



COUNCIL

**Minutes of the Council Meeting held on Monday, 26 September 2016
from 1.00 pm to 5.00 pm in the Hunter Council Chamber, Level 2, Hunter Building,
Kelburn Campus**

- PRESENT:**
- Sir Neville Jordan (Chancellor)
 - Ms Robyn Bargh
 - Professor Maryanne Garry
 - Mr Jonathan Gee
 - Professor Grant Guilford (Vice-Chancellor)
 - Ms Jacinta Gulasekharam
 - Ms Traci Houpapa
 - Associate Professor Kate Hunter
 - Mr Neil Paviour-Smith (Pro-Chancellor)
 - Dr Farib Sos
 - Mr Roger Taylor
 - Dame Therese Walsh
 - Ms Caroline Ward (Secretary to Council)
- APOLOGY:**
- Professor Guilford (from 3 pm)
- IN ATTENDANCE:**
- Professor Frazer Allan, Deputy Vice-Chancellor, Engagement
 - Ms Jenny Bentley, Director Campus Services
 - Ms Katherine Edmond, Associate Director, Communications and Marketing
 - Ms Stephanie Hunter, Manager, Student Finance, Student Academic Services
 - Ms Kerri Kilner, Executive Assistant to Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Engagement)
 - Mr Simon Johnson, General Counsel
 - Professor Wendy Lerner, Provost
 - Ms Vaelyn Luo, Vice-President, VUWSA International Students Association
 - Mr Rory Lenihan-Ikin, VUWSA President-elect
 - Mr Mark Loveard, Chief Operating Officer
 - Mr Jim Mercer, Deputy Chief Financial Officer
 - Ms Madeleine Setchell, Director Communications & Marketing
 - Mr Deon Teo, President, VUWSA International Students Association
 - Ms Pam Thorburn, Director, Student Academic Services
 - Professor Jennifer Windsor, PVC/Dean Humanities & Social Sciences, PVC Education

16.192

CHANCELLOR WELCOME / APOLOGIES

- Noted:**
- 1 that the Chancellor welcomed everyone to the meeting.
 - 2 that Mr Rory Lenihan-Ikin was congratulated on his election to 2017 VUWSA President in the recent VUWSA elections.
 - 3 that the achievements of Victoria student Olympians Emma Robinson (who swam in the 800 metre heats at the Summer Games at Rio) and Liam Malone (who won silver in the 100m T44 and gold medals in the 200m T44 and

400m T44, achieving Paralympic records in the process) were acknowledged and congratulations extended by Council.
4 that due to overseas travel Professor Guilford will leave the meeting early and Professor Larnar will act as Vice-Chancellor from 3 pm.

Resolved: that the apology from Professor Guilford for early departure be sustained.

Houpapa/Gee
Carried
160159

16.193 DECLARATIONS AND DISCLOSURES OF INTERESTS

Noted: that the following disclosure of interest by a member of Council, by way of a general notice under the Education Act 1989 Section 175 and the Local Authorities (Members Interests) Act 1968 was received:

- that Mr Roger Taylor will not participate in any discussion relating to Item 18 regarding the New Zealand School of Music and will absent himself in the event of any vote due to his conflict arising as Chair of the NZSO Audit and Risk Committee.

16.194 MINUTES OF THE COUNCIL MEETING HELD ON 29 AUGUST 2016

Received: the Minutes of the Meeting of Council held on 29 August 2016.

Resolved: that the Minutes of the Meeting of Council held on 29 August 2016 be approved.

Paviour-Smith/Houpapa
Carried
160160

16.195 MATTERS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 29 AUGUST 2016

Noted: that there were no Matters Arising from the public Minutes of the Meeting held on 29 August 2016.

16.196 2017 DOMESTIC TUITION FEES

Received: a Council Paper from the Chief Financial Officer dated 14 September 2016 regarding 2017 Domestic Tuition Fees (document VUWC 16/113).

