chinese-language Media Forum in 2009, 2011, 2017 and 2019.²⁴¹ In addition to this, *Skykiwi* has been represented at other forums for Chinese-language media, such as the Jinmen Dialogue (津门论道). Its most recent attendance at the Jinmen Dialogue appears to have been in 2021. That year the forum was held online and hosted by the United Front Work Department of the Municipal Party Committee of Tianjin (天津市委统战部) and *China News Service*.²⁴² *Skykiwi* personnel have also attended the Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-

²³⁴ "Beijing Kulesi Cultural Communication Limited 北京酷乐斯文化传播有限公司," Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_27389949881168.

²³⁵ "Beijing Skykiwi Internet Information Technology Limited 北京纽澳天维网络科技有限公司," Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_30748447155172.

²³⁶ "Shenzhen Hong Sheng Wealth Investment Management Limited 深圳市弘盛财富投资管理有限公司," Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_38362802859121.

²³⁷ See <https://www.youtube.com/@skykiwidotcom>

²³⁸ The three apps are *Skykiwi Mobile* (手机天维), *Skykiwi Forum* (天维论坛) and *Dingdang Trade* (叮当交易).

²³⁹ "Membership."

²⁴⁰ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*Skykiwi* 新西兰天维网)."

²⁴¹ "Overseas Delegate List for the Fifth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第五届世界华文传媒论坛海外代表名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Sixth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第六届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Ninth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第九届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Guest List for the Tenth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第十届世界华文传媒论坛境外嘉宾人员名单."

²⁴² "“Jinmen Dialogue” Overseas Chinese-Language Media Online Forum to Take Place “津门论道” 海外华文媒体线上论坛将举行," *Haiwai Net*, 2021, <http://news.haiwainet.cn/n/2021/0322/c3541083-32030621.html>.

language Media.²⁴³ Between late 2018 and mid-2021, *Skykiwi* had a content-sharing agreement with New Zealand's largest news website, *Stuff*.²⁴⁴

Skykiwi has faced scrutiny for censoring discussions on Chinese politics on its forum and news website;²⁴⁵ its ties to the PRC party-state;²⁴⁶ the possibility that it may share the details of users who violate forum rules with the PRC party-state;²⁴⁷ and for hosting 'xenophobic, homophobic and racist comments' on its forum.²⁴⁸

Mandarin Pages (华页)

Launched in 1991 as *Mandarin Times*, *Mandarin Pages* is majority owned by Auckland businessman David Soh (苏文德).²⁴⁹ It was the first free Chinese-language weekly newspaper in New Zealand.²⁵⁰ Throughout its history, the *Mandarin Times/Pages* has had different publication schedules, including a period as a daily from 2004.²⁵¹ It is currently published each Friday and uses traditional Chinese characters.

The *Mandarin Pages* publishes original writing and translated content from New Zealand's English-language media. It carries news from PRC and international outlets, including the *People's Daily* (人民日报) and *China Times* (中时新闻网), a Taiwanese news outlet. It regularly carries *Wanghailou* (望海楼), a commentary from *People's Daily Overseas*

²⁴³ "Telling the China Story Well — "the Sixteenth Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-Language Media" Begins 讲好中国故事 "第十六期海外华文媒体高级研修班" 开班."; Yan, "21 Overseas Chinese-Language Media Outlets Embark on Three-Day Visit to Fujian 21 家海外华文媒体展开福建之行 3 天 "走透" 福建."; "Leaders from 21 Overseas Chinese-Language Media Outlets Embark on Trip to Fujian 21 位海外华文媒体负责人展开福建之行," *China News*, 18/5/2015, <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/m/hr/2015/05-18/7284080.shtml>.

²⁴⁴ "New Content Partnerships Enable Stuff to Provide Better News for under-Served Kiwi Communities," 2018, <https://web.archive.org/web/20220518003415/https://advertise.stuff.co.nz/news/new-content-partnerships-enable-stuff-to-provide-better-news-for-under-served-kiwi-communities/>; Stuff, 24/2/2023.

²⁴⁵ Eva Corlett, "New Zealand Woman Takes Chinese Media Site to Human Rights Tribunal over Ban," *The Guardian*, 2/12/2022, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2022/dec/03/new-zealand-woman-takes-chinese-media-site-to-human-rights-tribunal-over-ban>; Kilgallon, "The Message Board Ban Going All the Way to the Human Rights Tribunal."; Stoakes and Sachdeva, "Concern over 'Censorship' Rules of NZ-Chinese News Site."