Noted: 1 that the Finance Committee considered the 2017 Domestic Tuition Fees paper in detail at its meeting held on Monday, 12 September 2016.
2 that there was a well-attended VUWSA-hosted Student Fees Forum held on 19 September providing an opportunity for students to interact in an open forum with the Chancellor, the Vice-Chancellor and senior management.

- 3 that oral submissions were received from:
- Mr Jonathan Gee, President, Victoria University of Wellington (VUWSA) *transcript attached as Appendix 1*
 - Ms Jacinta Gulasekharam, Academic Vice-President, VUWSA
 - Ms Vaelyn Luo, Vice-President, VUWSA International Students Association, *transcript attached as Appendix 2*
 - Mr Deon Teo, President, VUWSA International Students Association.
- 4 that the Chancellor and the Vice-Chancellor acknowledged the points made in the above submissions. It was noted that the Finance Committee has asked management to look into International Fee setting.
- 5 that the Chancellor confirmed that in 2017 in addition to the fee setting forum there would be an additional forum held earlier in the year providing students with an opportunity to interact with Council.
- Action*
- 6 that key points from the submissions be carried forward for consideration in the Council's 2017 work plan.

Resolved:

that on the recommendation of the Finance Committee:

- 1 **that Domestic (Government funded) tuition fees for all undergraduate and postgraduate subject areas be increased by 2% for 2017 be approved.**
Garry/Taylor
Carried
160161
Against: Gee/Gulasekharam
- 2 **that the 2017 Student Services Levy be set at \$730.50 for full time study, an increase of approximately 1.7% as recommended by the Advisory Committee on the Student Services Levy (ACCSL) be approved.**
Garry/Taylor
Carried
160162
- 3 **that the proposed 2017 Student Fee Statute, with updates and changes as set out in Appendix 4, be approved.**
Garry/Taylor
Carried
160163

16.197

FINANCIAL REPORT TO 31 AUGUST 2016

Received:

the Financial Report to 31 August 2016 (document VUWC 16/114).

Noted:

that the YTD University Group Surplus (excluding the Foundation) of \$11m was \$7.6m above budget.

Resolved:

that the Financial report to 31 August 2016 be noted and approved.

Houpapa/Walsh
Carried
160164

16.198 GRADUATES IN ABSENTIA – DEGREES TO BE GRANTED

Received: the list of degrees, diplomas and certificates granted on 26 September 2016 (document VUWC 16/115).

- Resolved:**
- 1 that Council grants the degrees, diplomas and certificates in this University on those persons listed in document VUWC 16/115, and that their names be entered on the Roll of Graduates on 26 September 2016.
 - 2 that a motion of congratulations to the Graduates in Absentia be recorded.

Gulasekharam/Gee
Carried
160165

16.199 CREDIT TRANSFER STATUTE

Received: a Council paper from the Provost and the Acting Vice-Provost (Academic and Equity) dated 14 September 2016 regarding the repeal of the Credit Transfer Statute (document VUWC 16/116).

Noted: that the Academic Board approved a new Credit Transfer and Recognition of Prior Learning Policy at its August meeting. Associated with this the Board also approved the repeal of the existing Recognition of Informal Prior Learning Policy and endorsed for forwarding to Council, a proposal to repeal the Credit Transfer Statute.

Resolved: that the repeal of the Credit Transfer Statute be approved.

Hunter/Houpapa
Carried
160166

16.200 REPORT FROM THE CHANCELLOR

Received: an oral report from the Chancellor.

- Noted:**
- 1 that since the last Council meeting on 29 August 2016 the Chancellor:
 - chaired the E2E Committee
 - travelled to Jakarta for a ceremony as new Chair of the NZ Indonesia Council
 - attended a meeting regarding the 2017 Audit Plan
 - hosted an event to celebrate the opening of the Ian McKinnon Atrium at Rutherford House
 - attended the Finance Committee
 - joined Members of the Senior Leadership Team and the WREDA Board for a luncheon
 - was Guest Speaker at a Wellington Club event – topic: “Footprint of Victoria University and Quo Vadis”
 - held Meetings with individual Council members
 - met with the Vice-Chancellor and Secretary to Council to review the Council agenda
 - attended a private meeting with Dr Agus Hermanto, Deputy Speaker of Indonesian Parliament about ASEAN opportunities.