²⁴⁶ Brady, *Magic Weapons: China's Political Influence Activities under Xi Jinping*.

²⁴⁷ Stoakes and Sachdeva, "Concern over 'Censorship' Rules of NZ-Chinese News Site."

²⁴⁸ Risa Utama, "University Professor Calls for Social Media Users to 'Speak up' against Hate Speech on Chinese Message Board," *Newshub*, 14/2/2020, <https://www.newshub.co.nz/home/new-zealand/2020/02/university-professor-calls-for-social-media-users-to-speak-up-against-hate-speech-on-chinese-message-board.html>; Mark Quinlivan, "Calls for Social Media Platform Skykiwi to Remove Hateful Comments," *Newshub*, 14/4/2021, <https://www.newshub.co.nz/home/technology/2021/04/calls-for-social-media-platform-skykiwi-to-remove-hateful-comments.html.s>

²⁴⁹ "Home," *Mandarin Pages*, <https://www.mpages.biz/>; "Target Advertising Limited - Company Summary," New Zealand Companies Register, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Target-Advertising-Limited>; "Home."

²⁵⁰ Ip, "Chinese Media in New Zealand: Transnational Outpost of Unchecked Floodtide?."

²⁵¹ *Ibid.*

Edition. Wanghailou focuses on major PRC issues that attract global attention and the PRC's international relations.²⁵²

Mandarin Pages has been represented in the PRC at forums and seminars for overseas Chinese-language media. These include the Overseas Chinese New Media Forum in 2017; the 2009, 2011, 2013, 2015 and 2017 editions of the Global Chinese-language Media Forum;²⁵³ and the Advanced Seminar for Overseas Chinese-language Media.²⁵⁴ Outlet owner David Soh also reportedly travelled to Taiwan at the expense of the Taiwanese government in 2016.²⁵⁵ *Mandarin Pages* has been accused of withdrawing an article from publication that was critical of a PRC Consul-General.²⁵⁶

The *Mandarin Pages* website contains news and opinion articles and full digital versions of the newspaper. The website also has a forum and other areas for users to engage with one another, although they seem to attract little use. *Mandarin Pages* also distributes content through WeChat, Weibo and Facebook. Its WeChat account is listed as being registered to Shenzhen Longhua New District Longhua Maiqile Internet Trading Company (深圳市龙华新区龙华麦琪乐网络商行), although that company may no longer be operational.²⁵⁷

Asia-Pacific Times (中新时报)

Founded in 2015, the Hamilton-based *Asia-Pacific Times* is owned by businessman Cui Zhishen (崔志坤) through EducAsia Media Limited (中新华媒传播集团).²⁵⁸ It is published each Wednesday, uses simplified characters, and claims to be available in 10 cities and towns around New Zealand, from Auckland in the north to Queenstown in the south.²⁵⁹

²⁵² Hanxue Zhou, "Structural Characteristics of 'Wanghailou's' Commentary 《望海楼》的评论框架特色," *News World Magazine* 2015, <http://www.zz-news.com/com/xinwenshijie/news/itemid-644398.html>.

²⁵³ "Overseas Delegate List for the Fifth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第五届世界华文传媒论坛海外代表名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Sixth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第六届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Seventh Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第七届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Eighth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第八届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Ninth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第九届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."

²⁵⁴ "Chinese-Language Media from 25 Countries Travel to Jilin, Meet Provincial Party Secretary, Sun Zhengcai 二十五国华文媒体吉林行 省委书记孙政才会见."

²⁵⁵ Walters, "Chinese-Language Media Told to Promote Govt Initiatives."

²⁵⁶ Walters, "Who Is Watching NZ's Chinese-Language Media?."

²⁵⁷ "Shenzhen Longhua New District Longhua Maiqile Internet Trading Company 深圳市龙华新区龙华麦琪乐网络商行," Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_18580205302448.

²⁵⁸ "Educasia Media Limited - Company Summary."; "Educasia Media Limited (5610625) Registered - Shareholdings," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/mryb38ms>. "About Us 关于我们 (Educasia Media Limited)."

²⁵⁹ "Homepage 网站首页," *Asia-Pacific Times*, n.d., <http://www.aptimes.nz>.

Asia-Pacific Times publishes little original content. Its New Zealand news is often sourced from other New Zealand Chinese-language media outlets, such as *HouGarden* and *AM936*, which in turn generally translate articles from mainstream English-language outlets, including *Stuff* and *Newshub*. Some New Zealand news also comes from PRC sources like *Global Times*.

For its international news, *Asia-Pacific Times* relies heavily on content from PRC media organisations, such as *China News Service*, *Xinhua News Agency* (新华通讯社) and the *People's Daily Overseas Edition*. Each issue generally features several articles from the PRC Embassy and/or Consulates in New Zealand on their engagements. Full digital copies of the *Asia-Pacific Times* are published on its website and hosted through Yunzhan (云展网), a digital publishing platform.²⁶⁰ *Asia-Pacific Times* is listed as a member of the Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union and carries the union's logo on its homepage.²⁶¹

***Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper* (怀卡托周报)**

Established in 2005, the *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper* is a Hamilton-based newspaper. It is owned by Hamilton businessman Zhu Xi (朱玺)²⁶² and is published each Thursday using traditional Chinese characters. *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper* claims a readership of 8,000-10,000 people.²⁶³ It is a member of the New Zealand Media Council by virtue of its membership of the Community Newspaper Association of New Zealand.²⁶⁴

Much of the newspaper's local content is translated from New Zealand's English-language media, however, it does carry some original content. Other news comes from PRC sources such as *Sina* (新浪) *Global Times*, *China News Service* and the *Yangcheng Evening News* (羊城晚报). The *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper* has a WeChat account through which full copies of the newspaper can be read. Its WeChat account is a personal account and is not registered to a company. The identity of the individual to whom the account is registered is

²⁶⁰ See <http://www.aptimes.nz/?m=home&c=Lists&a=index&tid=13> and <https://book.yunzhan365.com/bookcase/epet/index.html>

²⁶¹ "Union Members 联盟成员 (Asia-Pacific Times 中新时报)."; "Homepage 网站首页."

²⁶² "The Ocean Media Limited - Company Summary," New Zealand Companies Office, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/1596780>.

²⁶³ *Waikato Weekly Chinese Newspaper* Official WeChat Account (Waikato_weekly), WeChat, 2023.

²⁶⁴ "Membership."; "Member Publications."

unclear. The newspaper was represented at the Global Chinese-Language Media Forum in 2011 and 2013.²⁶⁵

Home Voice (乡音)

Home Voice is a Wellington-based newspaper owned by Wellington businessman Kevin Zeng (曾凯文).²⁶⁶ It is published on Fridays using simplified script and claims to have a readership of more than 16,000 people per issue.²⁶⁷ Digital copies of *Home Voice* can be read on its website and digital publishing platform, Issuu.²⁶⁸ In addition to this, *Home Voice* publishes content through its website and has a presence on WeChat, Twitter and Facebook. Its WeChat account is registered to Kevin Zeng.

Home Voice has very limited newsgathering capabilities. In addition to a small amount of original content, its New Zealand news often consists of translations of articles from New Zealand's English-language media, such as *RNZ* and *INews*, and content from other sources like *Xinhua News Agency* and the PRC Embassy in New Zealand.

Its reliance on overseas sources means that *Home Voice* generally features more content on the PRC than New Zealand. Content on the PRC comes from sources such as *Xinhua News Agency*, *China News Service* and the *Paper*. Each issue also carries a full page of Tibet-focused content under the masthead of *Tibet Today* (今日西藏), which is produced under the auspices of the Information Office of the People's Government of the Tibet Autonomous Region (西藏自治区人民政府新闻办公室) and the Tibet Bureau of *China News Service* (中国新闻社西藏分社). In addition to this, *Home Voice* also frequently carries a full page of articles from *Qiaoxiang Guangdong*.

Home Voice is a member of the Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union, and its homepage contains a link to the union's website.²⁶⁹ Representatives from *Home Voice* have attended the

²⁶⁵ "Oceania Attendee List for the Sixth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第六届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Seventh Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第七届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."

²⁶⁶ "Home Voice Limited (1346238) Registered - Shareholdings," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Home-Voice-Shareholdings>. Kevin Zeng is sometimes also called Zeng Aiwen (曾皑文).

²⁶⁷ "About Us 关于我们 (Home Voice)."