Action:

- 2 that the Secretary to Council will circulate the presentation made by the Chancellor at the Wellington Club event as detailed above.

Resolved: that the Chancellor's report be noted.

Paviour-Smith/Walsh
Carried
160167

16.201 REPORT FROM THE VICE-CHANCELLOR

Received: a report from the Vice-Chancellor dated 20 September 2016 (document VUWC 16/117).

Noted: 1 that the report from the Vice-Chancellor was taken as read and the following points highlighted:

- VicLink officially launched the Easy Access IP Programme which will allow local industry to more easily commercialise the University's innovations
- a large number of research grants have been received
- a significant jump up the 2016 Academic Ranking of World Universities placing Victoria in the top 2% of the World's 16,000 universities
- Victoria's Maori Students' Association hosted 300 students from across the country at this year's annual Te Huinga Tauria o Te Mana Akonga (Maori Students Conference). Two Victoria students were elected as co-presidents at this conference
- the first PhD thesis written entirely in Te Reo Maori was received.
- funding was awarded by the National Science Challenge, Science for Technological Innovation contestable fund for a Victoria project on magnetic silver clusters, a disruptive technology in bio imaging worth \$255,000 over three years.

Resolved: that the Vice-Chancellor's report be noted.

Walsh/Sos
Carried
160168

16.202 REPORTS FROM COMMITTEE CHAIRS

Received: Reports from Committee Chairs from the meeting held as follows:

- Finance Committee, 12 September 2016

Resolved: that the reports from Committee Chairs be noted.

Bargh/Gulasekharam
Carried
160169

16.203 FORTHCOMING EVENTS AND NEXT MEETING

Received: a Council Paper from the Secretary to Council dated 20 September 2016 listing Forthcoming Events (document VUWC 16/118).

Noted: that the next meeting of Council will take place on Monday 31 October 2016 starting at 12.30 pm with a light lunch in the Hunter Common Room.

Resolved: that the Council Paper on Forthcoming Events and the date and details of the next Council meeting on Monday, 31 October 2016 be noted.

Houpapa/Paviour-Smith
Carried
160170

16.204

RESOLUTION CONCERNING THE EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

Received: a recommendation that certain items be taken with the public excluded (document VUWC 16/119).

Resolved: that the public be excluded from the meeting for the discussion of items 14-27 for the reasons and duration outlined in the recommendation, with the exception of such members of the Management Team as the Chancellor and the Vice-Chancellor may request to remain for the public excluded part of the agenda as they have knowledge relevant to particular issues to be discussed.

Houpapa/Gulasekharam
Carried
160171

Appendix 1

September Council Meeting - Domestic Fees for 2017

Jonathan Gee

Thank you, Chancellor.

I remember sitting up in the public gallery last year during the Council meeting on fee-setting. I watched on knowing that in 2016, I would be sitting at the table myself, deciding on what the University should do with fees.

I recall the discussion revolved around the unsustainable funding model for tertiary education prescribed by Government. It revolved around Council members agreeing that they were concerned about student debt and hardship, but the model left them no choice but to raise fees to maintain the TEC-imposed surplus, and to keep the status quo going.

Teaching Quality

A number of student members before me have stressed that there is a need for an increase in teaching quality if tuition fees are to rise. Arguments that we've heard in response to this have been that Victoria already has excellent teaching quality, and that teaching quality is a key measure in the Strategic Plan under the primary strategy of a holistic learning, teaching and student experience that is second to none. But when the measure of teaching quality is what percentage of students rate their teachers good or very good, students can't help but feel a little dissatisfied. From the students I talk to, while they generally agree that teaching quality at Vic is very good, they also agree that there are very visible pockets of not-so-good teaching, which colours their overall perception of teaching quality at Vic.