²⁶⁸ See <http://www.homevoice.co.nz/newEpaper/> and <https://issuu.com/homevoicenz>.

²⁶⁹ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*Home Voice* 乡音)."; "Homepage 首页," *Home Voice*, n.d., <http://www.homevoice.co.nz/index.html>.

Global Chinese-Language Media Forum in 2007, 2009, 2011, 2013 and 2015.²⁷⁰ The newspaper was also represented at the Shenzhen Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-language Media (深圳市海外华文媒体高级研修班) in 2015. The seminar was hosted by the Shenzhen Overseas Chinese Affairs Office (深圳市侨办), the Shenzhen Federation of Returned Overseas Chinese (深圳市侨联) and the Shenzhen Overseas Chinese Entrepreneurs Research Institute (深圳侨商智库研究).²⁷¹

New Zealand Messenger (新西兰信报)

The New Zealand Messenger is a Christchurch-based newspaper. It is owned by Christchurch businessman Wang Jianping (王建平) through Huadu International Management Group Limited (华都国际管理集团).²⁷² The newspaper is published on Fridays using simplified Chinese characters. It claims to be available at more than 50 locations in Christchurch, have a circulation of 7,000 and an estimated readership of 21,200 people per issue.²⁷³ Digital copies of the *New Zealand Messenger* can be read on its website.²⁷⁴

The *New Zealand Messenger's* local content is a mixture of original work, translations of mainstream media stories from mainstream New Zealand outlets, including *Stuff*, and content from elsewhere, such as PRC state news agency *Xinhua*. It also carries full pages of content from Hong Kong-based, party-state-owned,²⁷⁵ newspapers *Wen Wei Po* (文匯報) and *Ta*

²⁷⁰ "List of Overseas Media Representatives for the 'Fourth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum'" "第四届世界华文传媒论坛"境外媒体代表名单."; "Overseas Delegate List for the Fifth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第五届世界华文传媒论坛海外代表名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Sixth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第六届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Seventh Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第七届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Eighth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第八届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."

²⁷¹ Xiaohong Zheng, "Shenzhen's First Advanced Seminar for the Overseas Chinese-Language Media Is Completed 深圳首期海外华媒高级研修班结业," 18/5/2015, <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/hr/2015/05-18/7284657.shtml>; Xiaohong Zheng, "Overseas Chinese-Language Media Representatives Report on Sino-Finnish Design Park 海外华文媒体代表采访深圳中芬设计园," 17/5/2015, <https://www.chinanews.com.cn/hr/2015/05-17/7281681.shtml>.

²⁷² "New Zealand Messengers Limited (1394998) Registered - Shareholdings," New Zealand Companies Register, <https://tinyurl.com/NZ-Messengers-Shareholders>; "Huadu International Management Group Limited (6343629) Registered - Shareholdings," New Zealand Companies Register, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/6343629/shareholdings>.

²⁷³ "New Zealand Messenger 2019 Media Kit," *New Zealand Messenger*, 2019, <https://web.archive.org/web/20220218202132/https://www.nzmessengers.co.nz/广告服务/#1552362370932-17ee091a-00ae>.

²⁷⁴ "New Zealand Messenger Digital Editions 信报电子版," 2022, <https://www.nzmessengers.co.nz/信报电子版/>.

²⁷⁵ Bess Wang and Tin Chi Wong, "The Landscape of Newspapers in Hong Kong," in *The Evolving Landscape of Media and Communication in Hong Kong*, ed. Yu Huang and Yunya Song (City University of Hong Kong Press, 2018).

Kung Po (大公报) and the Shanghai-based *Xinmin Evening News* (新民晚报), which is owned by the party-state-owned Shanghai United Media Group (上海报业集团).²⁷⁶

The *New Zealand Messenger* is listed as a member of the Global Chinese Media Cooperation Union.²⁷⁷ Representatives of the *New Zealand Messenger* have been listed as participants or guests at all eight editions of the Global Chinese-Language Media Forum held between 2005 and 2019.²⁷⁸ The *New Zealand Messenger* has a sister publication, the bilingual (English and Chinese) general interest magazine *Palmery* (精彩). It also maintains a WeChat account, which is registered to Beijing Xin Gui International Education Technology Co. Limited (北京馨贵国际教育科技有限公司),²⁷⁹ an Android app and an English-language website, *New Zealand Messenger*.²⁸⁰

Channel 33

Founded in 2020, *Channel 33* is owned by Qin Peiyin and Qi Sen through New Zealand Culture and Media Group (新西兰文化传媒集团).²⁸¹ The channel is broadcast on Freeview, a New Zealand free-to-air television platform, to most of New Zealand's major population centres.²⁸² It also posts original content to its YouTube channel, which has more than 90,000 subscribers.²⁸³ *Channel 33* has accounts on WeChat, registered to Zhengzhou Zhongxin Niuhua Culture Media Limited (郑州中新纽华文化传媒有限公司), a company from the

²⁷⁶ "Media under Shanghai United Media Group 上海报业集团旗下媒体."

²⁷⁷ "Union Members 联盟成员 (*New Zealand Messenger* 新西兰信报)."

²⁷⁸ "List of Overseas Media Representatives for the "Third Global Chinese Language Media Forum" "第三届世界华文传媒论坛"境外媒体代表名单."; "List of Overseas Media Representatives for the "Fourth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum" "第四届世界华文传媒论坛"境外媒体代表名单."; "Overseas Delegate List for the Fifth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第五届世界华文传媒论坛海外代表名单.";

"Oceania Attendee List for the Sixth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第六届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Seventh Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第七届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Eighth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第八届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Ninth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第九届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Guest List for the Tenth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第十届世界华文传媒论坛境外嘉宾人员名单."

²⁷⁹ "Beijing Xin Gui International Education Technology Co. Limited 北京馨贵国际教育科技有限公司," Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_79001938192208.

²⁸⁰ "New Zealand Messenger," 2023, <https://www.nzmessengers.com>.

²⁸¹ "New Zealand Culture & Media Group Limited (7792162) Registered - Shareholdings," New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://app.companiesoffice.govt.nz/companies/app/ui/pages/companies/7792162/shareholdings>.

²⁸² "Channel 33," Freeview, n.d., <https://freeviewnz.tv/channel/70>.

²⁸³ "Channel 33 TV Station (New Zealand) Channel 33 电视台(新西兰)," YouTube, 2023, <https://www.youtube.com/@CHANNEL33NewZealand/videos>.

Zhengzhou section of the Henan Pilot Free Trade Zone (河南自贸试验区郑州片区);²⁸⁴ Bilibili (哔哩哔哩弹幕网); Instagram; and Facebook.

Channel 33 broadcasts several original shows, including *News Headline 33* (33 视界观), a news programme, and *Little Angel's Family* (小天使家族), a programme for children.²⁸⁵

Channel 33 has an agreement with the New Zealand Chinese Business Club (新西兰华商俱乐部), which was founded by former National Party MP Yang Jian (杨健), to produce a show, *Channel 33 Tales – Stories of Chinese Businesspeople* (33 风云录-华商故事), about the professional lives of members of the club.²⁸⁶

The majority of the content broadcast on *Channel 33*, according to the schedule published on its WeChat account,²⁸⁷ is imported from the PRC. A significant amount of this, particularly news and current affairs, comes from the Hong Kong-based, partly party-state-owned television station *Phoenix TV* (鳳凰衛視).²⁸⁸ A daily news show from *China Central Television* (中国中央电视台), *China News* (中国新闻网), is also broadcast on the channel.²⁸⁹

TV 28

TV 28 is owned by Best News Entertainment (BNE; 新西兰佳讯全媒体集团), which acquired the assets of *World TV* (中华电视网), including TV 28, both before and following the latter's liquidation in 2021.²⁹⁰ Taiwanese businesswoman Fu-Nu Tsai (蔡富女), the largest shareholder in *World TV*, is the majority shareholder in BNE.²⁹¹

²⁸⁴ "Zhengzhou Zhongxin Niuhua Culture Media Limited 郑州中新纽华文化传媒有限公司," Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_34946824087434.

²⁸⁵ "Our Shows," New Zealand Culture and Media Group, 2022, <https://www.nzcmg.co.nz/our-shows>.

²⁸⁶ "Chinese Business Club and Channel 33 Sign Strategic Cooperation Agreement 华商俱乐部与 Channel 33 签署战略合作协议," New Zealand Chinese Business Club, <https://nzcbc.org/华商俱乐部与 channel-33-签署战略合作协议/>.

²⁸⁷ "Channel 33 Programme Schedule," Channel 33 WeChat Account (gh_7f6e9307e477), 2023.