In a survey that VUWSA has conducted, asking students if they noticed an increase in academic quality each year, only 4% agreed. 38% disagreed.

Students are looking for value for money, and clear increases in quality when their student debt increases. In the same survey, we asked students if fees were going to rise, how they would expect their academic experience to be improved. The top answer, with 26% was a greater range of papers offered. The second top answer, with 23%, was more contact time with lecturers and tutors.

Victoria has the highest number of students per academic staff member compared to every other New Zealand University. We need to talk about how students can have more positive and valuable interactions with our community of world-class scholars.

We need to start having more genuine conversations with students about how we can improve their student experience. We can't just measure teaching quality based on a feedback form students complete at the end of their course. By having more genuine conversations with students, students are more likely to feel valued and in turn, are more likely to recommend Victoria to their siblings and friends. A valued student community are more likely to be active advocates for Victoria.

Equity groups

A fee increase will also have an adverse effect on students from backgrounds of disadvantage. The Tertiary Education Strategy states as a priority the need to boost achievement of Maori and Pasifika. That is very hard to come by when they are increasingly price-sensitive and debt-averse, and therefore dissuaded from attending university in the first place due to high tuition fees. In a time when we are trying to reach the 'missing 1000' Maori students, a fee increase does not seem wise at all.

There are also issues of retention when these students do enter university. We already know that mental health and wellbeing is at crisis-point for tertiary students. A recent study from the University of Auckland states that Pacific students are more likely to have even poorer mental health than their New Zealand European counterparts. While student wellbeing is being worked on via the Student Services Levy through a focus on student counselling and the wellbeing campaign, that is simply a band-aid over the real problem - fees and increases in fees.

There are also equity issues around international students, and I support a fee cap for international student fees.

Students as Partners

My last point is that I strongly believe that we need to see students as partners in decisions that affect them. As with my comments around our measure for teaching quality, students want the university to talk to them more, and to bring them along with the University as partners in decision-making. Some headway has been made on this, through the annual student fees forum with the Chancellor and Vice-Chancellor. But that is not enough. Students have consistently pushed for a similar model to the Advisory Committee for the Student Services Levy for fees, where students are at the table and afforded financial oversight over Levy-funded services. In fact, one of the proposed amendments in the Government's Tertiary Education and Other Matters Bill, is to improve reporting around this Levy so it does not just sit in the Annual Report, and to get tertiary institutions to share their practices for consultation. I'm heartened by some preliminary conversations around an advisory panel made up of students for fees, but before I hear the detail I cannot support this year's fee increase.

In the VUWSA survey, we asked if students agreed with the statement, 'if the University were more transparent in the way it sets fees, I would be more comfortable when they do rise.' 54% agreed or strongly agreed with this statement. So there is light at the end of the tunnel. By valuing students as partners in deciding on fees, we become an institution which students love, and want to become active advocates for. I attended a conference around students as partner at the University of Technology Sydney a few weeks ago. That University values students as partners in enhancing the quality of their institution, and they have risen 79 places in the recent QS rankings. Perhaps, if Victoria did too, we would also see some a significant rise in international ranking.

Students want to be more involved in the setting of fees. They want to see teaching quality increase as a result of increased fees, and that can't just be measured by whether we generally have good and very good teachers. We need to start a genuine conversation with students about how their fees are set and where they'd like them to go. It's about valuing students as partners, and being open to changing what we have always done. Until that happens, I cannot support an increase in fees.

Appendix 2

September Council Meeting – International Student Fees Vaelyn Luo

Kia Ora Members of the University Council, Senior Leadership Team and staff,
Thank you for giving us the opportunity to present the international students' perspective on the Fees Agenda 2018. My name is Vaelyn and I am speaking on behalf of all international students in the capacity of my role as the Research & Campaign Vice President of VUWSA International Students' Association (V-ISA).

We are a young and growing organisation with more than 300 active members. We have accomplished several achievements this year, some of which include proposals made to the Pathway Review Panel in Trimester 1 to enhance the Foundation Studies Programme. We consistently strike a balance between what is ideal and what is feasible. We believe in working with the University to provide the best support for international students.