²⁸⁸ "Developing Online Media Control," *China Media Project*, 3/5/2022, <https://chinamediaproject.org/2022/05/03/developing-online-media-control/>; "Channel 33 Programme Schedule."

²⁸⁹ "Channel 33 Programme Schedule."

²⁹⁰ Venuto, "Historical Fraud and Covid Tip NZ's Largest Chinese Language Media Company into Liquidation."; "Home Page."

²⁹¹ Venuto, "Historical Fraud and Covid Tip NZ's Largest Chinese Language Media Company into Liquidation."; "World TV Limited (936104) in Liquidation - Shareholdings."; "Best News Entertainment Limited (6295588) Registered - Shareholdings." New Zealand Companies Office, 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/Best-News-Entertainment>

TV 28 carries a mixture of original shows, such as the language learning show, *Speak English Happily* (快乐说英语), video streams of BNE's radio shows like the *I Love New Zealand* (我爱纽西兰) news show,²⁹² and content from overseas. PRC television station *Zhejiang Television's* international channel (浙江电视台国际频道) provides a significant amount of TV 28's programming. Some content also comes from Hunan Broadcasting System-owned (湖南广播电视台) *Mango TV* (芒果TV).²⁹³ TV 28 broadcasts several shows from Taiwan, including health-related programmes *Stay Happy*, *Stay Healthy* (别让身体不开心) and *Healthy Life* (健康好生活). It also has a YouTube channel with more than 180,000 subscribers.²⁹⁴ TV 28 was represented at the 2011, 2013 and 2015 editions of the Global Chinese-Language Media Forum.²⁹⁵

Chinese Voice (华人之声广播电台)

Chinese Voice is BNE's news and current affairs radio station. It is broadcast 24 hours a day, 7 days a week, across the greater Auckland region.²⁹⁶ BNE states that the station targets the majority of New Zealand's Mandarin-speaking audience and has an average live audience of 32,000 listeners each day.²⁹⁷ *Chinese Voice* also streams from the *936 News Net* website, which can also be accessed through BNE's *936 News Net* WeChat account. The WeChat account is registered to Nihua (Xiamen) Cultural Communication Limited (纽华(厦门)文化传播有限公司), a Xiamen-registered company.²⁹⁸ BNE is a member of the New Zealand Media Council through its membership of the Radio Broadcasters Association.²⁹⁹

Love FM (新西兰交通音乐广播)

Love FM, also part of the BNE stable, broadcasts on FM99.4 and is also owned by Best News Entertainment. BNE claims that the station has an average of 32,000 daily listeners. Its

²⁹² *I Love New Zealand* is also broadcast on *Chinese Voice* and TV 28's YouTube account. .

²⁹³ "Company Introduction 企业介绍," Mango TV, n.d., <http://corp.mgtv.com>.

²⁹⁴ "TV 28 (Best News Entertainment) 新西兰华人电视台 TV 28 (BNE 佳訊)."

²⁹⁵ "Oceania Attendee List for the Sixth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第六届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Seventh Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第七届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Eighth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第八届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."

²⁹⁶ *Best News Entertainment Ltd Media Kit*.

²⁹⁷ Ibid.

²⁹⁸ "Nihua (Xiamen) Cultural Communication Limited 纽华(厦门)文化传播有限公司," Aiqicha, 2023, https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_21939644633306.

²⁹⁹ "Membership."

offerings include music and entertainment-oriented talk shows.³⁰⁰ *Love FM* also streams from the *936 News Net* website and *936 News Net* WeChat account.³⁰¹

Radio Chinese (新西兰中文广播电台)³⁰²

Founded in 2011, *Radio Chinese* is an Auckland radio station that broadcasts 24 hours a day, 7 days a week, in Mandarin.³⁰³ It was formerly owned by Stella Hu (胡杨) and Chen Fu (however, their company, Radio Chinese Limited, is currently in the process of being removed from the New Zealand Companies Register)³⁰⁴ and presented as part of a stable of media outlets under NZC Media Group (新中传媒).³⁰⁵ Its current ownership is unclear.

Radio Chinese broadcasts both original content and programming from PRC party-state-run international radio broadcaster, *China Radio International* (中国国际广播电台).³⁰⁶ It is broadcast on FM90.6 and can reach an audience outside of Auckland through broadcasts on its website and WeChat account. The *Radio Chinese* WeChat account is registered to Beijing-based company Ei Asia Limited (吾行大象文化艺术有限公司).³⁰⁷ Personnel from *Radio Chinese* attended the Global Chinese-Language Media Forum in 2013 and 2017.³⁰⁸

Go Kiwi (发现新西兰)

Go Kiwi is a digital content outlet owned by Phillip Teng Huan (腾欢) and Lilian Cai Ying (蔡颖) through Go Global Limited.³⁰⁹ *Go Kiwi* publishes content through a variety of channels including its official WeChat account, which is registered to Shanghai-based company Sufu Culture and Media (Shanghai) Limited (苏弗文化传媒(上海)有限公司);³¹⁰ NetEase's (网易) 163.com portal; and Sina.com. It also has a presence on YouTube, Bilibili

³⁰⁰ *Best News Entertainment Ltd Media Kit*.

³⁰¹ <https://www.nz936.com/index.php?s=radio>

³⁰² Sometimes also written as 纽西兰中文广播电台.

³⁰³ "FM90.6 Radio Chinese FM90.6 纽西兰中文广播电台," n.d., <https://fm906.co.nz/Chinese.html>.

³⁰⁴ "Radio Chinese Limited (6254994) Registered - Shareholdings," 2023, <https://tinyurl.com/yckyc822>

³⁰⁵ The other outlets, *Panda TV* (熊猫电视台), *Chinese Times* (中文时代) and *Kiwi Style*, are no longer active.

"Our Story," NZC Media Group, n.d.,

<https://web.archive.org/web/20210122081105/https://nzcmedia.co.nz/home/blog/>.

³⁰⁶ "FM90.6 Radio Chinese."

³⁰⁷ "Ei Asia Limited 吾行大象文化艺术有限公司," Aiqicha, 2023,

https://aiqicha.baidu.com/company_detail_29329123571964.

³⁰⁸ "Oceania Attendee List for the Seventh Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第七届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."; "Oceania Attendee List for the Ninth Global Chinese-Language Media Forum 第九届世界华文传媒论坛大洋洲参会名单."

³⁰⁹ "Go Global Limited (4644619) Registered - Shareholdings."

³¹⁰ "Sufu Culture Media (Shanghai) Limited 苏弗文化传媒(上海)有限公司."

and Weibo, although the latter account, which has more than 480,000 followers, has been idle since January 2020.³¹¹

Go Kiwi publishes stories on New Zealand-related topics, including domestic politics, economic issues, crime, and immigration, and other topics relevant to Chinese New Zealanders, such as China's Covid restrictions. It publishes a mixture of original work, translations from New Zealand's mainstream media, and some overseas-sourced content.

In 2022, Go Global Limited was awarded \$137,280 from the New Zealand on Air-administered Public Interest Journalism Fund for the training of two cadet journalists to "increase the quality and quantity of trusted news content for Chinese audiences".³¹² Go Global is a member of the New Zealand Media Council.³¹³

³¹¹ "Go Kiwi 发现新西兰," Bilibili, 2023, <https://space.bilibili.com/690786529/>; "Go Kiwi 发现新西兰."; "Go Kiwi 发现新西兰."

³¹² "Search Funding Decisions."; "Journalism Funding."

³¹³ "Membership."

About the Author

Caleb Hoyle is a Visiting Fellow at the New Zealand Contemporary China Research Centre. He holds degrees from Victoria University of Wellington (Chinese Studies and Political Science) and Peking University (Management). Caleb has been awarded several scholarships and prizes, including the New Zealand Prime Minister's Scholarship for Asia, the Freyberg Scholarship, and the Sir Desmond Todd Memorial Prize.

About the Centre

The New Zealand Contemporary China Research Centre promotes knowledge and understanding of contemporary China in New Zealand through research, collaboration, and engagement. Based at Te Herenga Waka—Victoria University of Wellington, the China Centre partners with eight New Zealand universities to support research and courses on the political, economic, and social life of China today.



New Zealand Contemporary China Research Centre

KŌMARU KURA

Te Herenga Waka—Victoria University of Wellington

PO Box 600 Wellington, 6140 NEW ZEALAND

+64-4-463 5760

chinacentre@vuw.ac.nz

www.wgtn.ac.nz/chinaresearchcentre



New Zealand
Contemporary China
Research Centre
KŌMARU KURA