In August 2016, V-ISA has carried out extensive consultations with international students on fees hike, the inaccessibility and unavailability of scholarships. We have received 100 survey responses from undergraduates, EPP students and postgraduates. We propose 2 recommendations for the University: to put a cap on fees for international students and to make scholarships available and accessible for all international students.

We accept that fees have to increase year on year due to overhead costs, inflation and upgrading. However, what we cannot accept is the fact that fees hike for international students are much higher than domestic students. There is no basis for such a disparity in increment; international students do not consume more resources than domestic students for every course they take. International students are already paying approximately 5 times more than domestic students and yet our fees increase 4-5% on average (in numerical sums) per year.

Fees hike has a tremendous detrimental impact on students. Our survey has revealed that not only international students are not coping well financially, they are also suffering psychological stress due to a lack in financial support. Over 90% of the students who want to gain employment are struggling to find one. Over 50% of students say that financial constraints have severely affected their well-being. An overwhelming 60% say that their parents

are willing to compromise on their savings to support them. It would also be interesting to note that a sizeable number of students have taken bank loans from their home country to study here.

The University has stated that the best it can do is to be transparent and help potential students to foresee their expenditure. However, what students know is only the lump-sum fee they have to pay for the first year, not the unfair increment of fees they need to pay year on year. Moreover, not all students can predict their future circumstances. Some students who have approached us revealed that they are on the verge of dropping out because of family tragedies back home or that their bank loans are denied. There are little measures put in place to support them. A European student who wishes to remain anonymous stated that, "it is also important to consider that international students cannot get a student loan in New Zealand. I am struggling financially and am scared that I cannot finish my studies here at Vic."

The other argument was that higher fees reflect better quality of education. In terms of overall teaching quality, Victoria University is the only New Zealand University that has not seen a rise in its QS World Ranking this year (2016). This may not be the best indicator around but it is the most direct and the most accessible indicator for students. In terms of scholarships, forget about the big figure of 20 million pumped into this area. There is only one scholarship (International Student Achievement Award) provided by the University that is exclusively available for international students without discriminating their age, nationality, level of study and field of study. The rest are either offered by foreign charities or the New Zealand government; of which many have restrictions based on nationality and level of study. 71% of international students have cited intense competition for scholarships with domestic students.

V-ISA is also disappointed that the University has withdrawn the "International Undergraduate Fees Scholarship" discreetly this year. We also want to point out that there is a disproportionate number of scholarships provided to students who are entering their first year in Victoria. However, the irony is that Victoria recruits a huge portion of international students through "twinning" programmes (degree-partnership with foreign universities); many of whom have already completed their first year of university in their home country. They are not eligible for any scholarships, based on merit or otherwise.

93% of international students have shown strong support for a tuition fee waiver scholarship. They want a percentage cut on their tuition fees based on academic achievements and financial needs. This will be more reflective of the costs international students are paying. Lump-sum awards simply do not account for the increase in costs that international students have to pay. V-ISA urge the University not to view scholarships as a recruitment tool, but an incentive to motivate students and help them to achieve their fullest potential.

If all of what I have said has failed to persuade you, let me tell you a story of my friend, who I will address as X. X is second-year student with straight-As but struggles with 3 part-time jobs. Her father passed away and her loan from the bank was denied this year. She applied for scholarships but was denied without an interview. Her only financial remedy was the hardship and equity grant of \$1200, a sum that cannot be compared to the \$30,000 that she has paid at the start of the year.

Tell me that there is something wrong with how Victoria supports its international students. Tell me that there is something ought to be done to fix this problem.

V-ISA would like to emphasize the importance of taking international students' views into account when making decisions that matter to their lives. International students are not merely consumers and university education is not merely a commodity. It is difficult to empathise with the position of every international student, but as long as an effort is made to engage us sincerely, Victoria can raise above the standards. Victoria should set the standards of quality education, not a taker of standards.